Settlement Begins Historic Reformation of Public Defense
The Eyes of the Nation Are On New York

On the eve of one of the largest trials in the NYCLU’s history, New York State agreed to a historic settlement that overhauls public defense in five counties and lays the foundation for statewide reform of New York’s broken public defense system. The lawsuit settled a case filed seven years ago by the NYCLU and the law firm of Schulte Roth & Zabel LLP. By entering into the agreement, the state took responsibility for providing public defense for the first time in the more than 50 years since the Supreme Court held that it is a state obligation.

“This agreement is a victory for equal justice more than 50 years in the making,” said NYCLU Executive Director Donna Lieberman. “For the first time, New York State is acknowledging its constitutional responsibility to provide lawyers to poor defendants who have been forced to navigate the criminal justice system undefended and alone. With New York’s public defense system in the national spotlight, the state has entered this agreement and shown it will no longer stand by while innocent people lose their families, homes and jobs because they’re too poor to hire private lawyers. More than 50 years after the Supreme Court called the right to public defense an ‘obvious truth,’ our

New York Steps Away from Unlawfully Jailing Immigrants

Thanks to advocacy by the NYCLU, at least 40 counties across the state have agreed to stop the unconstitutional practice of imprisoning people without a warrant just so federal agencies can investigate them for immigration purposes. And in New York City, the government has taken the lead in a national movement in this area by passing legislation that not only ends the warrantless detention of immigrant New Yorkers for immigration purposes, but also evicts Immigration and Customs Enforcement from its office at Rikers Island and prohibits the Department of Corrections from expending resources to enforce civil immigration laws.

“Due process is the fundamental right of every New Yorker. No one should ever be imprisoned unless there is a warrant for his arrest or a judge has reviewed his case,” said Executive Director Donna Lieberman. “The steps taken by counties across the state and here in New York City are crucial in ensuring that all people are protected and served by law enforcement.”

In July, the New York State Sheriffs’ Association, citing specific recommendations by the NYCLU, advised all sheriffs across the state to cease the practice of honoring federal government requests that they jail people who have been arrested after they would have otherwise been released.

Continued on page 7

Clockwise from left, the faces behind the NYCLU’s case: Donnell Stepney, Donald Telfair, Jackie Winbrane, Richard Love, Ray Robinson and named plaintiff Kimberly Hurrell-Harring. Artwork by Alberto Morales

New York City Mayor Bill de Blasio and City Council Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito celebrated passage of two laws that will effectively eject federal immigration authorities from city jails. Photo by Alberto Morales

Continued on page 3
A message from NYCLU Executive Director Donna Lieberman: ‘Justice for All’ in the Spotlight

Follow @JustAskDonna on Twitter

The NYCLU is opposing the illegal vacuuming of New Yorkers just so their immigration status could be verified.

The NYCLU is opposing the illegal vacuuming of New Yorkers just so their immigration status could be verified.

Have our work cut out for us. But we keep getting better at claiming it.

Let’s do it, New York. Let’s do it together.
NYCLU Survey: NY School Districts Illegally Denying Education to Immigrant Children

In October, the NYCLU released findings from a review of approximately 20 percent of New York State school districts revealing that the majority of those districts may be unlawfully barring the enrollment of immigrant students.

The survey came on the heels of a statewide study by the NYCLU in 2010 which found that one-in-five school districts were putting up illegal barriers to immigrant youth. After recent allegations that a Long Island school district was preventing dozens of Latino children from receiving an education, the NYCLU reviewed the policies of the 139 offending school districts and found many are still out of compliance with the law.

“All New York children have the right to a free public education. But school districts across the state are setting up significant and unnecessary roadblocks to keep certain children out.”

Following media reports that more than 30 Latino students in Hempstead, Long Island had been signing in for attendance a few times each week, only to be told to return home, the state attorney general’s office and the SED announced they would conduct a compliance review of school district enrollment policies for undocumented students to examine whether students are being denied their constitutional right to an education.

Jason Starr, director of the NYCLU’s Nassau County chapter, cheered the steps being taken by the state.

“This announcement signals that this is a very big issue here in New York State and on Long Island, [and that] the educational enrollment and attorney general’s office are taking the rights of all students seriously,” Starr said.

I n December, on the eve of an argument before the US District Court in Buffalo, the NYCLU filed a lawsuit demanding the Erie County Sheriff’s Office to do the right thing and make this a reality for all workers.

Desantis-Mayer routinely lifted packages up to 70 pounds without assistance, working up to 14 hours per day as the only female driver at the Farmingville UPS facility in Long Island. When she was eight weeks pregnant, her doctor recommended that she lift no more than 25 pounds. Though she had previously been accommodated when she pulled a muscle on the job, Desantis-Mayer charged that UPS said pregnancy was different than 25 pounds. Though she had previously been accommodated when she pulled a muscle on the job, Desantis-Mayer charged that UPS said pregnancy was different than 25 pounds.

UPS’s change in policy will help create an equal playing field for pregnant women,” said Mariko Hirose, NYCLU staff attorney in the ACLU’s Women’s Rights Project.

“All New York women should have access to the same basic protections. It’s time for the state legislature to do the right thing and make this a reality for all workers.”

Shortly after the recommendation by the Sheriff’s Association, the New York City Council introduced its legislation.

Since 2010, thousands of immigrant New Yorkers have been incarcerated for extended periods on account of unlawful requests sent by federal immigration officials to local and state law enforcement agencies asking that they hold a person in their custody for an extra two to five days beyond the time when he or she should be released. These prolonged detentions give the immigration officials extra time to decide whether to take people into federal custody for deportation proceedings. They can also stretch incarceration time for weeks.

NYCLU Lawsuit Demands Info on Surveillance in Buffalo

In November, the NYCLU filed a lawsuit challenging the Erie County Sheriff’s Office’s failure to follow the law and make public information about how it uses mobile devices to track and record New Yorkers’ location.

The NYCLU’s lawsuit came after Buffalo-area media revealed that the Sheriff’s Office was using “stingrays,” devices that can be used to pick up signals from all cell phones and wireless devices within a designated area, thereby collecting information on totally innocent people in the process.

“The Constitution protects us from unreasonable governmental intrusion into our privacy and our lives,” said John Carr III, director of the NYCLU’s Western Regional Office. “Technology should never be allowed to overstep judicial scrutiny.”

The NYCLU filed a Freedom of Information request in June but was denied in full. In its denial, the Sheriff’s Office made no distinction between what documents it had in its possession and which simply do not exist.

After the initial response from the Sheriff’s Office, the NYCLU filed an appeal requesting the same documents and citing the flawed logic used in the original denial.

The Erie County Sheriff’s Office failed to reply to the appeal, forcing the NYCLU to turn to the courts to get access to basic public information.

“It is frustrating that the Erie County Sheriff’s Office simply flouted its obligations under the Freedom of Information Law,” said NYCLU Staff Attorney Mariko Hirose. “That law exists to ensure government transparency and accountability. Those are particularly important values when local law enforcement is acquiring powerful surveillance technology that has the capability to invade our privacy in ways we could never imagine before.”
NYCLU Celebrates Star-Studded Annual Broadway Concert

Our 12th annual Broadway Stands Up for Freedom benefit concert, showcasing the vital link between civil liberties and the arts, was a tremendous success. Broadway’s finest, including Tony winners Lena Hall (Hedwig and the Angry Inch) and nominees Celia Keenan-Bolger (Glass Menagerie), Condola Rashad (The Trip to Bountiful) and Robin de Jesus (In the Heights), took the stage to celebrate the work of the NYCLU.

Powerful musical performances included tributes to Pete Seeger and Maya Angelou, new music by Broadway composer Michael Friedman (Bloody Bloody Andrew Jackson, Angels in America), and sets by bands Sky-Pony and Hem.

Radio personality Seth Rudetsky skewered Donny and Marie Osmond’s version of Fiddler on the Roof’s “L’Chaim” in one of his signature deconstructions, and the Keenan-Bolgers – Drama Desk-winner Celia and multimedia pro, brother Andrew – presented a hilarious video for the concert featuring jokes and commentary by dozens of other Broadway stars.

NYCLU staff also took the stage as backup singers to musical prodigy Zachary Unger (Newsies) for a performance of Seeger’s “If I Had a Hammer.” Broadway Stands Up was staged by Daniel Goldstein, director of Broadway’s 2013 revival of Godspell. Paul Staroba (Gentleman’s Guide) served as musical director and Susan Blackwell (NOW. HERE. THIS.) acted as host.

Proceeds from the show support the NYCLU’s youth programs, including its work with LGBT teenagers; its Teen Activist Project, which engages New York City teens as organizers and peer educators on civil rights and civil liberties issues; and its work to stop overly aggressive policing and zero-tolerance discipline in the city’s public schools.

“This year’s show was outstanding thanks to the generous donations of time, heart and talent by the company,” said Executive Director Donna Lieberman. “Bravo to all the performers!”
NY’s Highest Court Says Cyberbullying Criminal Law Goes Too Far

In July, the New York State Court of Appeals struck down Albany County’s cyberbullying law, finding that it sweeps too broadly and criminalizes protected speech. This decision has national importance as it is one of the first times any state’s highest court has taken on a law that makes it a crime to bully people online, ordinances that are becoming increasingly popular and overwhelmingly target children.

“Cyberbullying is a serious concern that all communities must confront, but there are better and more constructive ways to address the problem than giving children criminal records,” said NYCLU Senior Staff Attorney Corey Stoughton, lead counsel on the case. “Communities across New York and the nation should take note that criminalizing First Amendment activity is unlawful and does nothing to address the causes of bullying or prevent it from taking place.”

The decision was issued in The People v. Marquan M., in which the NYCLU challenged a 2010 Albany County law that makes it a crime to communicate “private, personal, false, or sexual information,” intended to “harass, annoy, threaten, abuse, taunt, intimidate, torment, humiliate, or otherwise inflict significant emotional harm on another person.”

In response to the decision, instead of recognizing that legislation can’t end cyberbullying, Albany County passed a new law. But the new statute still carries with it a significant potential to harm youth and criminalize constitutionally protected speech.

“The cyberbullying law adopted by the Albany County Legislature is clearly unconstitutional and the NYCLU is watching to see if it will ever be enforced,” said Melanie Trimble, director of the Capital Region Committee to address problems between the press and the police Department.

The People v. Marquan M.
seven years ago, Schulte Roth & Zabel LLP litigation partner Gary Stein heard about the routine miscarriages of justice in upstate New York and was “flabbergasted.” A former federal prosecutor, he couldn’t believe that poor criminal defendants were regularly arraigned without attorneys – something unheard of in the federal system – and defendants were regularly arraigned without attorneys. From the start the firm recognized the enormous importance of this case and that it was going to require the full resources of the firm, and treated it just like any non-pro bono case,” Stein said. Stein’s leadership in *Hurrell-Harring* brought his distinguished legal career full circle. The right to counsel for poor defendants was established in the seminal Supreme Court case of *Gideon v. Wainwright*. And it turns out that the story behind the *Gideon* case, as told in Anthony Lewis’s book *Gideon’s Trumpet*, was a main inspiration for Stein to become a lawyer in the first place. But before he joined forces with the NYCLU to reform public defense, he served the public interest on the other side of the courtroom as a federal prosecutor. After graduating from New York University School of Law, clerking for the Chief Justice of the New Jersey Supreme Court and litigating at Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison, Stein was drawn to the U.S. Attorney’s Office in Manhattan where he focused on prosecuting white-collar crime. Stein’s perspective as a former federal prosecutor was invaluable. He knows and can show what a properly functioning justice system looks like,” said Corey Stoughton, the NYCLU’s lead counsel in *Hurrell-Harring*.

In the weeks before *Hurrell-Harring* was set to go to trial, Stein’s insight into the justice system and trial experience helped guide teams at both Schulte and the NYCLU as they worked around the clock through the “frankly insane” amount of trial preparation. His family was along for the ride, including his wife, Ana Demel, an adjunct professor at NYU law school, his daughter, Michelle, 26, a consultant at FTI, and his son Jeffrey, 23, a journalist in upstate New York.

“One Sunday during the settlement negotiations, I had tickets with my daughter to a New York Rangers game but wasn’t able to get there until there was about one minute left in the second period,” Stein said. “Then I stood in the stairwell on another conference call and wasn’t back until there were four minutes left in the game. I think my daughter will be happy to have her hockey partner back.”

For all of his contribution, Stein is deeply humble and full of praise for both his own team and the lawyers at the NYCLU.

“*After Hurrell-Harring* I feel lucky I don’t have to go up against the NYCLU in a commercial litigation,” he said.

The appreciation is mutual. “Not being able to see Gary’s masterful examination of a witness during trial with the state in *Hurrell-Harring* is one of the greatest disappointments of my life,” Stoughton said.

### Rochester Bans the Box

Rochester celebrated a great victory in May when the City Council unanimously voted to “ban the box” – restrict employers in the city from asking about a person’s criminal history on a job application.

The Genesee Valley Chapter of the NYCLU played a critical role in securing the civil rights legislation. “Rochester took an important step toward ending the employment discrimination suffered by formerly incarcerated people,” said Genesee Valley Chapter Director Kaelyn Rich. “This legislation is important for economic justice and racial justice, since these challenges are disproportionately shouldered by black and Latino men.”

Using the national slogan “Ban the Box,” the Genesee Valley Chapter and 23 other local organizations pushed for the legislation’s passage. With it, Rochester joined a movement of 62 cities and 12 states that now ban the box.

*This legislation is important for economic justice and racial justice, since these challenges are disproportionately shouldered by black and Latino men.*

Employers will still be able to ask about prior convictions during the interview process, a time when advocates say is appropriate to discuss criminal histories. Those hiring for positions where criminal histories are highly relevant, such as positions working with children, will still be able to ask about prior convictions on applications.

The ordinance will help close the employment gap for the one-in–four Americans whose criminal history has resulted in setbacks when applying for jobs. It should also aid in reducing recidivism since studies show that only 8 percent of previously incarcerated people who are employed for a year commit another crime.

**A CALL FOR JUSTICE FOR ERIC GARNER**

The July death of Eric Garner at the hands of the NYPD brought national attention to the broken windows policing, the practice of using aggressive tactics to respond to minor, non-violent infractions – in this case, Garner’s alleged sale of untaxed cigarettes.

The NYCLU organized aggressively in response, using our multi-faceted approach of public education, advocacy and legal expertise to take our concerns to the news media, the halls of city government and the streets. We analyzed data on who gets criminal court summons and for what reasons, urged an examination of police practices with regard to enforcement of low-level offenses, and joined thousands of New Yorkers in an August march through the streets of Staten Island.

In December, when news broke that the grand jury failed to indict the officer responsible for his death, the NYCLU monitored protests across New York City to ensure that the groundswell of First Amendment activity was protected, helped organize demonstrations and continued our work statewide to help lead the police reform movement and end police policies that disproportionally impact communities of color with aggressive tactics.
state finally began making it an ‘actual truth.’"

The historic settlement is the result of the NYC- LU’s 2007 lawsuit, Hurrell-Harring v. New York, which charged New York State with abdicating its responsibility for public defense to its counties, resulting in a patchwork of often understaffed, poorly resourced and largely dysfunctional public defense systems where defendants were routinely arraigned without attorneys, urged to plea bargain regardless of the facts of their cases, burdened by excessively high bail, and incarcerated for shockingly long periods for misdemeanors and petty crimes. By failing to provide poor defendants with adequate representation, New York State was violating the U.S. Constitution, the state constitution and the laws of New York.

“New York State has recognized not only that a lack of resources and high caseloads make it impossible for public defense attorneys to represent their clients, but also that a functioning public defense system must pay attention to the quality of representation provided to the poor,” said Senior Staff Attorney Corey Stoughton, lead counsel on the case. “This agreement is a template by which New York can establish equal justice for all in every single county and should serve as a model for the rest of the country.”

In one of his last public acts before announcing his resignation, Attorney General Eric Holder submitted a statement of interest supporting the Hurrell-Harring lawsuit, the first ever U.S. Department of Justice show of support in a state court proceeding on public defense. The filing suggests that states must be held accountable if they fail to provide adequate legal services to poor people accused of crimes. Since then, the eyes of the nation have been on New York.

Under the agreement, the state will adopt major reforms focusing on five New York counties — Ontario, Onondaga (Syracuse), Schuyler, Suffolk and Washington — that were chosen because their public defense systems are all different and cover communities large and small, but are all emblems of New York’s flawed approach.

“Onondaga County has long been considered the poster child for problems with the indigent defense system,” said Central Chapter Director Barrie Gewanter. “This settlement promises to make fundamental changes to the way New York State delivers public defense, thus allowing more New Yorkers to access the courts on an equal footing.”

• Provides that the plaintiffs will receive detailed reports allowing them to monitor compliance with the constitutional provision of public defense services and commits New York to provide the office with the resources it needs to develop plans and implement and monitor reforms mandated by the settlement; and

• Provides for the settlement of caseload failures that will substantially limit the number of cases any lawyer can carry, thereby ensuring that poor criminal defendants get a real defense; and

• Requires New York to spend $4 million over the next two years to increase attorney communications with poor criminal defendants, promote the use of investigators and experts, and improve the qualifications, training and supervision of lawyers representing indigent defendants; and

• Mandates the creation of eligibility standards for representation, thus allowing more New Yorkers to access public defense services; and

• Strengthens the Office of Indigent Legal Services as a state-level oversight entity tasked with ensuring the constitutional provision of public defense services and commits New York to provide the office with the resources it needs to develop plans and implement and monitor reforms mandated by the settlement; and

• Provides that the plaintiffs will receive detailed reports allowing them to monitor compliance with the agreement and, if necessary, return to court to enforce it.

Hurrell-Harring v. New York would have been the first time any state stood trial for its public defense failures, calling attention to a nationwide criminal justice crisis where poor, or indigent, defendants are too often effectively denied the right to counsel, creating a two-tiered system of justice.

“This settlement marks what we hope and expect to be the beginning of sweeping reforms of New York’s broken public defense system,” said Associate Legal Director Christopher Dunn. “For far too long, poor criminal defendants in New York have been railroaded by a public defense system that did little more than process guilty pleas and ruin lives.”

In addition to Stoughton, Dunn and Gewanter, NYCLU staff who have worked on the case include Arthur Eisenberg, Mariko Hirose, Erin Harrist, Philip Desgranges, Dana Wolfe, Noah Breslau, Malita Pacioso, Alexis Karteron, Rebecca Engel, Taylor Pendergrass, Deborah Berkman, Daniel Freeman, Patyn Hung, Jeffrey Fogel, Susannah Karlsson, Brooke Menschel and Demetrious Thomas.

Behind the Settlement: A Campaign with Wheels

A trial for the NYCLU indigent defense case became less a possibility and more a certainty, Team NYCLU dug deep — legal staff came out, working feverishly late into the night and over the weekends. Lawyers and paralegals prepared to move to Albany for the weeks or even months a trial could take. But there was still a small glimmer of hope that the state would come back to the negotiating table and settle the lawsuit — the facts were clear and we knew a trial shouldn’t be necessary. But for any real chance at settlement, state leaders needed to know this issue wasn’t going to go away quietly. So before summer’s end, the NYCLU’s Communications Department hatched a new game plan, guided by the communications team’s skills to instantly highlight the state’s continued failure to provide public defense with renewed fervor.

On Wednesday Aug. 27, the NYCLU officially launched the “Wheel of Justice NY” campaign. The Wheel of JusticeNY — a brightly-colored, 7-foot-tall carnival wheel — would travel across the state, with stops in Syracuse, Manhattan, the Bronx, Long Island and Albany. Geared at shedding a light on the real life collateral consequences of the state’s broken public defense system, real New Yorkers were invited to spin the Wheel and see for themselves that justice is a gamble, one that too many poor New Yorkers face each day. All the game outcomes were based on the true stories of NYCLU clients whose lives had been ruined because the state failed to provide their constitutional right to counsel.

“Nothing was going to go away quietly. So before summer’s end, the NYCLU’s Communications Department hatched a new game plan, guided by the communications team’s skills to instantly highlight the state’s continued failure to provide public defense,” said NYCLU Executive Director Donna Lieberman. “The Wheel of Justice demonstrated just how dire and destructive the consequences of the cruel criminal justice system can be for poor New Yorkers accused of crimes — their kids are taken, they’re evicted, they lose their jobs, their whole lives can be devastated.”

Press followed the Wheel across the state. From the state fair in Syracuse to Washington Square Park, from the bustling streets outside Yankee Stadium to the formidable stateliness of the State Capital building. New Yorkers were shocked at the insidious outcomes for plaintiffs who could not afford their own attorney. The photo opportunities were priceless — real life New Yorkers were stunned — and the NYCLU channeled that disbelief into activism.

Both in person and via the NYCLU’s companion website – www.WheelofJusticeNY.org – New Yorkers were urged sent a message to Governor Cuomo and state officials demanding that they settle the lawsuit before it went to trial.

“The Wheel of Justice campaign was a great way for the NYCLU to stretch its legs creatively in how we communicate and engage with people,” said NYCLU Multi-Media Producer Alberto Melendez. “There were so many people who not only spun the Wheel, but shared their own experiences with the state’s broken public defense system, and why they supported our lawsuit. It confirmed the value of our work.”

On the last stop of Wheel of Justice campaign trail, the NYCLU paired up with the Illuminator collective, a team of activists who earned national attention during Occupy Wall Street for projecting messages about the 99 percent on the sides of buildings such as Citibank. Under the cover of night, the NYCLU created dazzling images on the sides of Albany landmarks as locals showed up to play the game using a Wii remote control on the side of capital area buildings. Other messages told state officials to, “Fix Public Defense.”

Coupled with a report documenting shocking examples of the state to provide public defense and aggressive editorial board outreach and strategic op-ed writing, the communications campaign was an undeniable success that brought heat on lawmakers. Our deliberate and public outcry would not be ignored — trial would be postponed, real settlement talks resumed as of 50 years of ignoring its responsibilities, New York reached a historic agreement to overhaul public defense in five counties and ultimately laid the foundation for statewide reform of New York’s broken public defense system.

To spin the Wheel of Justice, visit www.WheelofJusticeNY.org.
Legislative Director Robert Perry on the State Legislature: A Post-Election Perspective

Up on his election to a second term, Governor Cuomo promised, not for the first time, to make Albany the "progressive capital of the nation." But what do these words mean? It would seem that measures to uphold or advance civil rights and civil liberties would be the centerpiece of a legislative and policy agenda in the nation's most progressive statehouse.

So (to paraphrase former New York City Mayor Ed Koch), How're we doin'? What legislative agenda? What follows is a status report on several pieces of legislation that would strengthen protections of individual liberty and broaden protections against unlawful discrimination.

What is this summary demonstrating, however, is that in Albany even modest progressive reforms face stiff resistance. Harassment of LGBT youth

Women's rights

It is now almost two years since Cuomo announced the Women's Equality Act — legislation that would strengthen equal-pay laws; extend the prohibition against sexual harassment to all private businesses; require employers to offer reasonable accommodations to pregnant women; and establish a clear, affirmative right to abortion (currently in New York law, abortions to pregnant workers; and establish a clear, affirmative right to abortion (currently in New York law, abortions are recognized as an exception to a penal code offense).

A broad coalition of 858 organizations moved the Women's Equality Act to the center of political debate in Albany. The state assembly passed the legislation in 2013 and 2014; but the senate rejected the abortion provision, passing nine of the provisions as individual rights (the penal code, which is a relic of the Jim Crow era, when most farm workers and domestic workers were black).

The Farm Workers Fair Labor Practices Act would extend to farm laborers the rights afforded all other workers. Opponents of the legislation claim it would destroy the "family farm." But it is the large, industrial-scale corporate farms that are holding up recognition of farm workers' rights.

Wrongful convictions

Wrongful convictions are a principle cause (along with biased witness identification procedures) of wrongful convictions. And there is a broad consensus among criminal justice experts that the practice can be prevented by videotaping interrogations of people in police custody. Cuomo endorsed legislation requiring videotaped interrogations in his 2013 State of the State Address. And, yes, once again the legislative roadblock is in the senate.

The legacy of Jim Crow

The agriculture industry is thriving in New York. A simple action allows them to cooperate in this matter of lowering expectations. But a lot of folks who voted for the governor take him at his word when he celebrates a vision of governance in which Albany is a catalyst for progressive ideas and action. And his office has just taken one step, at least, in delivering on that vision.

The state agrees to begin repair of a broken public defense system

At the moment, the political order in Albany may have little tolerance for bold, progressive governance. But certainly a majority of the state's political leaders believe that the criminal justice system should be fair and just, and that when prosecutors press charges against someone who cannot afford a lawyer, the state has a duty to provide the accused with legal representation. The U.S. Constitution requires states provide legal counsel. And the state has just settled a longstanding class-action lawsuit by agreeing to reduce caseloads of public defense lawyers, establish standards for effective legal representation and provide the resources needed for the state to meet its constitutional obligation to indigent defendants in five counties (See page 1 for more information).

Public defense services in many parts of the state are a disgrace. The failures are systemic, as must be the remedy. The settlement with the state in the case Hurrell-Harring v. State of New York presents an opportunity to create a public defense system in New York that is a national model — fair, efficient, well-managed. And who can argue with efficiency and fairness?

---

NOTICE REGARDING BOARD NOMINATIONS

The annual meeting of the members of the NYCLU will be at 6 p.m. on Thursday, June 19, 2015 at 155 Broad St., New York NY for the purpose of electing directors, receiving the annual report and transacting any other appropriate business.

All directors are elected by a vote of the statewide membership. This year there are 17 vacancies to be filled. The Nominating Committee is charged by the NYCLU by-laws to nominate only as many candidates as there are vacancies on the Board.

The Nominating Committee will nominate its slate of candidates. If you are interested in finding out who the nominees are, please write to Donna Lieberman, Executive Director, 155 Broad St., New York NY 10004.

The board of each NYCLU chapter is entitled to nominate one director. Nomination may also be made by petition of at least 25 members.

Nominations must be filed with Executive Director Donna Lieberman by April 18, 2015, 15 days prior to the annual meeting, at 155 Broad St., New York NY 10004.

A proxy ballot, along with biographical information and supporting statements of each of the candidates, will be published in the next issue of the NYCLU News!