FILED: ALBANY COUNTY CLERK 12/15/2022 03:00 PM INDEX NO. 909435-22

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 8

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

Exhibit F

INDEX NO. 909435-22

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF ALBANY

KIMBERLY HURRELL-HARRING; JAMES ADAMS; JOSEPH BRIGGS; RICKY LEE GLOVER; RICHARD LOVE; JACQUELINE WINBRONE; LANE LOYZELLE; TOSHA STEELE; BRUCE WASHINGTON; SHAWN CHASE; JEMAR JOHNSON; ROBERT TOMBERELLI; CHRISTOPHER YAW; LUTHER WOODROW OF BOOKER, JR.; JOY METZLER; VICTOR TURNER; EDWARD KAMINSKI; CANDACE BROOKINS; RANDY HABSHI; and RONALD McINTYRE, on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Index No. 8866-07

Plaintiffs,

-against-

THE STATE OF NEW YORK, GOVERNOR ANDREW M. CUOMO, in his official capacity, THE COUNTY OF ONONDAGA, NEW YORK, THE COUNTY OF SCHUYLER, NEW YORK, THE COUNTY OF SUFFOLK, NEW YORK and THE COUNTY OF WASHINGTON, NEW YORK,

Defendants.

FIFTH AMENDMENT TO STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs, on behalf of the Plaintiff Class, as defined by the Appellate Division, Third Department ("Plaintiffs"), commenced and pursued a class action lawsuit entitled *Hurrell-Harring, et al. v. State of New York, et al.*, Index No. 8866-07, in New York Supreme Court, Albany County (the "Lawsuit"), seeking declaratory and prospective injunctive relief for, among other things, the alleged deprivation by the State of New York and the Governor of the State of

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

New York (the "State Defendants") of Plaintiffs' right to counsel in the counties of Onondaga, Ontario, Schuyler, Suffolk, and Washington (together the "Five Counties" and each a "County") guaranteed to Plaintiffs by the Sixth and Fourteenth Amendments to the United States Constitution, Article I, § 6 of the New York State Constitution, and various statutory provisions; and

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs, the State Defendants, and the Five Counties agreed to settle the Lawsuit and entered into a Stipulation and Order of Settlement, signed by Plaintiffs and the State Defendants on October 22, 2014 (the "Settlement Agreement"); and

WHEREAS, after receiving and reviewing submissions from the Parties, holding hearings in each County, and due deliberation, the Court approved the Settlement Agreement on March 11, 2015; and

WHEREAS, the parties made certain non-material amendments of this Settlement Agreement on or about September 16, 2015, February 9, 2016, June 3, 2016, and December 5, 2016, and those amendments are attached hereto as **Exhibit B**; and

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs and the State Defendants have now agreed to a material modification to the Settlement Agreement that will, *inter alia*, extend the implementation date of caseload/workload standards and the expiration date of this Settlement Agreement; and

WHEREAS, a fully integrated version of the terms of the Settlement Agreement as amended, including the agreement reflected herein, is appended hereto as Exhibit A;

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED, AGREED, AND ORDERED as follows:

The Settlement Agreement is amended as follows and in all other respects remains unaltered, except as previously amended by written agreement of the parties as reflected in Exhibit B hereto:

INDEX NO. 909435-22

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

IV. CASELOAD RELIEF

(B) (1) (i) No later than September 11, 2017 April 30, 2019 (the "Implementation Date") and continuing thereafter, the State shall ensure that the caseload/workload standards are implemented and adhered to by all providers of Mandated Representation in the Five Counties.

(ii) If, as of the Implementation Date listed in paragraph IV(B)(1)(i), one or more providers of Mandated Representation in any of the Five Counties shall fail to implement or adhere to the caseload/workload standards determined in accordance with paragraph IV(B), which are set forth in Exhibit 1 hereto, then the expiration of this Agreement, as set forth in paragraph XIII(C), as amended, shall automatically be extended by an additional six months to and including March 31, 2024.

- (iii) On or before March 1, 2019, ILS shall provide notice to the State Defendants and Plaintiffs of whether, in its best estimation, the caseload/workload standards will be fully implemented and adhered by each provider of Mandated Representation in each of the Five Counties as of the Implementation Date. If ILS indicates that the Implementation Date might not be met, Plaintiffs will be entitled to immediately invoke the provisions set forth at paragraphs XI(A) and XI(B).
- (2) (i) The State Defendants and Plaintiffs have agreed to the benchmarks set forth in Exhibit 2 (the "Interim Benchmarks") for the providers of Mandated Representation in each of the Five Counties to measure progress towards implementation of and adherence to the caseload/workload standards between now and the Implementation Date. ILS shall provide notice to the State Defendants and Plaintiffs, by the end of the month in

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

which each Interim Benchmark is due, of compliance with the Interim Benchmarks,

- (ii) The State Defendants and Plaintiffs agree that any noncompliance with the Interim Benchmarks resulting from a violation of a
 benchmark's required net effect on the hiring and programs of a provider, as
 set forth in Exhibit B, that is either (a) incidental and non-sporadic and the
 result of factors outside the State Defendants' control or (b) met within two
 weeks of the target date set forth therein, will not be considered a violation of
 this amendment,
- (iii) If any Interim Benchmark is not met, the State Defendants agree to (a) immediately consider and implement alternatives to cure the deficiencies, including but not limited to alternate staffing arrangements and accessing all available financial resources, and (b) within five (5) days of a missed Interim Benchmark, engage in in-person good faith negotiations with Plaintiffs to cure the deficiency. Nothing in this section will require the State to expend funds that have not been previously appropriated.

(3) ILS shall provide the following reports:

- (i) By April 30, 2018, a full analysis and review of the caseload data collected from each provider of Mandated Representation in the Five Counties for the calendar year 2017.
- (ii) By October 30, 2018, a full analysis and review of the data collected from the ILS case closing forms and an interim analysis and review of the caseload data collected from each provider of Mandated Representation in the Five Counties for the first six months of 2018 as compared to the same from calendar year 2017.

INDEX NO. 909435-22

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

(iii) By April 30, 2019, a full analysis and review of the caseload data collected from each provider of Mandated Representation in the Five Counties for the calendar year 2018, and a review and analysis of the caseload data for the first three months of 2019 from any provider of Mandated Representation in the Five Counties that was not in compliance with the caseload/workload standards as of the end of calendar year 2018, together with an assessment of each such provider's compliance with the caseload/workload standards as of March 31, 2019.

(4) The State Defendants and ILS shall continue implementing the caseload/workload standards determined in accordance with paragraph IV(B), without waiting for court approval of this Fifth Amendment to the Settlement Agreement.

XIII. GENERAL PROVISIONS

(C) Expiration of Agreement. This Agreement shall expire 7.5 years after the Effective Date on September 30, 2023.

Remainder of Page Left Intentionally Empty Signature Page Follows

Dated:

INDEX NO. 909435-22

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

FILED: ALBANY COUNTY CLERK 12/15/2022 03:00 PM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 8

INDEX NO. 909435-22

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

EXHIBIT 1 - CASELOAD/WORKLOAD STANDARDS

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

INDEX NO. 909435-22

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 8

EXHIBIT 2 – INTERIM BENCHMARKS

The following Interim Benchmarks include both individual hires that will be made and programs that will be implemented, as well as not effects of the hirings and programs for each provider of Mandated Representation in the Five Counties.

Target Date or Target Date Range	Activity (Net Effect on Hiring/Program)	<u>Provider</u>
June 2017	Executive Director hired. (1 executive director total)	Onondaga County Assigned Counsel Program
<u>June 2017</u>	Deputy Director hired. (1 deputy director total)	Onondaga County Assigned Counsel Program
<u>June 2017</u>	Quality Enhancement Director. (1 quality enhancement director total)	Onondaga County Assigned Counsel Program
June 2017	Chief Financial Officer. (1 chief financial officer total)	Onondaga County Assigned Counsel Program
June 2017	IT Specialist. (1 IT specialist total)	Onondaga County Assigned Counsel Program
<u>June 2017</u>	Eligibility Specialist. (1 cligibility specialist total)	Onondaga County Assigned Counsel Program

INDEX NO. 909435-22

Target Date or	Activity	<u>Provider</u>
Target Date Range	(Net Effect on Hiring/Program)	
<u>June 2017</u>	Data Entry & Assistant.	Onondaga County Assigned
	(2 data entry & client assistants total)	Counsel Program
June 2017	IT Manager & Voucher Specialist.	Onondaga County Assigned
	(1 IT manager & voucher specialist total)	Counsel Program
June 2017	Claims Manager	Onondaga County Assigned
	(1 claims manager total)	Counsel Program
June 2017	Data Entry & Client Assistant.	Onondaga County Assigned
	(2 data entry & client assistants total)	Counsel Program
June 2017	Receptionist/Office Assistant.	Onondaga County Assigned
	(1 receptionist/office assistant total)	Counsel Program
June 2017	Quality Enhancement Assistant.	Onondaga County Assigned
	(1 quality enhancement assistant total)	<u>Counsel Program</u>
August 2017	Protocol for accessing investigator,	Onondaga County Assigned
·	experts, and interpreters implemented.	<u>Counsel Program</u>

INDEX NO. 909435-22

Target Date on	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Provider</u>
Target Date Range	(Net Effect on Hiring/Program)	
December 2017	Mentor program fully	Onondaga County Assigned
	implemented (mentors and	Counsel Program
	resource attorneys)	
January 2018	Contract with Center for	Schuyler County Assigned
	Community Alternatives (CCA)	Counsel Program
	(sentencing advocacy/mitigation	,
	services) finalized	
January 2018	Parole revocation attorney hired	Onondaga County Hiscock
	(3 parole revocation attorneys total)	Legal Aid Society
January 2018	2 entry level investigators hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid
	(8 investigators total)	Society
January 2018	IT director hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid
	(1 IT staff total)	Society
January 2018	5 paralegals hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid
	(5 paralegals total)	Society
January 2018	Social worker hired	Suffolk County Assigned
	(1 social worker total)	Counsel Defender Program

INDEX NO. 909435-22

Rapger Darcion	<u>Activity</u>	<u>Provider</u>
Target Date Range	(Net Effect on Hiring/Program)	
March 2018	6 data specialists hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid
		Society
	(26 data specialists/secretaries	
	total)	·
March 2018	Entry level social worker hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid
		Society
	(6 social workers total)	
March 2018	Investigator hired	Suffolk County Assigned
		Counsel Defender Program
	(1 investigators total)	
March 2018	Training program implemented (2-	Onondaga County Assigned
	week training program for new	Counsel Program
	attorneys; regular in-house CLEs;	
	scholarship funding being utilized)	
March 2018	Protocol for accessing non-attorney	Ontario County Assigned
	supports implemented	Counsel Program
1 0010	Protocol for accessing non-attorney	Schuyler County Assigned
March 2018	supports implemented	Counsel Program
	Supports implemented	<u> </u>
March 2018	Protocol for accessing non-attorney	Washington County
	supports implemented	Assigned Counsel Program
March 2018	Protocol for accessing	Suffolk County Assigned
	investigators, experts, and	Counsel Defender Program
	interpreters implemented	

INDEX NO. 909435-22

Target Date or	Activity	<u>Provider</u>
Target Date Range	(Net Effect on Hiring/Program)	
May-June 2018	Social worker hired	Onondaga County Hiscock
	(1 social worker total)	Legal Aid Society
May-June 2018	In-house Sentencing Advocate	Onondaga County Assigned
	hired.	Counsel Program
	(1 in-house sentencing advocate	
	total)	•
May-June 2018	Full-time assistant public defender	Schuyler County Public
	hired	Defender Office
	(4 part-time and full-time assistant public defenders total)	
	pupile defenders totali	
May-June 2018	Part-time legal secretary hired	Schuyler County Public
	(2 legal secretaries total)	<u>Defender Office</u>
May-June 2018	Mentoring program implemented	Schuyler County Assigned
		Counsel Program
May-June 2018	Second chair program	Schuyler County Assigned
·	<u>implemented</u>	Counsel Program
May-June 2018	Protocols for training scholarships	Schuyler County Assigned
	developed	Counsel Program

INDEX NO. 909435-22

Target Date or	Activity	<u>Provider</u>
Target Date Range	(Net Effect on Hiring/Program)	
<u>May-June 2018</u>	Full time assistant public defender	Washington County Public
	<u>hired</u>	<u>Defender Office</u>
	(7 full-time assistant public defenders total)	
May-June 2018	Full time legal assistant hired	Washington County Public
	(3 legal assistants total)	Defender Office
May-June 2018	Mentor program implemented	Washington County
		Assigned Counsel Program
May-June 2018	Second chair program	Washington County
	implemented	Assigned Counsel Program
May-June 2018	Training program implemented	Washington County
		Assigned Counsel Program
May-June 2018	8-12 staff attorneys hired (advance	Suffolk County Legal Aid
	team)	Society
	(106-110 staff attorneys total)	
May-June 2018	Mentor program implemented	Suffolk County Assigned
		Counsel Defender Program
May-June 2018	Training protocols implemented	Suffolk County Assigned
•		Counsel Defender Program

INDEX NO. 909435-22

Trangol Date or	<u>Activity</u>	Providen
Target Date Range	(Net Effect on Hiring/Program)	
May-June 2018	Contracts with 2 part-time quality	Suffolk County Assigned
	<u>control attorneys</u>	Counsel Defender Program
	(2 quality control attorneys total)	
May-June 2018	Paralegal/18-b coordinator hired	Suffolk County Assigned
	(1 paralegal/18-b coordinator total)	Counsel Defender Program
June 2018	Training program implemented	Ontario County Assigned
		Counsel Program
September 2018	2 nd investigator hired	Suffolk County Assigned
·	(2 investigators total)	Counsel Defender Program
September 2018	Office financial assistant hired	Suffolk County Assigned
. •	(1 financial assistants total)	Counsel Defender Program
September-October	16-12 additional staff attorneys	Suffolk County Legal Aid
2018	<u>hired</u>	Society
·	(122 staff attorneys total)	
September-October	5 support staff hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid
2018	(53 support staff total)	Society
September-October	Spanish interpreter hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid
2018	(1 Spanish interpreters total)	<u>Society</u>

FILED: ALBANY COUNTY CLERK 12/15/2022 03:00 PM

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 12/15/2022

INDEX NO. 909435-22

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 8

Target Date Rango	Activity (Not Effect on Hiving/Program)	<u>Provider</u>)
September-October 2018	Administrative assistant hired	Suffolk County Legal Aid Society
#***X	(1 administrative assistant total)	