

Exhibit H

CITY COUNCIL
CITY OF NEW YORK

----- X

TRANSCRIPT OF THE MINUTES

Of the

COMMITTEE ON MENTAL
HEALTH, DISABILITIES, AND
ADDICTION

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON HOSPITALS

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC SAFETY

Jointly with the

COMMITTEE ON FIRE AND
EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

----- X

Monday, February 6, 2023

Start: 10:18 a.m.

Recess: 5:00 p.m.

HELD AT: COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

B E F O R E: Linda Lee, Chairperson
Mercedes Narcisse, Chairperson
Kamillah Hanks, Chairperson
Joann Ariola, Chairperson

COUNCIL MEMBERS:

Shaun Abreu
Diana Ayala
Charles Barron
Erik D. Bottcher
Justin L. Brannan
Gale A. Brewer
Selvena N. Brooks-Powers
Tiffany Cabán
David M. Carr
Carmen N. De La Rosa
Oswald Feliz
James F. Gennaro
Jennifer Gutiérrez
Robert F. Holden
Rita C. Joseph
Darlene Mealy
Francisco P. Moya
Kevin C. Riley
Keith Powers
Carlina Rivera
Althea V. Stevens
Shahana K. Hanif
Vickie Paladino
Nantasha M. Williams
Kalman Yeger
Public Advocate Jumaane Williams

A P P E A R A N C E S (CONTINUED)

Jason Hansman
Deputy Director
Mental Health Initiatives, Crisis
Response, and Community Capacity
Mayor's Office of Community Mental Health

Omar Fattal, MD
Systems Chief for Behavioral Health
Co-Deputy Chief Medical Officer
New York City Health and Hospitals

Michael Fields
Chief of Emergency Medical Services
New York City Fire Department

Theresa Tobin
Chief of Interagency Operations
New York City Police Department

Juanita Holmes
Chief of Training
New York City Police Department

Michael Clarke
Director of the Legislative Affairs Unit
New York City Police Department

Jamie Neckles
Assistant Commissioner
Bureau of Mental Health
New York City Health Department

Karim Walker
Outreach and an Organizing Specialist
Safety Net Project, Urban Justice Center

Graham Nyaasi
Advocacy Specialist at Community Access
Steering Committee Member of
Correct Crisis, Intervention Today NYC.

Danny Kim speaking for Eric Vassell
Justice Committee

Ellen Trawick
Mother of Kawaski Trawick

Christine Henson
Mother of Andrew Henson

Oren Barzilay
FDNY EMS, President of Local 2507

Selena Trowell
Vocal New York Homeless Union

Beth Haroules
New York Civil Liberties Union

Siya Hegde
Housing Policy Counsel
Bronx Defenders

Elena Landriscina
Staff Attorney
Legal Aid Society

Anthony Feliciano
Vice President for Community Mobilization
Housing Works

Rabbi Joshua Stanton
Tirdof: NY Jewish Clergy for Justice

Craig Hughes
Social Worker
Bronx office of Mobilization For Justice

Antonine Pierre
Brooklyn Movement Center

Toni Smith
New York State Director
Drug Policy Alliance

Danielle Regis
Supervising Attorney
Mental Health Representation Team
Criminal Defense Practice
Brooklyn Defender Services

Dr. Samuel Jackson
Psychiatrist
New York Doctors Coalition

Dr. Michael Zingman
Psychiatry at Bellevue Hospital
Secretary Treasurer
Committee of Interns and Residents

Dr. Ashley Brittain
Resident physician of Emergency medicine
Regional Delicate
Committee of Interns and Residents

Luke Sikinyi
Director of Public Policy
New York Association of
Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services

Chaplain Dr. Victoria Phillips (Dr. V)
Mental Health Project
Urban Justice Center

Dr. Betty Kolod
Primary Care Physician
New York Doctors Coalition

Jessica Fear
Senior Vice President for Behavioral
Health
VNS Health

Fiodhna O'Grady
Samaritans of New York

Casey Starr
Co-Executive Director
Samaritans of New York

Toni Smith
New York State Director
Drug Policy Alliance

Danielle Regis
Supervising Attorney
Mental Health Representation Team
Criminal Defense Practice
Brooklyn Defender Services

Dr. Samuel Jackson
Psychiatrist
New York Doctors Coalition

Dr. Michael Zingman
Psychiatry at Bellevue Hospital
Secretary Treasurer
Committee of Interns and Residents

Dr. Ashley Brittain
Resident physician of Emergency medicine
Regional Delicate
Committee of Interns and Residents

Luke Sikinyi
Director of Public Policy
New York Association of
Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services

Chaplain Dr. Victoria Phillips (Dr. V)
Mental Health Project
Urban Justice Center

Dr. Betty Kolod
Primary Care Physician
New York Doctors Coalition

Jessica Fear
Senior Vice President, Behavioral Health
VNS Health

Fiodhna O'Grady
Samaritans of New York

Casey Starr
Co-Executive Director
Samaritans of New York

Helen "Skip" Skipper
Justice Peer Initiative

Sarah Blanco
Clinical Director
Midtown Community Court Midtown
Center for Justice Innovation

Nadia Swanson
Licensed Clinical Social Worker
Director of Technical Assistance and
Advocacy
Ali Forney Center

Christina Sparrock
A Founder of Person Centered Intervention
Training
Mental Health Response Pilot

Lena Allen
Policy Analyst
Fountain House

Nadia Chait
Senior Director of Policy and Advocacy
The Center for Alternative Sentencing and
Employment Services

Alexandra Nyman
CEO
Break Free Foundation

Ruth Lowenkron
Director, Disability Justice Program
New York Lawyers for the Public Interest

Jason Bowen
Peer Advocate
Community Access Crisis Respite

Richard
Homeless person

Dr. Jeremy Kidd
President
New York County Psychiatric Society

Sandra Gresl
Co-Chair, Social Welfare Law Committee
New York City Bar Association

Deborah Berkman
Supervising Attorney
Shelter Advocacy Initiative
New York Legal Assistance Group

Lauren Galloway
Advocacy Coordinator
Coalition for Homeless Youth

Carolyn Strudwick
Associate Vice President
Street Work Project
Safe Horizon

10

Dr. Erick Eiting
President
New York County Medical Society

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 11

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Good morning and welcome to
4 today's New York City Council hearing for the
5 Committees on Hospitals, Mental Health, Public Safety
6 and Fire and Emergency Management at this time please
7 silence all electronic devices. Chairs we are ready
8 to begin.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Good morning everyone.
10 My name is Councilmember Linda Lee, Chair of the
11 Committee on Mental Health, Disabilities, and
12 Addiction. I'd like to thank all my colleagues,
13 Councilmembers Mercedes Nasrcisse, Chair the
14 Committee on Hospitals, Councilmember Joanne Ariola
15 who's with us virtually, Chair of the Committee on
16 Fire and Emergency Management, and Councilmember
17 Camilla Hanks Chair the Committee on Public Safety
18 for being here at today's joint hearing on oversight
19 for mental health and voluntary removals, and Mayor
20 Adams recently announced plan. And I also want to
21 thank all of the folks who are here from the Admin
22 who are here to testify.

23 This may be a long hearing, so I want to thank
24 all of you, potentially-- I want to thank all of you
25 ahead of time for your patience. And just as a
reminder, you know, just to keep it respectful and

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 12

3 cordial in the chambers and if there's any issues,
4 please let us know or any of the staff know as well.

5 So thank you so much. As I mentioned,
6 representatives from OCMH, Health and Hospitals,
7 FDNY, NYPD, and DOHMH for being here to provide
8 testimony and answer the Committee's questions.

9 And we will also be hearing two bills Proposed
10 Intro 273 A sponsored by Chair Narcisse, which would
11 require police officers to receive training related
12 to recognizing and interacting with individuals with
13 autism spectrum disorder, and Intro 706 sponsored by
14 Councilmember Shaun Abreu, which would require the
15 Office of Community Mental Health to create an online
16 services portal and guide on available mental health
17 services in this city.

18 So at this time, I'd like to acknowledge our
19 colleagues who are here with us today. So I'm just
20 going to stand up so I could see everyone. We have
21 Councilmember Cabán, Councilmember Barron,
22 Councilmember Hanif, Councilmember Bottcher. Our
23 Public Advocate has joined us Jumaane Williams. We
24 have Councilmember Rita Joseph, of course, our Chair,
25 fellow Chairs, and we have Councilmember De La Rosa,
Majority Leader Keith Powers. We have Councilmember

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 13

2 Vicki Paladino, Councilmember Holden, Councilmember
3 Carr. So thank you all for joining us today and for
4 being with us.

5 And it's also great to see my fellow social
6 service colleagues, former colleagues in the audience
7 as well who will be testifying today.

8 To begin the term Serious Mental Illness or SMI
9 as defined by DSM as a mental health disorder that
10 substantially interferes with or limits one or more
11 major life activities. All mental health conditions
12 have the potential to interfere with someone's
13 quality of life, so it's important to note that in
14 many instances, using quote/unquote "serious" to
15 refer to a mental health condition can vary depending
16 on the context. Generally, SMI refers to disorders
17 such as schizophrenia and subsets of major depression
18 and bipolar disorder.

19 In New York City, nearly one in every 25 adults
20 is living with a diagnosed SMI, and according to the
21 most recent statistics, although white New Yorkers
22 have a higher percentage of SMI diagnoses, black New
23 Yorkers actually have higher hospitalization rates.
24 Adding to this suffering is the fact that according
25 to OCMH, the highest poverty neighborhoods have over

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 14

3 twice as many psychiatric hospitalizations per capita
4 compared to the lowest poverty neighborhoods.

5 We are not here to dispute the seriousness of
6 this issue or does to dispute that we are in a
7 psychiatric and homelessness crisis which deserves
8 recognition as well as our immediate support and
9 action, but we are here today to talk specifically
10 about the Mayor's recently announced directive to
11 city agencies, which provides updated guidance on how
12 to carry out involuntary removals of individuals with
13 SMI in our communities. The directive interprets the
14 state's mental health hygiene law standard for
15 involuntary removal, which provides that law
16 enforcement, peace officers, or mobile outreach teams
17 may remove any person who appears to be mentally ill,
18 and is conducting themselves in a manner which is
19 likely to result in serious harm to the person or
20 others. The law explicitly states that "likely to
21 result in serious harm" means a substantial risk of
22 physical harm to other persons as manifested by
23 homicidal or other violent behavior by which others
24 are placed in reasonable fear of serious physical
25 harm. However, both the State Office of Mental
Health and the Administration have released guidance

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 15
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 that interprets this standard as also applying to
4 those who appear mentally ill and display an
5 inability to meet basic living needs such as lack of
6 food, clothing, or shelter. In other words, this
7 standard permits unhoused individuals in our
8 communities to be removed even when they have not
9 committed an observable or overtly dangerous act.

10 I respect the Administration's dedication to the
11 psychiatric care crisis in our city, but I would be
12 remiss not to mention that there are many valid
13 concerns that come with this standard. We do not
14 want New Yorkers being removed from our communities
15 merely because they are homeless or unhoused, only to
16 be cycled out of hospitals and back onto the streets
17 without adequate care or housing. We do not want New
18 Yorkers with disabilities and substance abuse
19 problems to be unfairly targeted due to inadequate
20 training by those carrying out this directive, and we
21 do not want black and brown New Yorkers to experience
22 the brunt of the trauma that may occur if this
23 directive is not carried out equitably.

24 The goal of today's hearing is not just to gather
25 more information on the Mayor's directive, and how it
will be implemented, but also to receive feedback

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 16
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 from community based groups, nonprofits, public
4 defender organizations, medical and mental health
5 professionals, and other advocates on how this plan
6 will directly impact our communities and to hear any
7 recommendations for improving oversight of this plan
8 going forward.

9 In closing, I'd like to thank the Administration
10 and the dedicated advocates and community members
11 here today that are here to testify. I would also
12 like to thank my colleagues and staff as well as the
13 Committee staff, Committee Counsel, Sarah Sucher, and
14 Senior Legislative Policy Analyst, Christy Dwyer, for
15 their work on this hearing, who both have extensive
16 knowledge and experience in this area.

17 I will now turn the mic to my colleague Chair
18 Narcisse of the Hospitals-- Oh, I'm sorry, Chair
19 Ariola. Just kidding. To give her opening
20 statement.

21 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you Chair Lee. Good
22 morning to everyone joining us here. My name is
23 Joanne Ariola, and I'm the Chair to the Fire and
24 Emergency Management Committee. I'd first like to
25 thank my colleagues, Chairs Camilla Hanks, Linda Lee
and Mercedes Narcisse, for holding today's hearing.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 17

3 In the interest of time, I will keep my opening
4 brief, because the Committees have a lot to examine
5 and discuss in relation to the Mayor's recent plan on
6 mental health involuntary removals.

7 As we all know, New York City Emergency Medical
8 Services personnel, provide critical emergency care
9 and work endless hours helping ensure the well-being
10 of New Yorkers. Their responsibilities ranged from
11 responding to cardiac arrests, fires, automotive
12 accidents, as well as numerous other incidences. EMS
13 first responders are often the frontline of
14 responding to 911 calls and are tasked with providing
15 immediate care, which includes the responsibility of
16 caring for individuals with emotional disturbances or
17 other serious health illnesses.

18 The Committee wants to examine what steps the
19 fire department has taken, and plans to take moving
20 forward to ensure that EMS personnel is receiving the
21 necessary training to handle the individuals with
22 serious mental health illness. Specifically, has the
23 Department provided professional training on properly
24 identifying if someone is under duress, de-escalation
25 and self defense tactics if personnel are under
attack, and are personnel provided with adequate

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 18
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 equipment to handle cases involving individuals
4 identified with mental health issues?

5 I have concern over assaults that have taken
6 place on EMS personnel, and how these incidents of
7 workplace violence have increased over the years.
8 Ultimately, we are here to support these first
9 responders provide the proper care for their in the
10 individuals who have serious mental health, illness,
11 and work to avoid further increase of assaults
12 against EMS workers by ensuring the safety of these
13 vital public servants.

14 Again, thank you all for being here today
15 regarding this very important issue, and hopefully,
16 at the conclusion of today's hearing, we will all
17 have a better understanding of how the city plans to
18 address and support New Yorkers with Serious Mental
19 Illness, as well as providing the necessary tools and
20 training and safety equipment needed for our first
21 responders.

22 I'd also like to thank our committee's legal
23 staff, led by Josh Kingsley, and our Chief Analyst,
24 William Hongash.

25 And now I'd like to turn the mic over to Chair
Lee.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 19

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Chair
4 Ariola. Now I'd like to turn over to Chair Narcisse
5 of the Hospitals Committee to give her opening
6 statement.

7 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Good morning, and I want
8 to say thank you to my colleague, Linda Lee, Hanks,
9 and Ariola, for being part of this needed process to
10 see how we are functioning in as a city when it comes
11 to mental health.

12 Good morning, everyone. I'm Councilmember nurses
13 Chair of the Committee on Hospitals. Thank you for
14 joining us for this very important hearing to discuss
15 Mayor Adam's recently announced plan regarding mental
16 health involuntary removals.

17 As many of you know, mental health has been one
18 of the most overlooked and neglected issues in our
19 healthcare and justice system. According to the
20 National Institute of Mental Health, 1 in every 25
21 New Yorkers suffer from a diagnosed Serious Mental
22 Illness known as SMI. That is over 3.38 million New
23 Yorkers that might be suffering from schizophrenia,
24 severe depression, bipolar disorder. Just last year,
25 over 131,000 mental health crisis calls were made to
911. This equates to roughly 500 calls per day.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 20

3 NYPD are usually the first to arrive from the
4 response team, who often lack proper training in
5 interacting with individual with SMI or developmental
6 disabilities which could further escalate the
7 situation, jeopardizing the lives of the officers,
8 the individual suffering from the crisis, and the
9 people involved. It should not be this way.

10 So, today, I am proud to announce my Intro 273 A,
11 which could require police officers to receive
12 training related to recognizing and interacting with
13 individuals with autism spectrum disorder so they
14 could be better equipped when encountering someone
15 suffering from a crisis. As you know, the mental
16 health crisis is a multifaceted issue that has been
17 brewing over decades of policy misshapes and has only
18 been exacerbated by the pandemic. According to OCMH
19 2023 Annual Report, one of the greatest challenges
20 facing the provision of mental health services is the
21 current workforce shortage.

22 The CEO of Mental Health Association of New York
23 State, Glenn Lippmann, said in an interview that
24 COVID-19 has amplified the shortage tenfold, as some
25 mental health programs are seeing 30 to 40% vacancy
rates. Additionally, many of the cities er are

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 21

3 overwhelmed by the influx of individuals suffering
4 from mental health crises. Psychiatric staff is
5 overworked, understaffed, and underpaid. We need to
6 create better incentives and working conditions for
7 our healthcare workers who care and nurture us back
8 to health.

9 Additionally, the city has a severe shortage of
10 psychiatry beds. We know that. For a population of
11 about 8.47 million New Yorkers. The city only has
12 2225 functioning psychiatric beds. According to a
13 Wall Street Journal report, during the peak of the
14 pandemic, about 14,000 individuals suffering from
15 mental health issues were prematurely discharged
16 without any proper follow up. The current rise in
17 mentally distress people could be attributed to the
18 untimely discharges as there was an 8% increase in
19 911 calls related to mental health crisis between
20 2021 and 2022.

21 This is a clear need for investment in our mental
22 health landscape with a focus on black and brown
23 communities who are often neglected and giving the
24 short end of the stick. If you look at the statistic
25 in 2017 SMI prevalence among white New Yorkers was
seven times higher than among black New Yorkers, and

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 22
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 yet, black New Yorkers had a higher rate of mental
4 health related hospitalization than any other ethnic
5 groups. In fact, according to the Mayor's Office of
6 Community Mental Health, the highest priority
7 neighborhoods, which as we know, tend to house black
8 and brown communities, have over twice as many
9 psychiatric hospitalization per capita as the lowest
10 priority new neighborhoods in New York City. This
11 fact paints a clear of the systematic inequalities
12 that are prevalent in our healthcare system.

13 Since this hearing is about involuntary removal,
14 I would be remiss if I did not remind my fellow city
15 and the state legislature and administrators to be
16 mindful of the broad nature of voluntary removal
17 directives and guidelines and how they can impact
18 certain communities.

19 Surely, a lot of work needs to be done around a
20 credible mental health axis in New York City, but I
21 want to give credit where it is do believe it or not.
22 Thank you, Governor Hochul and Mayor Adams for
23 bringing in much needed funding in efforts to fix our
24 mental health care system by restoring psychiatric
25 beds lost during the pandemic, creating loan
repayment plans for psychiatric doctors and nurses

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 23

3 and a funding program to help New Yorkers suffering
4 from mental illnesses. And most importantly, I want
5 to say thank you to my city agencies, H&H, DOHMH,
6 OCMH, and NYPD, FDNY, EMS and all the advocates
7 present. As you are the people working on the ground
8 and making things to keep all New Yorkers safe, I
9 look forward to hearing all of your testimonies.

10 I want to conclude by thanking my staff as well
11 as committee policy analysts Manoh Butt, and Masaf
12 Saya Joseph, my Chief Of Staff, for their work on
13 this hearing. Now I will pass it on turn it over to
14 Chair Hanks, Chair of Public Safety. Thank you.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. Chair
16 Narcisse. Good morning. My name is Kamillah Hanks.
17 I am the Councilmember and Chair on the Committee on
18 Public Safety, and I am very happy to be joined by my
19 colleagues. I'd like to thank Chairs Lee, Narcisse,
20 and Ariola for joining this Public Safety Committee
21 and convening this important hearing on involuntary
22 mental health removals and Mayor Adams's recently
23 announced mental health plan. I'd also like to thank
24 the panel that all came here today to testify.

25 As my colleagues have all stated, there are many
outstanding questions regarding how these plans will

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 24

3 be implemented, what role NYPD will play in these
4 efforts, and how the Administration will limit any
5 adverse consequences to some of our most vulnerable
6 New Yorkers.

7 So the goal of this hearing is to learn how the
8 Administration will implement a fair, compassionate,
9 and practical plan for and for providing the care and
10 support needed by those with severe mental illness,
11 while at the same time protecting the public from
12 those who may inflict harm to themselves or to
13 others. We also want to avoid criminalization and
14 provide and provide meaningful access to treatment
15 and to the long term support that we know is
16 desperately needed.

17 Moreover, we want to learn how the Administration
18 intends to evaluate the success of their plan and
19 examine the impact that Mayor Adams's plan will have
20 on public safety for all New Yorkers, and we hope to
21 hear more from the NYPD and how they will record data
22 and maintain transparency regarding these efforts.
23 Furthermore, we want to understand how NYPD intends
24 to train its officers to successfully navigate
25 engagements with people experiencing a mental health
crisis.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 25
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 Additionally, the Public Safety Committee will be
4 hearing Introduction 273, sponsored by my colleague
5 Councilmember Narcisse, which will ensure that all
6 new NYPD officers are provided with the necessary
7 training for engaging within individuals with autism
8 and on the spectrum. This important legislation for
9 which I am a proud co-sponsor seeks to provide
10 officers with the skills necessary to promote
11 effective communication between officers and with
12 those with autism, in hopes to minimizing risks for
13 officers and civilians alike. I look forward to
14 hearing the Administration's testimony and the
15 valuable perspectives brought by the members of the
16 public and experts who dedicated their lives to
17 providing care and service to those with mental
18 health issues.

19 I also like to thank our Committee Counsel Josh
20 Kingsley, and my staff, Chief of Staff Marcy Bishop
21 and my Senior Counsel Mr. Paul Casalli, thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yes. Thank you, Chair.
23 Thanks. And now I would like to first recognize
24 additional Councilmembers we've been joined by. We
25 have Councilmember Gutiérrez, Councilmember Brannan,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 26

2 Councilmember Abreu, Councilmember Feliz, and also
3 online we have-- on Zoom we have Councilmember Moya

4 And so now I'd like to turn it over to
5 Councilmember Abreu, if you'd like to say a few words
6 about your bill.

7 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Good morning, and thank
8 you, Chairs. I want to speak very briefly about my
9 bill Intro 706, our Mental Health One-Stop Shop
10 legislation.

11 We've learned so much in recent years about the
12 importance of supporting mental health. Access to
13 services is critical, but sadly, I hear from
14 constituents who are facing barriers to care due to
15 lack of information, and lack of options when it
16 comes to paying for care. Our bill would centralize
17 all available free city-sponsored options into both a
18 digital and print format resource guide, broken down
19 by population and type of service. It would also
20 require outreach on the portal while also putting in
21 place important security measures to ensure public
22 trust that their information is safe and
23 confidential. Mental health services are critically
24 important and I'm hopeful this legislation will
25 ensure that all city resources are centralized in one

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 27
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 place for maximum benefit to those in need. Thank
4 you and I look forward to hearing from the
5 Administration.

6 Thank you again Chairs.

7 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Councilmember. And
8 now I'd like to turn it over to our Public Advocate,
9 Jumaane Williams, to make a statement.

10 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much. As
11 I mentioned, my name is Jumaane Williams, Public
12 Advocate of the city of New York.

13 I want to thank all the Chairs and the members of
14 committee for holding this important hearing. In any
15 given year, one in five New Yorkers experiences
16 psychiatric illness, and hundreds of thousands of
17 those are not connected to care or support. Those
18 who are not receiving treatment or services for their
19 psychiatric disabilities are more likely to be low
20 income people or of color.

21 In addition to a shortage of inpatient
22 psychiatric beds, our city is also experiencing an
23 affordable housing crisis forcing more and more
24 people into the shelter system in the streets, making
25 people experiencing homelessness and or symptoms of
psychiatric disability even more visible. In

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 28

3 response to a rising crime rates in the subway,
4 including two tragic and high profile incidents where
5 people who were experiencing symptoms of psychiatric
6 disabilities pushed commuters in front of trains,
7 Mayor Adams announced in November of last year that
8 NYPD and FDNY will be allowed to involuntarily take
9 people perceived as being unable to take care of
10 themselves to hospitals. Many perceived this to mean
11 that they will be removed regardless of whether they
12 pose any threat of harm to themselves or others. It
13 also seemed that this was simply an announcement of a
14 tactic, much less a full entire plan.

15 First, we have to make sure we're clear that
16 mental health is not a crime, and most people who are
17 experiencing mental illness will not commit crimes.
18 Until that announcement, people experiencing mental
19 health crisis could be involuntarily detained only if
20 they were deemed to be an immediate risk to
21 themselves or others. Now it was assumed, based on
22 that announcement, that those perceived to be
23 mentally ill and unable to care for their basic
24 needs, can be detained and forced into hospitals,
25 even if they pose no risk of harm to themselves or to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 29

3 others. If this is the case, it would not only be
4 dangerous but also a waste of resources.

5 It's important to point out there is no evidence
6 that court-ordered involuntary treatment in hospitals
7 is more effective than community-based treatment. In
8 fact, Martial Simon, the man who fairly pushed
9 Michelle Alyssa Go in front of a train while
10 experiencing the symptoms of schizophrenia, had been
11 hospitalized at least 20 times and reportedly was
12 upset that hospitals were discharging him before he
13 believed he was well enough to live on his own.

14 Involuntary hospitalizations also have a broad
15 negative impact on many areas of a person's life
16 often leading to the loss of access to basic rights
17 and services including employment, parenting,
18 education, housing, professional licenses, or even
19 the potential right to drive.

20 Involving police as the primary people to respond
21 or having them present without being called when
22 responding to a person a mental health crisis can be
23 extremely dangerous and has had some historic deadly
24 results. The number of NYPD officers who have
25 received crisis intervention training has dropped
over the last two years to the point where two thirds

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 30
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 of active duty officers remain untrained, and the
4 NYPD has no way to ensure that those officers who
5 have been trained are the ones responding to 911
6 calls reporting mental health crisis.

7 To name only one tragic story in 2019, two police
8 officers were dispatched to the home of Kawaski
9 Trawick, a 32 year old black man experiencing a
10 mental health crisis. Within two minutes the
11 officers escalated the encounter to the point that
12 one of the officers fired four shots, killing Mr.
13 Trawick, who did not have a gun. The officer who
14 fired the shots had attended crisis intervention
15 training just days prior.

16 Mayor Adams says that the City has a moral
17 obligation to help those who have acute psychiatric
18 disabilities and I agree. However, merely holding a
19 person in hospital before releasing them into the
20 same environment does not help anyone, and in
21 fact may make people distrustful and less likely to
22 seek behavioral services.

23 Just a few weeks before that announcement, my
24 office released a report saying how we were doing on
25 mental health and what we could be doing better. I

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 31
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 did not receive any response from the administration.

4 All of our reports do go to the Administration.

5 If the City truly wants to fulfill its moral

6 obligation to New Yorkers with psychiatric

7 disabilities, it must invest in a continuum of care

8 that everyone needs. I will also mention that on

9 December 1st, my office sent a letter to the

10 Administration to get questions answered about many

11 of the things that not only my office but many New

12 Yorkers and reporters were asking to see if we can

13 flesh out if there was a fuller plan here. As of

14 today, we still have not received any responses. The

15 continuum of care has to include affordable and

16 supportive housing, affordable community-based health

17 services, accessible education, non-police response

18 to mental health crisis, and employment, should find

19 mental health support and services, not weapons.

20 I want to be clear that most communities that can

21 access this continuum of care are generally white and

22 wealthier. Most who cannot a generally poorer,

23 black, and brown, and unfortunately, receive a

24 response of police, forced hospitalizations, and

25 arrests.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 32
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 So we want to make sure that we can provide a
4 continuum of care that's actually needed that may
5 include hospitalizations, but it needs to be clear
6 what that plan is. And my hope is that with this
7 hearing today, perhaps we can get many of the
8 questions answered that many of us have and including
9 mine and hopefully my letter can be responded to
10 shortly. Thank you so much.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And I'll
12 turn it over to Sarah Sucher to administer the oath.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Will you please raise your right
14 hand?

15 Do you affirm to tell the truth nothing but the
16 truth before this committee and to respond honestly
17 to Councilmember questions?

18 ALL: I do.

19 COUNSEL SUCHER: You may begin when ready.

20 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Good morning,
21 Chairperson Hanks, Chairperson Lee, Chairperson
22 Ariola, and Chairperson Narcisse and members of the
23 Committees on Public Safety, Mental Health,
24 Disabilities, and Addiction, Fire and Emergency
25 Management, and Hospitals. My name is Jason Hansman,
and I am the Deputy Director of Mental Health

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 33

3 Initiatives, Crisis Response, and Community Capacity
4 at the Mayor's Office of Community Mental Health or
5 OCMH. I'm joined this morning by my colleagues Dr.
6 Omar Fattal for tall Systems Chief for Behavioral
7 Health, and Co-Deputy Chief Medical Officer at New
8 York City Health and Hospitals, Chief Michael Fields,
9 Chief of Emergency Medical Services at the Fire
10 Department, Chief Theresa Tobin, Chief of Interagency
11 Operations, Chief Juanita Holmes, Chief of Training,
12 and Michael Clarke, Director of the Legislative
13 Affairs Unit, all from the Police Department, Jamie
14 Neckles is Assistant Commissioner of the Bureau of
15 Mental Health at the Health Department.

16 OCMH coordinates and develop citywide policies
17 and strategies to facilitate critical mental health
18 care so that every New Yorker in every neighborhood
19 has the support that they need.

20 In November of 2022, Mayor Adams announced a plan
21 to create a culture of engagement for New Yorkers
22 with untreated Serious Mental Illness. It is clear
23 that we have a responsibility as a city to lead with
24 compassion and care, and that there is more that we
25 can do to help New Yorkers experiencing a mental
health crisis, especially when their mental illness

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 34
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 is so severe that they lack the ability to recognize
4 and care for their own needs. The plan that Mayor
5 Adams announced is an important step to delivering
6 essential care to our most vulnerable fellow New
7 Yorkers.

8 Our office had a significant role in crafting the
9 Administration's mental health involuntary removal
10 policy, and has an ongoing role and coordination
11 across these agencies. I'm happy to testify before
12 you today to discuss Mayor Adams's recently announced
13 plan, including his policy regarding involuntary
14 removals.

15 New York state Mental Hygiene Law allows for
16 individuals to be removed from the community to a
17 hospital for evaluation by a medical and psychiatric
18 professional who can assess the need for admission
19 and treatment. The policy the Mayor announced in
20 November draws on two of the Mental Hygiene Law's
21 provisions that grant this authority: section 958 and
22 Section 941. Section 941 authorizes a police or
23 peace officer to remove an individual who appears to
24 be mentally ill and is conducting themselves in a
25 manner likely to result in serious harm to self or
others from the community to a hospital to receive a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 35
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 psychiatric evaluation. Similarly, Section 958
4 authorizes designated clinicians or mobile crisis
5 outreach teams, which can include a licensed
6 psychologist registered professional nurses, and
7 certain social workers to direct the same kind of
8 removal for evaluation at a hospital.

9 Importantly, the Section 941 and 958 only
10 authorize removal to a hospital where a physician
11 then conducts an evaluation to determine if the
12 individual should be hospitalized. They do not allow
13 for designated clinicians, or police officers, or
14 peace officers to order the involuntary hospital
15 admission of any individual. In February of 2022,
16 the New York State Office of Mental Health, OMH,
17 issued interpretive guidance stating that both
18 Sections 941 and Section 958 authorize the removal of
19 an individual who appears to be mentally ill, and
20 displays an inability to meet basic living needs,
21 even when no recent dangerous act has been observed.
22 Their guidance was intended to help clinicians and
23 other community providers make thoughtful, clinically
24 appropriate determinations relating to involuntary
25 removals, while at the same time respecting an

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 36

3 individual's due process and civil rights. The City
4 concurs with OMH on their interpretation.

5 Before this plan, these removals were done
6 without a coordinated approach across agencies.
7 First responders and clinicians often followed their
8 own protocols that we're usually unknown to one
9 another. With the Mayor's new policy, everyone is
10 working off the same playbook, and ensuring our most
11 vulnerable New Yorkers have an opportunity to be
12 connected to life saving and life changing care.

13 As the Mayor said in November, job one is as
14 follows: New York State law allows us to intervene
15 when it appears that mental illness is preventing an
16 individual from meeting their basic human needs. We
17 must make this universally understood by outreach
18 workers, hospital personnel, and police officers.

19 To that end, the Mayor's New DOHMH, FDNY, EMS,
20 and NYPD directive does two things: Number one, it
21 creates an expedited step-by-step process for
22 involuntary transportation for individuals in crisis.
23 And number two, it states explicitly that in
24 concurrence with OMH, it is appropriate to use this
25 process when individuals appear to be mentally ill
and unable to meet their basic needs.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 37

2 Second, the Mayor also announced enhanced
3 training for outreach workers. This training led by
4 the New York City Health Department in consultation
5 with OMH emphasizes the need for basic needs
6 interventions, and includes engagement strategies to
7 try before resorting to a removal as voluntary
8 transportation is always a goal. Training is already
9 underway.

10 Third, the Mayor announced establishing
11 specialized intervention teams. He announced a
12 special cadre of clinicians and officers to ensure
13 safe transport of those in need of hospitalization.
14 These specialized teams will have the training, the
15 expertise, and the sensitivity to handle these
16 complex cases.

17 Fourth, the Mayor announced creating a new
18 support line staffed by clinicians from Health and
19 Hospitals to provide support and advice to police
20 officers in real time as they consider potential
21 response to individuals with mental health needs.
22 This support line became operational last week.

23 Fifth, the Mayor announced that the city's
24 legislative agenda includes working with state
25 partners to amend the law to make clear that serious

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 38

3 harm includes the harm that comes from an inability
4 to meet basic needs because of mental illness. This
5 would codify court precedent to make this principle
6 widely understood across the state. Additional
7 legislative needs he announced were requiring
8 hospital evaluators to consider all relevant factors
9 such as treatment history and recent behavior, not
10 just how a person presents in the moment, allowing a
11 broader range of mental health professionals to
12 perform hospital evaluations and serve on mobile
13 crisis teams, and requiring Kendra's Law or AOT
14 eligibility screening in hospitals to help our most
15 vulnerable New Yorkers stay engaged in treatment.

16 Importantly, the Mayor's plan does not call for
17 sweeps of people living with mental illness in public
18 spaces. It does not expand the powers of City
19 personnel to transport individuals for hospital
20 evaluation. It does not increase the reliance on
21 police to address untreated Serious Mental Illness.
22 It does not allow for 958-designated clinicians or
23 police officers to involuntarily admit individuals to
24 the hospital, and it does not represent the sole
25 answer to fix our public mental health system.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 39

3 The City will be releasing our Behavioral Health
4 Agenda in early 2023 That covers Serious Mental
5 Illness, youth and family mental health, and
6 preventing overdoses

7 To ensure that we are doing all that we can for
8 our fellow New Yorkers, this work requires an
9 interagency approach to maximize connections to
10 mental health services. All of this work begins with
11 high quality training. For 958-designated
12 clinicians, DOHMH conducts a two-day virtual Section
13 958 training. Trainings include a variety of experts
14 in mental health crisis intervention and risk
15 assessment. At the end of this training, DOHMH
16 confirms the trainees credentials, licensure and
17 employment on an approved mobile crisis outreach
18 team, and issues a DOHMH identification with photo
19 and letter signed by Executive Deputy Commissioner of
20 the Division of Mental Hygiene, designating a person
21 as authorized to direct a 958 removal. These
22 credentials expire every two years and can be renewed
23 by recertifying licensure and employment.

24 DOHMH also conducted refresher training in
25 November focused on clinicians doing outreach on the
subway and streets to ensure that clinicians doing

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 40

3 958 removals understood the guidance from OMH. This
4 included composite vignettes from real situations
5 involving people experiencing street and subway
6 homelessness.

7 This refresher training content will be folded
8 into the regular ongoing 958 designation training
9 curriculum for all eligible clinicians working in
10 mobile outreach teams for housed, unsheltered, and
11 unsheltered individuals. The NYPD trains officers on
12 how to interact with people suffering from a mental
13 health crisis starting at the academy. There, the
14 NYPD has designated modules that provide officers
15 with the skills that they need to make determinations
16 on whether an individual needs to be removed to a
17 hospital pursuant to Mental Hygiene Law Section 941.
18 This training is reinforced throughout an officer's
19 career, through command level training videos, and
20 training at the Academy including during training
21 whenever an officer is promoted to sergeant,
22 lieutenant and captain.

23 Additionally, the NYPD is working to provide all
24 officers with a four-day crisis intervention
25 training, which provides an officer with more in
depth skills when responding to a mental health call.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 41
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 When the Mayor announced this directive, the NYPD
4 added new training that builds upon and reinforces
5 the training officers already receive. This training
6 developed in consultation with OCMH and DOHMH ensures
7 that officers understand the guidance from OMH.

8 To help reinforce this training, NYPD is also
9 producing a training video that all officers must
10 watch. Moving forward, the OMH guidance will be
11 incorporated into existing training.

12 The training for all outreach workers, hospital
13 personnel, and police officers emphasize the
14 importance of using best efforts to encourage the
15 individual to be transported to the hospital
16 voluntarily. To that end, when a 958-designated
17 clinician believes that an individual may be
18 evaluated at a hospital, their first responsibility
19 is to use their clinical skills, where safe and
20 appropriate, to work collaboratively with the
21 individual to secure their voluntary agreement to be
22 taken to the hospital for further evaluation. In the
23 less common cases where an involuntary removal is
24 necessary, the clinician will call for NYPD to assist
25 with this process. In all of these cases, NYPD's

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 42

3 role is to aid the individual in getting to the care
4 that they need.

5 Working with the clinician, EMS and NYPD will
6 effectuate a transport to the hospital. In the case
7 of a Section 958 removal, the decision to remove is
8 solely the clinician's. NYPD and FDNY follow the
9 clinician's lead.

10 In the case of a 941 removal, once again NYPD's
11 role is to aid an individual and getting to the care
12 that they need. When officers determine that an
13 individual is suffering from mental illness and is
14 engaged in behavior that is likely to cause harm to
15 themselves or others, consistent with Section 941,
16 they will work with EMS to bring the individual to
17 the hospital where a physician can do a comprehensive
18 evaluation. To provide additional support to
19 officers in the field, Health and Hospitals is
20 providing a dedicated support line for NYPD officers
21 as they encounter potential 941 situations. This
22 support line is staffed 24/7 by behavioral health
23 clinicians from Health and Hospitals Virtual Express
24 Care Service, who can answer questions and advise
25 officers as they determine whether circumstances

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 43

3 truly call for the last resort of an involuntary
4 removal.

5 Critically Health and Hospital staff also provide
6 NYPD officers with information on other appropriate
7 community and social service resources to consider
8 for those individuals who do not meet the criteria
9 for involuntary removal, or who might otherwise be
10 better served in the community. Importantly, if
11 individuals feature location is predictable, and they
12 appear at no risk of imminent harm, Health and
13 Hospitals might advise sending out a clinician the
14 next day.

15 To reiterate, the 958-designated clinician and
16 the police officer or peace officer in the case of
17 941 removals can only have the individual taken to
18 the hospital for evaluation. They cannot have the
19 individual involuntarily admitted. That is at the
20 sole discretion of the physician at the hospital.

21 Once an individual arrives at the hospital, the
22 958-designated clinician or police officer, assist
23 them in registering and provides information about
24 the reason for the removal to the hospital staff. At
25 that point, the role of the 958-designated clinician,
NYPD, and EMS is complete. Ideally, the hospital

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 44

3 will then obtain additional relevant information on
4 the individual by contacting family members,
5 community providers, and outreach teams, and at that
6 point, conduct a thorough psychiatric evaluation. If
7 necessary, they will admit the patient following
8 Mental Hygiene Law admission criteria. And if not,
9 they will be discharged with a discharge plan that
10 includes follow up care and community resources.

11 All of this work is about ensuring that New
12 Yorkers and psychiatric crisis get the highest level
13 of care that the city can provide. This is a truly
14 health-driven approach, and one that is grounded and
15 trying to connect everyone with the care that they
16 deserve. I thank your committee's for your attention
17 on this important topic, and we're happy to answer
18 any questions that you might have.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great, thank you. So I'm
20 just going to dive right into the questions, and I'll
21 try to keep it brief because I know my colleagues and
22 I are going to tag-team.

23 So thank you so much, again, for being here. So
24 I'm going to focus largely most of my questions to
25 DOHMH as well as OCMH. So if you guys-- but feel

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 45
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 free, you know if anyone wants to jump in to go
4 ahead.

5 So what is DOHMH's opinion for the Mayor's
6 proposed expansion of the legal definition of "likely
7 to result in serious harm"? How do you guys-- what's
8 your interpretation of that? I'll hand that Jamie to
9 respond to.

10 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Red is on.
11 Interesting.

12 I'm actually-- I don't have a legal position on
13 that. I'm sorry to decline your question, but I'm
14 not prepared to take a legal position here on that
15 proposed legislation.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: No. No opinion.
18 I can't comment on the proposed legislation.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, if you could let us know
20 or get back to us, that'd be great, because a lot of
21 the new policies seem to be around this new
22 definition of what it means to "likely result in
23 serious harm." So I think that'd be great to get a
24 better understanding of that.

25 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Will do.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 46

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So in an ideal world, in
4 your informed opinion, as medical and healthcare
5 experts, what would be the best way to approach
6 individuals with SMI who are homeless. Is B-HEARD
7 the ideal model? What about the other co-response
8 teams? If you could speak a little bit to that as
9 well.

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I'll start on
11 that. And I think, you know, for-- for folks who are
12 both homeless and have an SMI, it's going to really
13 depend on-- on the situation, right? I think-- we do
14 have homeless outreach teams through Department of
15 Homeless Services that are skilled in working with
16 folks who are both homeless and have SMI. If someone
17 is --in certainly in a-- in a mental health crisis,
18 B-HEARD within the pilot areas could also be an
19 option, as could mobile crisis teams that are
20 dispatched through NYC-WELL. So we have a wide range
21 of options for folks who are who are homeless, who
22 are seriously mentally ill, and might need connection
23 to support, and much of that actually does start with
24 our DHS homeless outreach teams that are on the
25 ground serving street homeless New Yorkers every day.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 47

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, and I've-- I've asked
4 this before in other-- because I just know from being
5 on the nonprofit social sector side, how not, you
6 know, a lot of times the issues are that city
7 agencies don't always coordinate or communicate with
8 each other. And I know there's a lot of different
9 outreach teams out there. Some are state, with AOT
10 and others, and then others are through the City.
11 DOHMH has one, EMS, DHS, DOH, and there's ICT, IMT,
12 B-HEARD.

13 So how are you all coordinating the outreach
14 teams in terms of who has what, and who responds to
15 what situation? How are you guys communicating with
16 each other?

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I'll get that
18 sorted and see if Jamie wants to add anything on the
19 DOHMH-specific teams. But many-- much of it relies
20 on, you know, how an individual might come to-- come
21 to the attention of the city. So you know, certainly
22 if someone is in a mental health crisis, and they
23 call NYC-WELL, they are likely to get a mobile crisis
24 team. If they're street homeless, they might get a
25 homeless outreach team. And I think within the
confines of-- certainly within the confines of the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 48
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 law and being able to share information, that
4 information is shared, I think across agencies,
5 right?, especially when there are multiple
6 touchpoints for singular individuals across different
7 teams.

8 And I think there's a-- there's certainly a
9 difference between kind of our, our mobile teams that
10 are kind of doing outreach, so our DHS teams, even
11 our mobile crisis teams, our B-HEARD teams, kind of
12 our longer-term treatment teams like our ACT Teams,
13 our Assertive Community Treatment Teams, and our
14 Intensive Mobile Treatment Teams, or IMT teams, which
15 provide kind of that longer-term treatment. But
16 within-- I think within the confines of law, all of
17 them are trying to work together to-- to serve those
18 individuals. And we are constantly I think, talking
19 about how to improve that system and make sure that
20 the right individuals are getting the right
21 touchpoint at the right time.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: So what does that handoff look
23 like though? So for example, if someone comes in and
24 originally is on the short-term team, let's just say
25 for treatment, crisis treatment, and then it turns

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 49
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 out that they need longer term care. So how does
4 that handoff happen? And what does that look like?

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I'll actually
6 hand that to Jamie, and maybe give an example of
7 moving from a mobile crisis team to maybe like an ACT
8 Team, how that would work out.

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Yeah. So crisis
10 intervention services are, you know, they're
11 providing de-escalation in the moment, sometimes
12 transporting to the hospital for a higher level of
13 care, as we've talked about, but most often
14 connecting to ongoing community based treatment.
15 That is their main mission. And the most sort of
16 successful outcome that we can see for a mobile
17 crisis intervention team is connection to ongoing
18 care. So that looks different for you know,
19 different people in different situations. And
20 they'll usually make an appointment, and help the
21 person get to the appointment if needed, and confirm
22 that connection to care before closing out a case.
23 So-- so a crisis intervention steam, you know, main,
24 you know, focus, is that that linkage to community-
25 based care.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 50

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And actually, you
4 brought up a good point, Mr. Hansman, which is a
5 perfect segue to my next question about the 911
6 operators.

7 And just out of curiosity, if I could just take a
8 poll of the room, how many of you are familiar with
9 988? Okay, good. Well, I'm probably speaking to the
10 choir here.

11 But I think a lot of folks are not aware of 988
12 and-- and when to call 988 versus 911. And then,
13 when people call 911, I think the issue becomes that
14 oftentimes, it's up to the operators who answer the
15 calls to navigate which mental health type of crisis
16 to direct the calls to.

17 So just out of curiosity, what does-- what
18 guidance does DOHMH or H&H provide to operators on
19 how to navigate the mental health crisis calls?

20 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Sure. So 988 is
21 a three-digit number to connect to a local crisis
22 hotline. In New York City, that local crisis hotline
23 is NYC-WELL, so you can either dial 1-888-NYC-WELL,
24 or 988. You get to the same place, the same cadre of
25 trained crisis counselors, who will do risk
assessment and connect the person to, you know, maybe

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 51
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS
3 on the phone, telephonic risk assessment, or
4 connection to a mobile crisis team, dispatch the most
5 appropriate team citywide, so that the caller doesn't
6 have to be expert, the caller doesn't have to
7 remember all these different three and four, you
8 know, letter acronyms. The caller doesn't have to
9 decide, is this right or wrong. The counselor will
10 use his or her skills to, to gather information and
11 make the next step. Often, you know, these are
12 referrals to in-person Crisis Response Teams.
13 sometimes it's a handoff to 911 if there is an
14 emergency and-- and a need for an ambulance response,
15 for example. So that-- the burden is not on-- on the
16 on the general public, right? We have trained
17 counselors who can help make these decisions.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: And as-- just real
20 quick, as for the difference between, for instance,
21 911 or 988 or NYC-WELL, we advise people call 911
22 when there is an immediate emergency, when a person
23 is in immediate risk of hurting themselves or others,
24 or is in imminent danger because of a health
25 condition or other situation. Anything beyond that
is appropriate for NYC-WELL, and then to that point

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 52
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 that Jamie made, they can make that determination on
4 the call if it does need to get escalated to 911.

5 I'll make one other point just about 988, and
6 about, you know, where you're calling from and what
7 your area code might be. It is true that if you call
8 from a New York City Area code 988, you're going to
9 get NYC-WELL, what if you call from outside of New
10 York City, you're likely to get the-- the mental
11 health hotline for that city that you're that you're
12 calling from in your area code.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So moving on to the 958
14 trainings: Has the agency designed delivered and
15 updated the 958 trainings for the participating
16 agencies? And if yes, what agencies have received
17 the training? What does the training consist of?
18 And if not, when do you anticipate the training to
19 get up and running?

20 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So yes, trainings for
21 958 have been updated at DOHMH, and that NYPD. So
22 both of those trainings are already underway at this
23 moment.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And also has the agency
25 began conducting the 958 trainings for clinicians who
will be part of the outreach teams?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 53

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yes, there was-- there
4 was an updated training in November of 2022 for the
5 clinicians.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So in terms of-- I know,
7 the Public Advocate mentioned continuum of care, and
8 that like that language speaks to my heart, because
9 coming from the nonprofit CBO side of things, I just
10 want to give a shout out to anyone here who is
11 providing services in the community, on the ground,
12 because you all are doing amazing work and are our
13 key to community services. And I just want to make a
14 note also that that doesn't even capture the
15 culturally-competent language barrier folks that have
16 LEPs that are not even anywhere in the system.

17 And so I think that's a continuous issue that we
18 need to address because we have so many languages
19 that we speak in the city. And so how do we increase
20 the caseworkers and the folks that speak all these
21 diverse languages? So I just wanted to put that out
22 there. But, you know, we all know that peer
23 services, CBO nonprofit services, even if they're
24 not, quote/unquote, "clinical" by definition, that--
25 those are all services that statistically are
evidence-based to prove someone's success in care.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 54
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 So how are you coordinating with the CBOs?

4 Because I know that there was a nonprofit resiliency
5 committee at one point that partnered with agencies,
6 but are you actively engaging a task force that have
7 CBO partners that are included to really inform a lot
8 of this care, because I think oftentimes, where I got
9 frustrated was that someone would be in an inpatient
10 and not get referred out properly.

11 And so how do we better utilize our nonprofit
12 sector, you know, organizations and-- and handoff
13 those services, and if you could, you know, provide a
14 list not necessarily today, but of groups that you do
15 partner with, because I personally would love to see
16 who it is that you're working with in the community.
17 But if you could speak a little bit more to the
18 partnership there.

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I think what I
20 would say just to-- to Jamie's previous point about,
21 I think the role of our crisis services, and even in
22 hospitals, it is about getting to that next level of
23 treatment and services and to community providers.
24 That is a critical part of all of our-- all of our
25 crisis workers-- all of our interactions with
individuals is to get them to-- to community

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 55
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 providers. And this policy itself was driven, at
4 least in part by conversations with-- with community
5 providers, as well, especially our providers who are
6 working with this population, day in and day out,
7 which we continue to hear from about, you know,
8 individuals that are experiencing a Serious Mental
9 Illness and-- and can't get connected to care. So I
10 think we're continuing that work. And we will--
11 we'll get back to you about providing a list of-- of
12 community providers.

13 And I'm not sure if, Jamie, you want to add
14 anything or Omar.

15 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: I can add to
16 that. Sure. So at DOHMH we-- we develop and deliver
17 the training that leads to designating qualified
18 physicians or mental health professionals to direct
19 958 removals. Most of the clinicians that we're
20 training are working on community-- within CBO-- CBOs
21 that are in contract with the city and/or licensed by
22 the State Office of Mental Health.

23 So the vast majority of clinicians who are doing
24 this work are based in CBOs based within the
25 communities that they're serving. I'm also happy to
say that we added dedicated peer lines, roles. They

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 56
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 are specialist roles to our mobile crisis teams a
4 couple of years ago. So all those teams have peer
5 perspectives folded into their crisis response work.
6 And of course, NYC-WELL has an option to talk to two
7 peers as well, and about 20% of people who call in to
8 NYC-WELL opt to speak to a peer specialist. And so I
9 think we've done-- you know, we have a long way to go
10 but we've gone a long way already in terms of making
11 peer services and peer perspectives and greater
12 language diversity available through all of our
13 crisis response services.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, thank you. So I'll yield
15 the rest of my time and ask questions later. Follow
16 up if I have any, but I wanted to hand it off to
17 Councilmember Narcisse, if you have any questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Before I get to the
19 question, I want to make sure that we address the
20 Intro 273 will require the training for the NYPD. At
21 the end of the day it's to make sure the officers are
22 safe, and the person that the provided care is safe
23 as well, is to train them how to interact with
24 someone with autism, and recognizing it, and getting
25 skilled to deal with that.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 57

3 It will require our police force to undergo this
4 training and could possibly save lives, right?

5 Traditional tactics and approaches that would work
6 for neurotypical people may not work for people with
7 autism.

8 As a nurse for over three decades, I'm sure that
9 I have done with so many individuals, that you will
10 think that the person is okay by their appearance,
11 but the person is really dealing. It's not only for
12 autism, but mostly I want to focus on autism, because
13 so many times things could have been prevented.

14 So I hope all my colleagues will join as a matter
15 of fact signing and supporting this piece of
16 legislation. And most importantly, I did not do it
17 by myself. I have to thank some terrific folks,
18 community partners, who helped get this legislation
19 to this point, ADAPT community network, Brooklyn
20 Conservatory of Music, My Time Inc, YAI, and Michael
21 from the NYPD Legislative Team that helped us to get
22 through this great journey, to make sure that we
23 address those vulnerable folks in our community.

24 And of course, thanks to my dynamic Colleague of
25 Staten Island, Councilwoman Hanks, and her
legislative team. That was very-- that worked

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 58
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 closely with my team, Chief of Staff Sai Yee. Thank
4 you.

5 And, um, I have a couple of quick questions by
6 listening.

7 Has anyone been taking into custody under this
8 initiative that we're talking about right now?

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll note that, you
10 know, 958 and 941, the longstanding law that has been
11 used and is used by mobile crisis teams, by mobile
12 crisis outreach teams, and NYPD.

13 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Okay, since it was
14 announced, I'm talking about going back to November
15 after the Mayor made the announcement, did anybody
16 been...?

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: There have certainly
18 been-- been individuals who have been involuntary
19 removed under 941 and 958 since the announcement.

20 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Have all NYPD officers and
21 FDNY EMS been trained to recognize the behaviors that
22 could initiate involuntary removal? If so, how long
23 was the training, and what did it include?

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So training has begun
25 at NYPD and I'll hand it to my NYPD colleagues to
give some further details.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 59

2 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Good morning.

3 CHIEF HOLMES: Good morning, everyone. Good
4 morning Chair. So yes, training has begun at NYPD.
5 There are several trainees that's been conducted.
6 Since this initiative was-- was brought to our
7 attention to directive by the Mayor in November, as a
8 result of such there was a telephonic communication
9 put forward that this was up and coming. There was
10 also the creation of a training. This training was
11 dear to my heart, especially the language surrounding
12 it, the individuals delivering it, and more
13 importantly, the comprehension of the men and women,
14 the end users.

15 And as a result of such we had a roll-call
16 training. Naturally the primary goal, voluntary
17 compliance, voluntary compliance. I can't say that
18 enough. I don't use the term removal. The term that
19 I like is voluntary and involuntary transports, and I
20 thought it just had a more softer connotation. We
21 have learning outcomes, understanding effective
22 crisis communication, to assist with those voluntary
23 transports, recognizing the legal authorities and
24 department policy involving involuntary transports,
25 and naturally understanding the Mental Hygiene Law

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 60
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS
3 958 and 941, recognizing situations that may
4 necessitate the involuntary transport of an
5 individual who is mental-- is mentally ill and a
6 danger to themselves or others or not capable of self
7 care. And a lot of those factors we're surrounded
8 about around what is mental health crisis? What does
9 that look like? And naturally, sometimes its
10 behavior, speech, and just the-- the thought
11 contents.

12 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: So how long was the
13 training?

14 CHIEF HOLMES: The training is given at roll
15 call. That particular training is about 25 minutes
16 of training, lecture, both discussion and
17 interactive.

18 In addition to that, there's a video to assure
19 compliance. So roll call training is about 88%.
20 That's now cease and desist because the video was
21 uploaded. And the video now is at 60% of the agency,
22 but know that 88% of the agency operational has been
23 trained in that training, 60% of the same individuals
24 that received the roll call training. The video
25 ensures compliance that everyone had it-- has it, so
it allows us to collect that data.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 61

2 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: There is a special unit
3 that you have to respond, right?

4 CHIEF HOLMES: It's not-- it's all.

5 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Or is it all officers? So
6 how many officers that you have?

7 CHIEF HOLMES: So currently -- I'll get the
8 number -- the department's about 33,000. So all--
9 everyone's going to be trained in it.

10 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: How many have been trained
11 to date?

12 CHIEF HOLMES: How many have been trained?

13 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: To date.

14 CHIEF HOLMES: Operational?

15 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Mm-hmm.

16 CHIEF HOLMES: I do have the numbers one second.

17 Okay, so on patrol, we have 16,436, and over
18 8000. Transit has completed 91% of all transit
19 officers, 89% of housing officers-- and forgive me
20 87% of all patrol officers. I apologize. 14,461 out
21 of the 16,436 have been trained.

22 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Thank you.

23 CHIEF HOLMES: You're welcome.

24 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: Reports show that one out
25 of five New Yorkers have symptoms of mental health

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 62
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 disorder. With rates so high why are NYPD CIT
4 training figures lagging behind?

5 CHIEF HOLMES: Right. So the CIT training now is
6 currently at 17,000-plus, but we've had some
7 retirements and resignations. So it's 13,000-plus,
8 but that's in-service training. So there is a large
9 amount of people trained in it. And I apologize it
10 started in 2015. Every recruit attends CIT training.
11 So all of our recruits that have graduated since 2015
12 has that training as well, in addition to the 13,000-
13 plus.

14 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: With many facilities
15 reporting that their psych beds at full capacity,
16 especially in New York, in Manhattan, right? How do
17 we anticipate being able to accommodate the flux of
18 patients into the system.

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll hand it over to
20 Dr. Fattal to talk a little bit more about the--
21 about the hospital bed situation in New York.

22 DR. FATTAL: Good morning. So we-- I can speak
23 for H&H. Obviously, we are the largest provider of
24 behavioral services in New York, including inpatient
25 beds, but we're not the only providers. So there are
other providers as well. We have about 1000-- a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 63
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 little bit more than 1000 beds that are open right
4 now. And we have plans to reopen up to 200 beds by
5 the end of 2023. And to know that since that
6 announcement in November, we have not seen an
7 increase in emergency room visits to our ERs.

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll also note that the
9 Governor did make an announcement to push hospitals
10 to reopen the beds that have been closed since 2020.
11 Throughout, I think the remainder of this year and
12 next year, to kind of help with that situation of
13 hospital bed availability.

14 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: I got that understanding.
15 That's why I say thank you to her and the Mayor as
16 well for putting-- pushing forward. We know it is
17 not at the capacity we would like to see it.

18 The standard for detention appeared to be a very
19 broad and potentially open our city up to Civil
20 Rights lawsuits. Has the Corporation Council or
21 other city attorney issued an opinion to this plan to
22 you.

23 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: They have reviewed the
24 policy, yes.

25 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: They did? Okay.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 64
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 If this percentage of New Yorkers suffered from
4 mental illness, why can't we get 100% training,
5 coming back to you, to CIT.

6 CHIEF HOLMES: Well CIT is four-day training. So
7 naturally it's very challenging when members of the
8 service still have to do what we do. And it's a
9 smaller class. And we're aiming for that.
10 Naturally, that's a primary goal. But it's 30
11 individuals to a class, it's co-training. So we're
12 relying on licensed medical clinicians, as far as
13 community partners, but with that it's a more
14 intimate training, right? We want them to have a
15 clearer understanding of what this really is when it
16 comes to crisis.

17 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: All right. So we're
18 looking forward for the 100%. Do they anticipate--
19 do you anticipate, right?, not our side, you-- do you
20 anticipate that this initiative will cause an
21 increase in patients?

22 CHIEF HOLMES: Will it cause an increase in
23 patients? Absolutely. You say that-- what? Can you
24 hear me? Oh. I thought it was you.

25 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: That's all right.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 65
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah. So here's what
4 I-- here's what I-- I'll hand it over to Dr. Fattal
5 in a moment. But what I might say is-- you know,
6 this-- this initiative, and this-- this new plan of
7 looking at involuntary removals is very new, right?
8 So it was announced in November of 2022. And we are
9 still looking at-- we're still looking at data. And
10 what I might also add is that removals in and of
11 themselves are not necessarily the measure of success
12 that we're-- that we're using. We are looking at
13 really-- we're looking at all manner of engagement
14 and ensuring that you know, our partners, both at you
15 know, DOHMH, and Health and Hospitals, at NYPD, and
16 FDNY are having this culture of engagement, not just
17 on the removals themselves, but on engaging folks in
18 in treatment, in long-term treatment.

19 I'll let Dr. Fattal talk about what-- what
20 they've been seeing on the-- on the H&H side. But I
21 did want to make that note about-- it's not
22 necessarily entirely about increasing the number of
23 involuntary removals, but about the engagement of
24 folks who are experiencing a mental health crisis, or
25 Serious Mental Illness, and have that, you know,
that-- that potential for danger to self or others.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 66
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. I agree 100%. And since
4 November, we have not seen an increase in the number
5 of patients coming to our emergency room. But we do
6 have plans to reopen up to 200 beds in the coming
7 year by end of 2023. And that's because of this
8 initiative and other initiatives that are being
9 rolled out by the City and the State. So we want to
10 be prepared in case there is an increase in demand.
11 And we are keeping a very close eye on this. And
12 we're very committed to meeting the need if it does
13 go up.

14 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: My last question: They say
15 out there in newspapers that folks are getting into
16 the hospital, but they are discharged too fast before
17 they get stabilized. What do you think, coming from
18 the H&H?

19 DR. FATTAL: Yeah, I mean, it's hard to comment
20 because every-- you know, we have thousands of
21 discharges to the ER, so it's very hard to comment on
22 a specific case. Every one is different. But when
23 it comes to this initiative, we take it very
24 seriously, because it takes sometimes hours and days,
25 sometimes weeks to actually plan a removal. So we--
once we get the removal to our facility, we take that

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 67
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 very seriously. We make sure that we do a thorough
4 psychiatric evaluation and assessment. But also,
5 more importantly, we make sure that we connect that
6 patient with community resources and a follow up plan
7 before we discharge them.

8 So I think the key is not the timing, it could be
9 quick or delayed. But the idea is we want to make
10 sure when we discharge people that they have a
11 discharge plan, and that they're connected with
12 outpatient services and community resources that they
13 need to stay in treatment.

14 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: What-- I said it was my
15 last, but something just popped in my head. The
16 discharge planning: Do you actually communicate,
17 making sure that the folks understand their discharge
18 planning before they leave the hospital?

19 DR. FATTAL: You mean the patients?

20 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: The patients.

21 DR. FATTAL: Definitely. We start discharge
22 planning on day one. And that's something that we
23 you know, work with the patients, but also with
24 families or their support systems. Most of our
25 patients have a caseworker or other people in their
lives who are involved in their treatment. So we

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 68
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 make sure that we include them as well in the
4 planning of the discharge itself. So this is not a
5 one-way communication. This is something that we
6 work on collaboratively with the patient and whoever
7 they have in their lives.

8 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: I'm going to leave it as
9 that. But the communication have to be clearly, both
10 for the patient and person that is discharging the
11 individuals. Thank you.

12 DR. FATTAL: Sure. You're welcome.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Sorry. I just want to
14 recognize we've been joined by Councilmembers
15 Stevens, Ayala, Riley, and Councilmember Brooks-
16 Powers. And with that, I'll hand it off to
17 Councilmember Hanks. Chair Hanks, I'm sorry.

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: That's okay. Thank you,
19 Chair Lee. I appreciate it.

20 Thank you. I kind of want to, you know, put my
21 questions more towards giving a little background to
22 how we got here. And then, as my colleagues, I
23 think, one of the most important pieces is going to
24 be the recognition of someone who is mentally ill,
25 and what is the training for officers?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 69

3 So my first question is, how many 911 Mental
4 Health calls were-- were there between 2021 and 2019?
5 And do you see any trends of calling increasing
6 during COVID?

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'll hand it over to
8 NYPD.

9 CHIEF TOBIN: Good morning Chair. In 2020-- in
10 2019, where you first referenced, there were 171,490
11 calls. In 2020, there were 161,268 calls. So there
12 was a reduction of 911 calls during COVID in 2020.
13 In 2021, there were 166,487, and in 2020, to 176,311.

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. So how many of
15 these 911 health calls resulted in emergency
16 dispatch, and how many calls were referred to other
17 resources like NYC-WELL or other community-based
18 services?

19 CHIEF TOBIN: So all mental health calls result
20 in an emergency dispatch. The only exception to this
21 as the B-HEARD pilot presence where NYPD will not
22 dispatch alongside FDNY EMS, unless there is
23 violence, there is a weapon, or imminent risk of harm
24 to self or others.

25 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay. So of the calls to the
police civilian encounters, how often are people

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 70

3 designated, quote/unquote, "emotionally disturbed"
4 and what implications does that carry?

5 CHIEF TOBIN: Could you repeat that?

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So of the calls to police and
7 civilian encounters, how many people are designated
8 as emotionally disturbed persons? Because I think
9 you touched on it a little bit when you said there
10 was a weapon, I mean, because we want to make that
11 distinction.

12 CHIEF TOBIN: So in 2022, of the 7,170,174 calls
13 to 911 176,311, which was 2.5%, were mental health
14 calls.

15 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay.

16 CHIEF TOBIN: The NYPD continues to respond along
17 FDNY EMS to mental health calls and to assist in
18 transporting to the hospital for mental health
19 evaluation if necessary.

20 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay. So of these calls in
21 these civilian police encounters, how often does it
22 lead to an individual being arrested and for what
23 charges?

24 CHIEF TOBIN: Sure, in 2022, approximately 1% of
25 all mental health calls resulted in an arrest. Most
of the arrests were resulting from EDP calls, or for

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 71
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 charges such as assault 3 -- which does not include
4 assaults on police officers or EMS -- criminal
5 contempt, violating an order of protection, and
6 menacing. Many of the calls that we go to are
7 actually domestic incidents when we must arrest the
8 individual due to the violation of an order of
9 protection, or if an arrest must be made to prevent
10 further violence and to ensure the safety of all
11 members.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So when we've talked about
13 the, you know, how you testify that officers are
14 trained, and for people suffering mental health
15 crisis, and you have these dedicated modules. Is
16 there a differentiation in that training where
17 there's a difference between mentally disturbed
18 person who needs to be, as you say, transported, and
19 someone who was transported or and or arrested, and
20 how does that training differentiate?

21 CHIEF HOLMES: So the training that was put in
22 place as a result of the Mayor's directive
23 encompasses "not capable of self care," right? So
24 that's something different. It's always been there.
25 I think it's something that we weren't really, really
focused on when it came to 9.41.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 72
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 But with that being said, that training is really
4 designed to remind them of that particular aspect
5 when you're transporting. But when you speak about
6 arrests -- and that's why the percentage is so low, 1
7 percent, when it comes to this -- when you're
8 speaking about arrests, when it comes to the
9 community of mental health crisis, nine times out of
10 10 there's no arrest as a result of the officer being
11 assaulted. It's a protective community, it's a
12 person in crisis. And it kind of, for lack of a
13 better term, it comes with the territory, meaning
14 comes with the job. So if the officer is injured as
15 a result of that particular encounter, then it's what
16 we call a line-of-duty injury. It's not an arrest,
17 but, you know, made because of that, if that makes
18 sense.

19 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much. So the
20 other question I have is in regard to when you're in-
21 - when NYPD officers are in this engagement, do we
22 have any guidance on whether officers are engaging
23 with the person who's being removed for
24 hospitalization, or whether they're resisting arrest?
25 Is there a difference? Because if they're...?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 73
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 CHIEF HOLMES: So-- so it's not-- it really isn't
4 a difference, you know, as far as I'm concerned, you
5 know, officers are trained in de-escalation, active
6 listening. Naturally, if they have-- if it comes to
7 someone's safety, you may need to take some sort of
8 immediate action. There is non-lethal devices that
9 they're trained in. The one thing about the New York
10 City Police Department, largest city agency, allows
11 for quick response 24/7. But we're equipped and
12 trained, and not just for the individual that's in
13 crisis, but also for all the partners that are
14 responding to the scene that don't have these-- that
15 particular type of equipment.

16 DIRECTOR CLARKE: And I think that's part of the
17 training as well to--

18 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: It's like a laser shot on--
19 on the training component--

20 CHIEF HOLMES: Yes it is. That's part of the
21 training.

22 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: --and how to make those
23 differentiations.

24 CHIEF HOLMES: Yes.

25 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Right. And I think just to
build on what Chief Holmes was saying. It's part of

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 74
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 the training is-- I think your question earlier was,
4 you're responding to a person with a gun, you're
5 responding to a past crime, responding to a person in
6 a mental health crisis. All three trainings are
7 different on how to handle that situation, right?

8 And when you're responding to mental health crisis,
9 you're trained specifically for that, and part of
10 that is understanding that people may be struggling,
11 maybe violent, may act out towards you, and how to
12 handle that, with de-escalation, with compassion,
13 working with everything we can to get a voluntary
14 transmission, transported back to the hospital, in
15 order to de-escalate that situation.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you. What is the
17 current status of the CIT training and the future
18 plans for the training program going forward? But
19 I'm sorry, first I wanted to ask how many officers
20 have completed this crisis intervention team training
21 between 2022 and like 2016. The training was first
22 implemented in 2015. We currently have 17,000 plus,
23 which resulted in 3000, with some resigning or
24 retiring, so currently, it's about 13,400 that are
25 trained in that particular training. That's in
service. So I relate in service to people that are

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 75
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 already NYPD officers. We bring them back for
4 additional training.

5 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay.

6 CHIEF HOLMES: But we still have the graduates,
7 since 2015, up until current that have received that
8 training. That's not-- that number is not
9 encompassed in that. And I apologize for not having
10 the exact number of graduates, but I can get that to
11 you.

12 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So does the department
13 anticipate reaching a point where all officers have
14 received the training? And if so, do we have like a
15 timeline on what that looks like?

16 CHIEF HOLMES: So that is the primary goal. I
17 don't have a timeline, being it is so small in
18 nature, the classes are consisting of 30 members,
19 usually on a 4-day particular training, but that is
20 the primary goal, that everyone's trained in that.
21 We also have training-- roll call training. So
22 that's given every three to four months on de-
23 escalation, active listening. You know, it's not the
24 whole, comprised crisis intervention training, but
25 it's key components of that training that's given on
a regular to all members of service.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 76
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you.

4 CHIEF HOLMES: You're welcome.

5 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: So, okay, so we asked those
6 questions as far as the training is concerned.

7 So does the department plan to update the patrol
8 guide on these trainings? And if so, in what way
9 will procedures change?

10 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Yeah, so we did is initially we
11 put out a message to all the officers, alerting them
12 to the standard, that is the new standard. We are in
13 the process of updating our patrol guide procedure,
14 and we anticipate that coming out in the coming
15 weeks.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Okay, thank you. That's all
17 for right now. I'll pass it back to Chair Lee.
18 Thank you so much. Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: To Chair Ariola. Sorry.
20 Before I begin, I just want to recognize we've been
21 joined by Councilmember Brewer as well. So Chair
22 Ariola, please take it away with your questions.

23 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Thank you Chairs. My
24 questions are for Fire Department EMS. How many EMS
25 personnel have received training in de-escalation
and/or self defense in other-- and any other

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 77
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 specialized training for responding to calls for
4 people in crisis?

5 CHIEF FIELDS: So of the 4300 EMTs and
6 paramedics, 99% have received the 12-hour course on
7 de-escalation and self defense, 28% have received the
8 second module of the same training, and there's a
9 total of five modules.

10 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: You anticipated my question.
11 Thank you.

12 Mayor Adams's directive says the MPs must
13 transport the individual to the closest appropriate
14 hospital. What does "appropriate hospital" mean?
15 And are certain hospital facilities designated as
16 such?

17 CHIEF FIELDS: Yes. So we deal with CCC
18 categories. That's in respect to mental health. So
19 if a hospital has mental health capabilities and
20 they're not on diversion, that will be the
21 appropriate hospital.

22 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Is there a collaboration
23 between FDNY and NYPD in creating operational
24 guidelines regarding mental health calls, and-- and
25 removals?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 78

3 CHIEF FIELDS: Currently we're in the process of
4 updating the protocols. So we don't have anything
5 that's current that I'm aware of. But we are working
6 to develop the program. We anticipate that March,
7 the second week of March, we should have everything
8 finalized.

9 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: But there is a
10 collaboration, or at least contact, even though it's
11 not finalized in written form, you do work
12 collaboratively when 911 calls go out.

13 CHIEF FIELDS: Oh 100%. Definitely. So that's
14 pretty much-- we work collaboratively with NYPD on
15 daily operations, especially when dealing with mental
16 health crisis on a daily basis.

17 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, and how often do
18 voluntary hospital units respond to an EDP incident?
19 Would you have that data?

20 CHIEF FIELDS: No, I don't have that data but the
21 voluntaries are 30% of the 911 system, so they do
22 respond to the priority 7 psychological mental crisis
23 calls.

24 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay. And when you are in
25 the middle of a hospital transport of an emotionally
disturbed person, does the police officer accompany

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 79
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 you to the to the hospital every time? Do they
4 accompany the ambulance?

5 CHIEF FIELDS: Every time? I'm trying not to
6 live in the world of definitives. Should they? Yes,
7 they should. But I can't attest to every time.

8 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: What happens when you-- when
9 you arrive at a scene with a with an EDP, and you're
10 faced with an EDP that has a weapon, and PD is-- is
11 en route. How does the EMS handle at that point?

12 CHIEF FIELDS: Our EMS members are taught to
13 retreat. So they should retreat to a safe distance,
14 and get an ETA for NYPD as well as supervision to
15 that location.

16 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: Okay, I appreciate your
17 answers, Chief Fields. And that's it for me. Thanks
18 so much, everyone.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

20 CHAIRPERSON ARIOLA: For now.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yes. For now. I think all of
22 us have more questions, but I'm going to hand it off
23 to our colleagues also for questions. So first we
24 have Councilmember Barron, followed by Councilmember
25 Cabán, and then Powers. So-- How many minutes? Two

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 80
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 minutes. So if you guys could limit it to two
4 minutes each with some wiggle room.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BARRON: Thank you very much and I
6 find these hearings incredible, how you can come
7 before us and not even have a list of the community
8 organizations that you're funding. This is a serious
9 here, and "I'll get back to you," and then have the
10 police department fumble on voluntarily/involuntary.
11 I think that was incredible. "I don't support the
12 involuntary thing." "They voluntarily got--" and
13 those who do go and voluntarily, come on now you know
14 that kind of flip flop and double talk I find
15 incredible.

16 Also the Mayor's definition-- he wants to
17 redefine, you know, what is considered serious--
18 "likely to result in serious harm." That has to be
19 redefined. What does that redefinition going to
20 mean?

21 And on a very serious note, I don't think a
22 police officer who hasn't been psychiatrically
23 evaluated themselves should be in the streets with a
24 nine millimeter Glock, a laser, and a baton, dealing
25 with people who are mentally challenged or having
some difficulties.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 81
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 I think you need to put something-- or do you
4 have something in your program to evaluate each and
5 every police officer on their mental state? Because
6 I've been around them. I've been around them and
7 when they get this little herd mentality, they go
8 crazy. And they very dangerous. So I think this is
9 a dangerous proposition.

10 A few more things and don't finished.

11 For my colleagues, stop complimenting the
12 governor so much on what she's given to mental health
13 and the Mayor. We haven't even gone through the
14 budgets yet. And already, 27.5 million for 1000
15 beds? Beds that they took away during the pandemic
16 and gave it there, and shut down the mental health
17 beds. I was in the State Assembly. And I saw what
18 they did with mental health in the State Assembly.
19 So when someone comes before us-- [Bell rings] Just a
20 few more seconds and I'll be finished. When someone
21 comes before us with a \$227 billion budget, and you
22 compliment her for 27.5 million and 1000 more beds,
23 when we need 10 times as much as that, is an insult
24 to our intelligence.

25 So I think we should be stronger on those who
have planned to fund this program.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 82
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 And then finally, you know, in my dealing with
4 this issue over the years: Peter Funches, years ago,
5 murdered by police, mentally challenged. Eleanor
6 Bumpers, in the Bronx. Her eviction notice was a
7 shotgun blast. And they said, "Well, it was done
8 rapidly." So the first blast blew her hand off that
9 they claimed she had a knife. So why the second one
10 that blew a hole in her chest and killed her.
11 Deborah Danner, also killed. Saheed Vassell killed.
12 I can go on the rest of this hearing, talking about
13 all the people that were killed by police.

14 So I think that this is a dangerous proposition
15 that you're presenting here. If we don't do
16 something about getting peer intervention more than
17 you, I'm fearful that there'll be more death as it--
18 as opposed to a solution to this problem.

19 And finally, poverty and mental illness is
20 connected. So if the Mayor really wants to deal with
21 mental illness, deal with poverty, deal with
22 homelessness, deal with the real issues, the root
23 causes to mental illness. We're not born this way.
24 Conditions drive people to make the decisions, and
25 their state of mind is to conditions, and for us to
26 have \$102.7 billion budget in the city and a \$227

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 83
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 billion budget in the state, it is unconscionable and
4 unacceptable that we allow poverty to exist the way
5 it is.

6 So I just think your proposal is dangerous. And
7 I think that you should be more prepared when you
8 come before us to address the issues. Thank you.

9 [APPLAUSE]

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Councilmember.

11 Okay, so just as a reminder, you guys actually
12 were ahead of me. Instead of clapping, we usually do
13 this in the chambers. And so thank you. You know,
14 you did-- you guys are good.

15 So thank you so much, Councilmember Barron, next
16 we-- oh, before we move on, sorry. I just wanted to
17 recognize we've been joined by Councilmembers Mealy,
18 Yeger, and Rivera.

19 [To others:] Oh, yes, I do. Okay, sorry.

20 And so next we have Councilmember Cabán followed
21 by Councilmember Powers.

22 And I know two minutes is not a long time, but we
23 have a long list of folks who are testifying today,
24 so please stick to it as much as possible, thank you.

25 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you Chairs. So I
just want to start by commenting on, or addressing

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 84
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 some of what was testified to today. And-- and also
4 just a blanket statement that, you know, when-- when
5 there is a mental health crisis occurring, the life-
6 threatening emergency is the wrong response, and we
7 have to keep that at the forefront.

8 And we're sending street response because other
9 systems have failed. And I know, I certainly am, and
10 there are lots of folks here committed to this, we're
11 not going to continue to watch people die on the
12 responder side, but we have to address the upstream,
13 where the investments need to happen.

14 And to put like a real emphasis on it, that
15 treatment response needs to be a medical response,
16 not a police response, a medical response. And it--
17 and I have had the privilege of traveling to
18 different cities to see how they address their mental
19 health crisis on the ground. And what I have learned
20 from those places, including from their police
21 chiefs, I must say, that it needs to be big enough to
22 be effective, which means more funding, which means
23 you cannot cut the DHS budget that-- that's
24 happening. You cannot cut DHS which is in the
25 proposed budget. You cannot cut B-HEARD and all
these other things while the NYPD budget stays

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 85
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 intact. So it has to be big enough to be effective.

4 It has to be nimble enough to be effective. And it

5 has to be separate from the police.

6 But I do want to address your testimony. There

7 was-- there was an emphasis by you all that, you

8 know, it's a physician at the hospital making the

9 termination?

10 Well, I had the opportunity to speak to a street

11 outreach mental health professional that works with

12 the City that does co-response work, and told me that

13 the thresholds are different. That the thresholds

14 for them on the street when they're making an

15 assessment is not the same threshold that the doctor

16 in the emergency room is using.

17 And so what happens is, is that somebody is

18 agitated, they are upset, they are involuntarily

19 brought to a hospital, they don't meet the hospital

20 threshold, they are left where they're at, and

21 oftentimes, obviously, we know the intersection of

22 our homeless population and folks that are struggling

23 with mental health issues. That is a real gap and a

24 real problem that is not being accounted for.

25 In addition to that, you testified important--

quote, "importantly, that the Mayor's plan does not

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 86
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 call for sweeps of people living with mental illness
4 from public places." But again, the intersection
5 between our homeless population and the mental health
6 population is such that you cannot ignore the fact
7 that he does direct sweeps of homeless encampments.
8 That includes sweeps of people experiencing mental
9 health issues.

10 And I would just like a few more seconds to
11 address the testimony. You know, for-- for agency,
12 testimony that says that they will not be relying
13 increasingly on police to undress this, three
14 quarters of the testimony given here today was
15 focused on trying to convince us that the police had
16 the tools to do this job. That tells a very
17 different story. And we know that police make up 20%
18 of the city's entire workforce. That is a problem.

19 I say all this to say that we have to make sure
20 that we are building out a continuum of care that we
21 have the right workers responding to this, and it is
22 not reflected by the line items in the budget. I am
23 deeply, deeply concerned about the plan that's being
24 presented.

25 And I will ask one question, can you share data
on how many mental health involuntary removals the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 87

3 NYPD does per year, the locations of where people are
4 removed from, and what hospitals they get taken to,
5 the amount of hours that NYPD officers spend on
6 average on each involuntary removal, and demographic
7 data of those involuntarily detained?

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So-- so what I'll say
9 about the data on involuntary removal is that it's
10 very fragmented and very dependent on the type of
11 removal.

12 So while we have for a long time tracked certain
13 types of removals for certain types of teams, in
14 other places that data is just now being built out
15 because of this initiative. And we're working across
16 agencies to identify the data to collect to ensure
17 that we're using our best effort to implement this
18 plan in the most responsible way. This will include
19 looking at how successfully we engage people in
20 getting connected to all kinds of treatment across
21 the continuum of care, to include involuntary
22 hospital transports for the purposes of evaluation.

23 The plan under the Mayor's directive has only
24 been announced for a bit over two months, and we've
25 learned as we've been planning and rolling out that
limited data for this was previously tracked. This

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 88
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 means we're building much of this from the ground up
4 on the-- in respects for data.

5 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Well, let me amend my
6 question, then: Can you commit to-- that those--
7 those data points that I just mentioned. Can you
8 commit to giving them to this council?

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: What I would say is
10 that those are very similar to the data points that
11 we are looking to collect for--

12 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Right. And when you-- but
13 you're not answering my question. I just want-- when
14 you-- when you collect them, can you commit to giving
15 them to this Council? That's my question. It's a
16 yes or no.

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I believe we will. We
18 will answer the Council's questions on the data as we
19 collect it. Yes.

20 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. And if we have time
22 later, we'll try to do a second round questions for
23 members as well.

24 Okay, so next we have Councilmember Powers
25 followed by Councilmember Hanif.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 89
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Thank you. I know you
4 don't have data for-- I just wanted to follow up with
5 a question from my colleague. Do you have data on
6 the last two months since the announcement was made,
7 or whatever the timeline is, of how many-- how many
8 folks have been-- have been-- with the new law
9 changes and the new policy, just how many folks have
10 been taken into custody because of that?

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: We have some data, but
12 not all data.

13 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Can you share that with us
14 real quick?

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I can say that the
16 data that we have is very longstanding for our mobile
17 crisis teams. So I'll hand it to Jamie just to give
18 a bit of an overview. So these would be specifically
19 for 9.58.

20 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Just-- if you can just
21 give us the numbers. I don't need a narrative just
22 to know what the exact numbers are.

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So the Health
24 Department monitors mobile crisis teams. Mobile
25 crisis is both a generic and a brand name, if you
will, so it's used differently in different

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 90

3 scenarios. But there are 24 mobile crisis teams
4 operating across our city, that have been operating
5 for decades.

6 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Just-- I had a question
7 and we only have two minutes-- I have 50 seconds now.
8 So I just asked a question, what the number is. Can
9 you just give us the data points on how many people
10 have been--

11 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: I'm trying to
12 give you some context, because it's a very small
13 snippet of a larger system.

14 So in December, there were 42 removals conducted
15 by these mobile crisis teams. They are not just
16 serving homeless people. In fact, they are mostly
17 serving people who are housed, not people who are
18 homeless or on the subway. So there's-- this is
19 Mental Hygiene Law that could apply to, you know,
20 anybody in New York State.

21 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: I understood. Thank you
22 for that. Look, this is obviously one of the most
23 complicated issues, I think, facing our city and our
24 state right now, is how to help individuals who have
25 mental health-- serious mental health needs, and who
are also potentially presenting a public safety

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 91
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 threat to New Yorkers. And I don't think it's nearly
4 as simple as some people are presenting, and I also
5 think that how to get people effective care, and make
6 sure that people are not being a threat to New
7 Yorkers-- I know I've had this in my district plenty
8 of times, is really kind of essential. And I don't
9 take-- I don't envy anybody who has got to try to
10 figure that out. But that's why we're here.

11 So I just had a couple questions. And I'm sorry
12 to take more time, but I just-- I'll just do
13 questions, just to clarify the policies that are in
14 place, because I get this question all the time from--
15 - we encounter this all the time in my district.
16 Number one is: Is the policy around -- I know what
17 the state law allows, it says individuals from
18 meeting their basic human needs, I believe, is the
19 definition -- how does that differ then from
20 individuals who might be-- Because there might be
21 some individuals who have-- there's a public safety
22 issue, but perhaps they are meeting some of their
23 basic human needs. And there's a question about
24 exactly in a gray area question. So I want to
25 understand the sort of human-needs policy versus the
public safety aspect of that.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 92

3 And the second part I have is where you talk
4 about involuntary transfer, but then when they-- and
5 I've seen this happen in my district and I've had
6 this question, so I'm just asking it a plain, fact-
7 of-the-matter way, not in any agenda way -- but which
8 is when they get to a hospital and then they're asked
9 to take a voluntary transfer, I think, to services if
10 I'm correct? So isn't it sort of-- like I'm trying
11 to understand the involuntary versus voluntary parts
12 of that, which is to say, somebody might take-- you
13 might take them into custody, because you believe
14 they can't meet their basic human needs, then get to
15 the hospital and they are asked to volunteer-- I
16 think-- I believe they'll voluntarily sign something
17 saying that they'll accept treatment.

18 There's again, there's like one analysis saying,
19 maybe they can meet their needs, and the second one
20 saying, but they're in a mental health state where
21 they can actually voluntarily sign their rights away.
22 And I think that's, to me a big question about how
23 that policy works.

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So-- so let me talk
25 about the-- what the-- the actual 958/941 Mental
Hygiene Law says. And that is around that appearance

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 93
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 of mental illness, and conducting themselves in a
4 manner likely to result in harm to self or others.
5 So that's our public safety -- to put in your terms -
6 - kind of standard. Within that "serious harm to
7 self", OMH issued guidance around that inability to
8 meet basic needs. So that's how-- it's not really a
9 gray area. It's more of just on top of that-- that
10 serious harm to self, which will include inability to
11 make-- meet basic needs, and that serious harm to
12 others in the community, which is more of that
13 potential public safety standard.

14 What I'll say about the removals themselves and--
15 and heard it earlier also about there being two
16 different-- two different standards between the
17 removals. I think, Councilmember Cabán mentioned
18 this. The different standards between the removal
19 and what happens in the hospital, I might ask Dr.
20 Fattal to talk a little bit more about that. But I
21 think that is-- that is by design, because that
22 removal is just to get that evaluation, right?, and
23 to understand a little bit more about what that
24 individual is experiencing and what kind of treatment
25 and support that individual needs. But I'll hand it
over to Dr. Fattal to talk a little more.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 94

3 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. Just to clarify, I think this
4 is a continuum. So the-- the removal, which happens
5 in the community, and at that point, obviously,
6 whenever we can do it voluntarily, then we do it
7 voluntarily. But if the person is not agreeing to
8 it, then it becomes involuntary. The same thing
9 happens when someone presents with emergency room, we
10 always try to-- if someone meets the criteria for
11 admission to do it again, voluntarily. So at every
12 moment, we go back to the idea of trying to do it
13 voluntarily. But if they refuse, then we have to
14 follow the Mental Hygiene Law. And I'm going to go
15 back to an earlier comment that the standard for--
16 that was issued by OMH in February of 2022 is the
17 same. It's the exact same criteria for involuntarily
18 removing someone, or involuntarily admitting someone
19 to the hospital. It's the same concept, which is
20 danger to self or others, and under danger to self,
21 inability to care for basic needs is a form of danger
22 to self. So we're following the same standard.

23 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Just one last follow up
24 question: On the 41 individuals in December who were
25 removed, how many-- and I understand that's a wide

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 95
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 range of people, or a range of people -- how many
4 were then admitted into-- to get medical help?

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: I don't have
6 that. I don't have that information available.

7 COUNCILMEMBER POWERS: Okay, if you can get us
8 information, that would be helpful. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. Next we have Chair--
10 Oh, sorry. Councilmember Hanif, as well as
11 Councilmember Ayala after that, and then Bottcher.

12 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Great. Thank you so much.
13 I agree with them, some of my colleagues who've
14 shared that this directive is dangerous. It is
15 regressive and-- and violent. We cannot police our
16 way out of the city's homelessness and mental health
17 crises. There are successful voluntary mental health
18 programs that work, and we should be engaging in and
19 expanding those critical services, including recovery
20 based mental health programs, respite centers, peer
21 supports, clubhouses, and much, much more.

22 My colleague, Councilmember Cabán pointed to
23 other cities that have developed these kinds of
24 programs. We should be looking to them, modeling,
25 and actually be doing them even more successfully in
our city.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 96
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 And we know that coercive mental health treatment
4 has not proven to have better effects than voluntary
5 treatment, and is it disproportionate-- the
6 involuntary treatment is disproportionately applied
7 to black, Latinx immigrants, LGBTQI folks, and other
8 communities of color, who are often over diagnosed
9 and underserved.

10 So I'd like some-- a summary of some of the data
11 and I know you haven't been successfully able to
12 share data with us. But I'd like to know what
13 happens to individuals who are taken to hospitals by
14 the NYPD on involuntary removals, how long they spend
15 in the hospital, if they are physically or chemically
16 restrained, what other kinds of care they receive,
17 and if they are successfully connected to services
18 when they are discharged?

19 What is the discharge plan for folks who have
20 been involuntarily placed in-- in the hospital
21 setting?

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I'll hand it to Dr.
23 Fattal to talk about what happens in Health and
24 Hospital, hospital settings for folks who are brought
25 there in a crisis. What I might say is that, you
know, this-- this policy is not the starting point

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 97
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 for engagement, right? Starting points for
4 engagement, include, you know, our teams that DOHMH,
5 our teams at DHS that are working with-- with folks
6 on the street every-- every single day, those are
7 really our starting points for engagement, to get
8 people into, you know, this critical care that can
9 get them that long term treatment. This is really
10 meant for a very, very small subset of folks where--
11 where that engagement might not have been--

12 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Respectfully, I understand.

13 But I'd just like to know, how many have been taken
14 to the hospital on an involuntary basis. And what
15 those folks' discharge plan has looked like, what
16 services they were offered, what has happened after
17 their hospitalization, and how long they've been
18 hospitalized?

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Understood. I'll hand
20 it to Dr. Fattal.

21 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. Just to clarify, H&H is only
22 one provider. So not every removal comes to us. I
23 just want to make sure to put that in context, that--
24 and also, it's-- the plan varies between different
25 people. So I'm going to give you a general idea of

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 98
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 what we do for someone, right? It's very hard to
4 break it down exactly.

5 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Great.

6 DR. FATTAL: But it all starts with receiving the
7 information. So we're part of this initiative. And,
8 you know, a key component of this initiative is
9 collaboration and coordination. And it starts at the
10 point of receiving heads up that someone, again, as
11 Jason mentioned, this is a very, very select group of
12 people, to get heads up that someone is coming to our
13 one of our facilities, to get the information, make
14 sure that we have it.

15 And then once we have someone come in, we do
16 comprehensive psychiatric evaluation, but also a
17 medical evaluation. A lot of people who have been
18 living out on the streets have some medical issues
19 that have been ignored as well. So we make sure that
20 we address both the mental health needs and the
21 psychiatric needs. And also get additional
22 information to put the person in context history, we
23 outreach the 24/7 command center that has information
24 about people, and can connect us with the outreach
25 teams that have been working with them so we can get
the full picture.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 99

3 Then once we've done a very thorough assessment
4 that could include keeping someone for observation
5 for up to three days in the emergency room, if you're
6 not sure immediately. Then we answer the biggest
7 question, which is: Does someone need to be admitted
8 or not, right? And not every single person who was
9 brought to us ends up being admitted, but some end up
10 being admitted either voluntarily or involuntarily.
11 And then once you're admitted, the main goal of the
12 admission is stabilization. This is a you know, an
13 inpatient unit, so you don't want keep someone there
14 for too long. But then we have to make sure that
15 they have a discharge plan, which we've talked
16 briefly about before. But a discharge plan includes
17 making sure someone has follow up appointments and
18 follow up care, so that they're able to--

19 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: How does the follow up
20 work?

21 DR. FATTAL: It depends on each person. So
22 usually it's an appointment. It could be, depending
23 on the level of care, could be in an outpatient
24 clinic, could be in a post program, it could be in a
25 partial program, it depends on what the person needs.
But more importantly, we make sure that they have

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 100

3 wraparound services, which could include case
4 management, and depending on the person it could be a
5 caseworker, or it could be as intensive as critical
6 time intervention team working with them for up to
7 nine months.

8 COUNCILMEMBER HANIF: Got it. I hope you
9 understand that I'm not just trying to like probe you
10 all and trick you into asking these questions, but it
11 is really important for us as Councilmembers who have
12 constituents who may be involuntarily and coercively
13 moved to a hospital setting, that there is a plan,
14 that this is not just a revolving-door strategy, a
15 short-term strategy, that they in fact-- once they
16 receive these wraparound services during the three
17 day-- three day period where you all are evaluating
18 them, plus deciding whether they're admitted to the
19 hospital, or whether they can come back at a later
20 time, that there should be a long term strategy.

21 That they're not just coming back into the ER for
22 services and then getting sent back to the streets.

23 So it would be really-- it's really urgent that you
24 provide us with more transparent data, even if that
25 data set isn't available yet. It doesn't-- I don't
think it needs to be public. But we deserve to know

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 101

3 how exactly all of these agencies are administering
4 this-- this directive.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, so next,
6 we're going to move on to Councilmember Ayala and
7 then Councilmember Bottcher.

8 COUNCILMEMBER AYALA: Thank you, Madam Chair. I
9 just want to start by saying that there's a-- I'm
10 really disappointed, and I don't-- in everything that
11 I'm hearing today, but you know, our mental health
12 system is a sham. It is completely broken,
13 completely broken, and not recognizing that as part
14 of this conversation, I think is a disservice.

15 The fact that the commissioner is not here is
16 also insulting. Commissioner Vasan, I have a lot of
17 respect for him, but he should have been here. I
18 don't-- I can't think of a conversation more
19 important than the one than we're having here today,
20 and he should have been here.

21 I want to just, you know, highlight a couple of
22 points that I have been, you know, sitting here kind
23 of contemplating on. First of all, the term
24 "community based care" has been brought up as part of
25 this conversation continuously. When was the last
time that anybody, you know, check the data to see

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 102

3 what the number of mental health providers were per
4 community, you know, based on the on the number of
5 hospitalization rates? Because in my community, I
6 will tell you that it may take you up to a year to
7 get an appointment in a community-based organization
8 because we cannot attract or retain staff, because we
9 don't pay them enough, because the Medicaid
10 reimbursement rate is laughable, because we're losing
11 people to the private sector every single day.

12 And so people are going. These people that are
13 involuntarily being, you know, taken to the emergency
14 room have been to the emergency room many times
15 before that. That's not the problem. They've been
16 there. They've been there on their own. They've
17 been there with their family members. They're held
18 for three days, and then they're released out into
19 the community with no supervision, with no aftercare,
20 with no follow up, expected to make decisions that
21 they are unable to make sometimes on their own.

22 So while I agree with the Administration's
23 position on, you know, it'd be inhumane to allow
24 people to walk the streets when they are in that
25 state, I blame the system, because the system is
putting them out there.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 103

3 So you're not rectifying anything by picking them
4 up and taking them back to the hospital that they
5 already came out of, right?

6 And I will, you know, I also, I want to highlight
7 two cases, because they really bother me because I
8 think that they're really connected to this. One was
9 the case of Eric Davita. Eric Davita walked into a
10 hospital in my district, and he was-- he took himself
11 to the emergency room under duress. He knew that he
12 needed care. Nobody needed to pick them up. His
13 family didn't take him. He took himself. And while
14 he was there, under whatever manic phase he was
15 under, he got into an altercation with a security
16 guard, and instead of treating him they arrested him,
17 sent him to Rikers where he then committed suicide.

18 Explain that to me. Explain that to me. Because
19 I need to understand. I don't I don't get it. I
20 don't know who is on the receiving end, who's-- who
21 is making these decisions, but our system is broken
22 and that is why we fought so hard last year to create
23 the Office of Mental Health, because we wanted to
24 ensure that all of these gaps in services that
25 somebody was looking at them and creating real policy
to create meaningful change.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 104

3 I'll share one last thought and I'm sorry, Madam
4 Chair. But my brother -- and I bring them up all the
5 time, you know, he has bipolar disorder. He was in a
6 in manic -- in a manic state, a really bad manic
7 state, and was released from a hospital. Even after
8 I, the Deputy Speaker of the City Council, begged,
9 begged them to keep him on a psychiatric hold,
10 because he had been manic for days, hadn't been
11 eating, hadn't been sleeping. He was on, you know,
12 social media for days on end rambling. And I knew, I
13 knew that he was at threat of being, you know, having
14 himself beat up outside on the street, or being a
15 danger to somebody else.

16 They released him against my recommendation.
17 They didn't listen to anything that I had to say.
18 They released him. He took himself took himself to
19 Bellevue. Went AWOL three times. Again, he's in a
20 manic state. The last time they brought him in, they
21 left him in a room by himself with a-- with a doctor,
22 he punched her in the face. And now where is he?
23 He's in Rikers Island facing three years. And he'll
24 do his time. Because, you know why? We don't even
25 have court mental health court. The fact that he was
under-- under mental health distress wasn't even a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 105

2 part of the conversation. It became an assault like
3 any other assault. What a disservice, not only to
4 him -- and I bring him up, because he is the rule,
5 not the exception. This is what we're seeing. And I
6 am-- you know, I'm very passionate about this,
7 because, you know, I've been very fortunate to be
8 given a platform where I can speak to things I
9 actually know about, because these are my life
10 experiences, my lived experiences. I go through this
11 every single day.

12 And nobody has ever picked up the phone and said,
13 You know what, Councilmember? We would like to hear
14 a little bit more about what those-- those gaps and
15 services are because you've lived it. I don't know
16 when was the last time any of you took one of your
17 siblings or anybody in your family to the emergency
18 room. I will be fascinated to find out.

19 [APPLAUSE]

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Thank you, Deputy
21 Speaker for sharing.

22 And next we will go to Councilmember Bottcher,
23 and then Majority Whip Brooks-Powers.

24 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHER: Hi. So the Mayor's
25 announcement in November, as I understand it,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 106

3 essentially expanded the criteria for transporting
4 someone to the emergency room involuntarily.

5 Prior to November, the guidance that was given
6 was for someone who appears to be mentally ill, and
7 is conducting themselves in a manner which is likely
8 to result in serious harm to themselves or others.

9 Now, the criteria has been expanded to also
10 include those who appear mentally ill and-- and who
11 display an inability to meet basic human needs, like
12 the need for food, clothing, or shelter.

13 Dr. Fattal, you had said that there's been no
14 increase in emergency room visits at H&H. How is it
15 possible that there's been no increase when that
16 universe has been expanded so much? It wouldn't need
17 to be such a big universe, if we were providing
18 actual community-based services like clubhouses and
19 other services on the ground. But it is a big
20 universe. How has there been no increase?

21 And you don't have the numbers today of how many
22 people have been transported on the whole? When do
23 you think we'll be able to get those numbers? Also,
24 another question: You said you had a goal of
25 expanding site bed capacity by 200 by the end of the
year? Do you also have hard number goals for other

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 107

2 steps in the continuum of care, like medical respite
3 beds? And what are those number goals?

4 And also, third question: These involuntary
5 transports are done by the NYPD. Are there
6 involuntary transports to the ER done by civilian
7 entities as well?

8 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. I'm going to try to answer
9 but I'm definitely going to defer to my colleagues at
10 DOH and OCMH to also answer some of these questions.
11 Again, H&H is has only one provider. We're one
12 player in the mental health field in New York.

13 As far as the numbers. I think-- I hear exactly
14 your question. I think the issue is in the context.
15 I said we didn't have an increase. We see thousands,
16 and I can get back to you with exact numbers, but
17 Bellevue alone sees 12,000 people a year in our CPEP.

18 So the universe of people who are homeless-- and
19 again, this initiative is very, very narrow. We're
20 not going and, you know, doing this everywhere. This
21 is a very, very, very small denominator of people
22 that we're talking about who are homeless and have
23 severe mental illness, and are being targeted by this
24 intervention. So the whole number is very small --
25 the denominator, not everyone's being removed --

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 108

3 compared to the volume of people that we see in our
4 ERs, it's very small in that context. I feel like
5 that's the-- what I was trying to say that the volume
6 has not increased.

7 As far as other than beds, we definitely have
8 different programs and initiatives that we're working
9 on and have been working on planning. But I also
10 would defer to Jamie to talk more-- we had said that
11 there's a plan that's going to be announced. And,
12 you know, I don't know how much you can share today,
13 but there's definitely a very robust plan that's
14 being worked on that will address a lot of what you
15 mentioned. Not to mention the plan that the governor
16 just announced a few days ago that includes also a
17 lot of additional supportive housing and other
18 housing-related items.

19 And the third question about--

20 COUNCILMEMBER BOTTCHEER: Civilian.

21 DR. FATTAL: Yeah. I also defer to Jason and
22 Jamie for that one, because they have that answer.

23 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah. Just for-- for
24 transports, just to be-- to be clear, the transports--
25 - the actual transports themselves are being done by
FDNY EMS with the support of NYPD, and those are just

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 109

3 for the involuntary transports. So-- and Chief
4 Fields can talk more about that. On the-- on the
5 numbers, I think, over the over the coming months, we
6 should have more numbers to share about what actually
7 is happening on the ground and how that relates into
8 what's happening inside of the hospitals. It's, as I
9 mentioned, I think, incredibly complex and
10 fragmented, these numbers, and then how the kind of
11 the outcome, if you will of the hospital system, how
12 it's all related to the actual removals themselves.
13 I'll also just make another note, and I'll see if
14 Jamie or Chief Fields wants to add anything in, just
15 about the standard: That the Mayor didn't expand the
16 criteria, right? So that was-- it was interpretive
17 guidance out of OMH in February of 2022 that really
18 clarified the statute for both 941 and 958 removals
19 to include this interpretation along the basic needs,
20 and in November, the Mayor simply released a
21 comprehensive way that the city will be conducting
22 these-- these removals which did not exist before,
23 and concurred with the state's guidance.

24 But Jamie or Chief Fields anything to add?

25 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Yeah, I would
agree that the standard was not greatly expanded. It

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 110

2 remains very, you know, consistent with Mental
3 Hygiene Law for a long time. And our focus is always
4 on connecting to a lot of the great services that
5 many of the Councilmembers and my fellow presenters
6 have-- have mentioned, crisis alternatives, respite
7 centers, support and connection centers, peer support
8 services on a brief, you know, intervention.

9 And then the real measure of success is
10 connection to ongoing care, right? Clubhouses are a
11 great resource. Treatment services-- there's a lot
12 of innovative treatment models that are out there and
13 our more comprehensive mental health agenda will
14 include broader metrics focused on the whole
15 population, connections to care, moving into stable
16 housing, right?, improved quality of life, those
17 things that we know that are more robust and long
18 standing in terms of their impact on an individual
19 person and our city at large.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, great. Thank you. So
21 next, we have Majority Whip Brooks-Powers, followed
22 by Councilmember Holden.

23 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you Chairs.

24 As you all know, we had a hearing back in
25 December, a joint hearing on subway safety, and at

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 111

3 the time, the Administration didn't provide any-- a
4 clear answer that I'd like to follow up on today.

5 It's very much in line with what Deputy Speaker Ayala
6 was referencing in her remarks.

7 But individuals with severe mental illness tend
8 to be disoriented, have a typical thoughts such as
9 paranoia, and are generally not in the best position
10 to comply collaboratively with law enforcement.

11 If law enforcement engages and the individual
12 reacts poorly, would the individual then be arrested
13 and charged with a felony assault on a police
14 officer? Or will they still be taken in for
15 evaluation? When this was asked of the NYPD in our
16 December subway safety hearing, it seemed that no
17 clear guidelines had yet been worked out for how to
18 handle the situation. So I'd like to have an update
19 on that today.

20 And then as a follow up in terms of the CIT
21 training, how was the crisis intervention training
22 course selected by NYPD as the best option? How does
23 this training course compared to other police
24 precincts? Is it the most rigorous among major city
25 police departments? And in terms of co-response,
what is the NYPD's long term approach to co-response?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 112

3 Does administration have a plan to increase the
4 number of clinicians that serve in the field in
5 response to mental health calls? Thank you.

6 DIRECTOR CLARKE: So I'll start with the first
7 question. I think, you know, it really comes down to
8 training. And I was at the hearing in December, and
9 I think, when we look at the data, which we didn't
10 have with us, about 1% of mental health crisis calls
11 result in arrest. And as Chief Tobin mentioned
12 earlier, the majority of that is assault three-- or
13 not the majority, the most common is assault, third
14 grade, criminal contempt, which is violating an order
15 of protection, and menacing. So frequently, we're
16 coming into domestic violence situations.

17 It is infrequent, and it's very uncommon for the
18 felony arrest for assault on a police officer or an
19 EMT. It's not zero, but it's infrequent. And I
20 think it turns to training, on how we train our
21 officers, and part of that is training them to
22 respond to people in a mental crisis.

23 So even if-- the goal is to get voluntary
24 compliance, but even if we don't, you know, to make
25 sure we're providing a medical transport with EMS,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 113
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 and bringing them to the hospital for care, and not
4 to criminalize that.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Is there any
6 corrective measures taken in the event that an
7 officer may not have been trained, and someone who's
8 had a mental health crisis ends up in Rikers, where
9 at some point someone is assessing that this person
10 may have had a mental health crisis, so that we're
11 not criminalizing mental illness?

12 DIRECTOR CLARKE: Yeah. And I think-- so, you
13 know, every case is individual, so I can't speak
14 about why-- why individuals made that choice. But,
15 you know, after that, even in those situations where
16 an arrest happens, we're still bringing them into the
17 hospital for evaluation. The district attorney's
18 office have programs for people suffering from mental
19 health to sort of off-ramp them from the criminal
20 justice system.

21 If it's inappropriate, there's supervision to try
22 and make sure we're instructing officers on the
23 proper way to handle these situations. But there are
24 off-ramps in the criminal justice system for people
25 suffering from mental health crisis.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 114

2 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: But there's a
3 chance that they can be charged with the felony?

4 DIRECTOR CLARKE: I mean, like I said, it's
5 infrequent. For--

6 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: So then that means
7 that they can be. I just need a clear answer.

8 DIRECTOR CLARKE: It can be, but the goal on the
9 training is not to do that, and it's infrequent.

10 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Let's change the
11 question. Has-- has it happened?

12 CHIEF HOLMES: So, I can speak to that. I'm
13 Chief Holmes, right? Because I'm a training I've
14 been here 37 years and NYPD and I touched many
15 aspects of the department. So Can that happen? Yes.
16 The primary goal is for that not to happen. I've
17 been in precincts myself, where I'm the commanding
18 officer or a sergeant on the desk. Someone brings an
19 individual in that was suffering from a mental health
20 crisis, and sometimes it's quickly resolved that this
21 person needs to go to the hospital, not be arrested,
22 the arrest is voided, things of that nature. And I'm
23 talking long-- I'm talking way back because I've been
24 here a long time. But the training that's in place
25 now, hopefully is addressing that. We're pushing it

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 115

3 out more often. I believe in reoccurring training is
4 essential in getting the message out and making it
5 stick. And like it was testified to today that the
6 leadership training courses encompass that. If
7 you're a new sergeant, new Lieutenant, captain, going
8 through the course, it's-- it's emerged in that--
9 that training is emerged in those particular forums.
10 But hasn't happened? Obviously, because I've
11 listened to some of the Councilmembers here today.
12 That is not what I think any of us want to see as a
13 result of such. And, you know, if it happens, and
14 we're made aware of it, naturally, officers are made
15 aware of it. And we speak quite often.

16 It doesn't have to happen in New York, something
17 can happen. And still I feel the need or the agency
18 feels a need: Let's get it out there before our men
19 and women and make sure to try and offset it from
20 happening here in New York.

21 And with that being said, we're talking about a
22 national model, which is the crisis intervention
23 training, national model initially, I think it was
24 Memphis, Tennessee, in 1988. We adopted it in 2015.
25 But I'm still looking for if there's a better product
out there, believe me I'm trying to research and look

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 116

3 for it. And that's-- training is ever-evolving and
4 we're always looking for growth here in the agency.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Sorry. Just a last
6 followup question. I just want to know if the
7 training is required for all offices and how
8 frequently those trainings happen. Because I know
9 oftentimes, you know, I hear from officers also
10 feeling that they're not getting enough training.
11 And so with something as sensitive as this, I'm just
12 interested in understanding what investments are
13 making-- are being put in place to ensure that they
14 are receiving that training.

15 CHIEF HOLMES: So yes. This training, especially
16 the one that was recently implemented, it's for all
17 officers. I don't care what unit you're in. I don't
18 care if you're in an administrative position, because
19 at any given time -- and we saw that recently -- you
20 can be put in a position where you need to have this
21 particular training.

22 And training currently, right now the entire
23 agency took an overhaul. So I know I'm writing a
24 succession plan where I want to see training for NYPD
25 in the next two years, if not more current.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 117

3 So it's-- yes, it is mandated to answer your
4 question for all officers in NYPD.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BROOKS-POWERS: Thank you. Thank
6 you.

7 CHIEF HOLMES: You're welcome.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: So next we have Councilmember
9 Holden, followed by our Public Advocate Jumaane
10 Williams.

11 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Thank you, Chair. And
12 thank you, Chief Holmes, for-- for that.

13 You have a wealth of experience in this. Yeah, I
14 was behind at another council. But-- and that's why
15 you're so valuable to NYPD. You have the history and
16 you know some of the problems that we've experienced
17 in the past, but let me-- I was critical of Thrive
18 NYC in the last administration, because we had a lot
19 of, we probably still do, but a lot of acts of random
20 violence. Somebody just punched somebody for no
21 reason. They didn't know the person is just punching
22 somebody.

23 And we had multiple times like say dozens of
24 times, they were rearrested and then just sent out
25 again, with-- nobody red flagged him. I asked
Thrive, "Does anybody red flag these people?" And

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 118

3 they have probably a Serious Mental Illness that
4 needs to be, you know, needs to be handled. A lot of
5 them had schizophrenia, you know, whatever it is,
6 they're just getting rearrested. So-- and I think
7 that's probably still happening to some degree.

8 When somebody is-- attacks someone else, doesn't
9 know them just punches them for no reason, no
10 apparent reason. And they're, you know, they're--
11 they're diagnosed. I mean, they're brought to a
12 hospital by a police officer or EMS, does the doctor
13 have access to their records, their arrest records of
14 that individual?

15 DR. FATTAL: I have to get back to you about that
16 one. I-- yeah, I need to confirm.

17 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: But see, this is the
18 problem.

19 DR. FATTAL: Yep.

20 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: When-- if we don't, then
21 it's-- it's a merry-go-round. It's going to keep
22 happening.

23 DR. FATTAL: Yeah.

24 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: And that person might be
25 sent to Rikers and never be diagnosed. When we, you
know, we could admit them. And that's-- so we got to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 119

2 get off this merry-go-round of this kind of, you
3 know, lack of communications.

4 So if you can get back to me on that, because
5 that's very important, that the officer tells the
6 doctor. I don't know if the officer can hang around,
7 but that's a that's a big issue.

8 DR. FATTAL: Oh, I'm sorry. I thought you were
9 talking about, if someone is brought to us by
10 someone, we do receive that information. But you're
11 saying if-- sorry, maybe I don't understands.

12 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, no. We just we just
13 see the same-- you know, we read about the newspaper
14 the same individual keeps getting arrested and
15 re=arrested and re-arrested, for the-- for obvious
16 signs that they're unstable.

17 DR. FATTAL: Yeah.

18 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: And they're put back on
19 the streets. Why are they-- why are they out on the
20 streets first of all, and why aren't they committed
21 to an institution where they can get better? You
22 know what I mean. So I'm asking you, does the doctor
23 have the records of that individual to-- the arrest
24 records?

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 120

3 DR. FATTAL: So if someone is brought to us by
4 NYPD than we do receive that information when they
5 bring them to us. So we would have access to that
6 information.

7 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: But the officer hangs
8 around until the doctor comes? How does this work?

9 DR. FATTAL: Oh, so this is part of the protocol.
10 Maybe Jason can talk more about that. But definitely
11 the chain of custody ends when we take over the
12 patient. So the patient is never left without any--
13 you know, being under the custody of anyone. So
14 definitely they hang around long enough to make sure
15 that the patient is registered in our emergency room.

16 And by definition, if you're registered, that
17 means that now you're under our custody, it means
18 that our healthcare professionals--

19 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: So if they're brought in
20 by EMS, what happens? They have the arrest records
21 if there's no police officer there?

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: You know, they might
23 not. What I what I might go back to is you know
24 what-- what happens in the hospital around talking to
25 service providers, to other collateral contacts, and
that might be where some of that gets-- gets

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 121

3 uncovered and gets to the physician who's doing that
4 psychiatric evaluation. I think the-- the intent,
5 and Dr. Fattal can talk a little more about the
6 intent of psychiatric evaluation, is really meant to
7 collect some of that information beyond arrest
8 records, right? We're talking about, you know, you
9 know how they have been in treatment, you know what
10 other folks that they have?

11 DR. FATTAL: Yeah, I mean, I can talk about this
12 also, as a physician, the physician is only a member
13 of the team. So the team has the nurse has the clerk
14 has transport person. We have EMRs. So obviously,
15 when you do an evaluation, you're not only relying on
16 the information that was given to you personally,
17 you're relying on everything that happened, including
18 the EMS records, including the registration
19 information. So yes, if the information makes it at
20 any point in our system, then we have access to it.

21 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, I just think-- I'm
22 sorry Chair, but I just think that we need a very
23 definitive process. That-- and I think that's the
24 critical thing. Because we all-- we read about it in
25 a newspaper every day. Somebody just punches
somebody, and the same person was re-arrested 46

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 122
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 times. Is anybody out there red flagging all these
4 arrests? I mean, that's what we need somebody in
5 oversight looking at this, a doctor or, you know,
6 somebody that that can red flag people. Because
7 that-- in the last administration, I was very
8 critical. All this money from Thrive was going out
9 there. And they said most of it was for training.
10 But that we didn't even see. So that's the-- that's
11 the problem here. And I hope the Administration-- I
12 like what's-- what's happening in this
13 administration. At least they're communicating. But
14 we didn't learn anything in the last eight, you know,
15 eight years, especially in the last four of Thrive
16 NYC. We didn't get that information. There's a lot
17 of money out there, but we didn't see a difference.
18 Thanks.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON NARCISSE: And for my colleagues, as
21 a triage nurse, you come to us first. And when you
22 come, we get the record. And then we give it to the
23 doctor, and then we have a meeting. We have that a
24 lot. The biggest problem we have, believe it or not,
25 is the continuous service with the CBOs in our
community, the-- we don't have enough support system.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 123

3 Because when those guys come to us, we have to refer,
4 get the social worker involved, but by the time we do
5 that, we don't have enough. And that's what happens.
6 You don't have enough beds, you don't have enough
7 support services, you don't have enough support
8 housing. And that's the crisis we're dealing with
9 right now. Unfortunately, been going on for decades.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, next we have
11 our Public Advocate Jumaane Williams, followed by
12 Councilmember De La Rosa.

13 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Thank you so much,
14 Madam Chair. First, again, just reiterating
15 hopefully, the answers to the letters-- to the
16 questions that my office submitted will be answered
17 shortly.

18 I did want to say this framework in context, I
19 think there's something we have to break down that
20 caused a lot of some of these questions to be moot.

21 The first one is: we're getting better as a
22 society, but as a society as a whole, and government
23 in particular, has a hard time letting go with police
24 having to be the response to everything that goes on
25 in our city, and in our state in our country. That
is one of the primary problems that we have: Police

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 124

3 do not have to be the ones responding to everything.

4 But we haven't committed to that even as we say it.

5 Even if we look at the budget right now, the police

6 department is one of the larger funded. They also

7 have access to unlimited overtime that no one else

8 has access to. If I was asked about the overtime

9 access for H&H for DOHMH and EMS, it would pale in

10 comparison to the NYPD.

11 Also, NYPD is the only one not facing any cuts so

12 that other agencies are facing cuts on top of not

13 having any access to overtime, and on top of that the

14 recent budget laid out by the governor is giving NYPD

15 additional funding for overtime, while not giving any

16 money to try to restore cuts to the other agencies.

17 That said that framework is a framework that we

18 have to change not just in words, but in practice. I

19 know it's hard to do. These are hard questions. And

20 these are hard things to put into play. But if we

21 don't do it, we're going to continue seeing the

22 problems over, and over, and over again.

23 And that leads me to saying why I want to make

24 sure that people are trained, we have to make sure

25 our officers are trained continually training is not

going to solve the problem. The question is how when

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 125

2 why and who were using law enforcement to replace?

3 That's the question that we have to ask and who gets
4 the brunt of that. But I did want to just point out
5 hopefully I have-- I'm sorry.

6 On page four and page six, you mentioned clearly
7 that the orders did not expand any powers. You also
8 said that they cannot create involuntary admittance.
9 I just want to be clear, we're playing with semantics
10 here, because there was a change that the Mayor was
11 trying to make clear, that did expand some things in
12 its clarity.

13 Also, while they may not be able to involuntary
14 admit, they can involuntary bring people to the
15 hospital, so I want to just be clear about that.

16 And also on page five it said the clinicians can
17 call for NYPD in person, that they are in the lead.
18 I also want to be clear what we've heard, is that the
19 person with the gun is the lead. So that's one of
20 the reasons the best intentioned officer, I believe
21 what we've learned is the presence of the officer
22 with a gun in uniform can heighten the situation even
23 for the best-intended and best-trained officer.

24

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 126

3 So I did have a question so I can better
4 understand, because you said clinicians can call for
5 NYPD, which would assume that NYPD is not there.

6 So I want to understand how it works with these
7 teams, is there a law enforcement person already
8 there? Or are these teams going out, assessing
9 situations for themselves, and then if it's
10 necessary, calling for NYPD.

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I'll hand it to
12 Jamie in just a second, but first Public Advocate I
13 do-- I do want to just note that we did receive your
14 letter, we're working on responding to it, and we're
15 going to respond to it very soon.

16 And the other thing I'll just say is: It's going
17 to depend on when and where this happens. Sometimes
18 PD will be there, other times they won't.

19 But I'll let Jamie talk a little bit more about
20 the situations where they may or may not be there.

21 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Sure. So,
22 again, there's a lot of different types of teams.
23 There's teams that explicitly focus on crisis
24 intervention, and there's other teams that work with
25 people on an ongoing basis. And sometimes those
people may also have a period of crisis, you know, if

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 127

3 they're working with somebody over the years. I'll
4 focus on the specific crisis intervention teams that
5 respond over 16,000 referrals a year via NYC-WELL.
6 General public providers concern family members,
7 anybody can call NYC-WELL, they will connect if a
8 person is in crisis, and they can't get to treatment
9 themselves, or they will dispatch a mobile crisis
10 team that will meet with the person wherever they
11 are, these teams focus on people who are housed,
12 which would actually include shelters, but is mostly
13 people in private residences or supportive housing,
14 et cetera, 16,000 referrals a year. They include
15 peers and clinicians, they de-escalate, connect to
16 ongoing care. Less than 4% of the time, they will
17 assess the person as needing to go to the hospital.
18 The person may go voluntarily, they may, you know,
19 "My brother will drive me. We'll go right now."
20 They may not want to go voluntarily, in which case,
21 that mobile crisis team would call 911, and the
22 police and EMS would respond.

23 PUBLIC ADVOCATE WILLIAMS: Okay, thank you. I
24 have other questions hopefully the letter will
25 respond to. I did want to also say part of the
problem is that when this was announced, it was

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 128

3 announced as a plan, but it was a tactic. And that
4 is a difference. And if we can talk about a full-
5 fledged plan, it would help relieve a lot of the
6 concerns that we have. We all know that there are
7 failures happening now. I do want to lift up
8 Samantha Prius, I believe her name was. She was let
9 out of Queens Hospital. She was nonverbal mute, on
10 autism spectrum, let out in the freezing cold. Her
11 parents-- her family waited for weeks to find them.
12 To Shawn Carter, Michael Lopes, who were getting help
13 on a psychiatric hospital who were brought to Rikers.
14 They're now dead.

15 And so we do know that they are failures here.
16 And we have to work on getting a continuum of care
17 system that is not reliant on simple law enforcement
18 because it has never worked before, and it harms
19 black and brown communities primarily.

20 Thank you so much. I appreciate it.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. So next we
22 have Councilmember De La Rosa followed by
23 Councilmember Paladino.

24 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: Thank you so much. I
25 want to piggyback on some of my colleagues comments.
I want to uplift that there is inherent violence in

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 129

3 the interaction between police and people who are
4 suffering from severe mental illness. And those
5 interactions have been, you know, have been plastered
6 all over newspapers for us to see for over a decade.
7 They are the names of New Yorkers that have been
8 murdered by police officers in these interactions.
9 And they are people with families.

10 And I just want to say that we have been given
11 information that talks to some of the disparities
12 that exist in these practices. Black New Yorkers
13 have been found to have a higher hospitalization rate
14 for mental illness despite lower prevalences of
15 lifetime diagnosis and severe mental illness, as well
16 as-- as well-- We also know that the highest poverty
17 neighborhoods that have over twice as many
18 psychiatric hospitalizations per capita as the lowest
19 poverty neighborhoods in New York City. Those data
20 points point to the targeting of black and brown New
21 Yorkers who are severely mentally ill, as well as the
22 criminalization of poor New Yorkers in those same
23 communities.

24 So while there has been an emphasis today in the
25 testimony on trainings, trainings alone will not
change this bias and the disparity that exists. We

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 130

3 need accountability as well. And I want to say that
4 we have information that since 2017, the CCRB, has
5 recorded close to 2700 allegations that police abused
6 their power when sending someone to the hospital
7 against their will. This is an alarming number,
8 obviously, and complaints about NYPD abuse during
9 involuntary removals and what is-- so we want to
10 know, right?, that this-- this data point is that we
11 want to know what is happening for NYPD officers who
12 in the past have been-- had a CCRB complaint, have
13 abused their power when having interactions with New
14 Yorkers? What is the accountability for those
15 officers in this process of involuntary removal?
16 That's number one.

17 And then number two, just to ask both of my
18 questions quickly. I do have a question regarding
19 staffing at these agencies, the Office of Community
20 Mental Health, and the office-- and the Department of
21 Health and Mental Hygiene. We know that there is a
22 staffing crisis in New York City. So if training is
23 relying upon, for example, DOHMH to do this training,
24 but we don't have enough staffers to-- to even
25 service our city, how is that happening, and what are

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 131

2 the impacts on actual trainings if those agencies are
3 hollow?

4 CHIEF HOLMES: So I'll take the first component
5 as far as accountability. First and foremost,
6 there's body worn cameras now, and those cameras,
7 it's mandated and encompassed in the training, that
8 that camera is to be activated upon the first
9 encounter with an individual.

10 And, you know, full transparency, you're right.
11 We've seen where officers have forced wants someone
12 to the hospital, and they've been disciplined as a
13 result of it. As a matter of fact, I used one of
14 those scenarios in my training, as to "this is not
15 what we want to see."

16 So you know, some can be training, and then some,
17 yes, you do have where someone has interacted in, you
18 know, inappropriately, and, and been met with
19 discipline.

20 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: So are you red
21 flagging? Since we're talking about red flagging New
22 Yorkers who are walking down the street? Are we red
23 flagging NYPD officers who have a history of
24 brutality.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 132

2 DIRECTOR CLARKE: So I also want to put a little
3 context in here. You know, we're talking about 2745
4 complaints. We're responding to 170,000 of these
5 calls a year. So this is, again, of this-- between
6 2017 I don't have the math in my head right now, but
7 we're talking 600,000 to 800,000 responses to calls a
8 year, and we're talking about 2000 complaints. So I
9 agree with Chief Holmes: When it is improperly done,
10 it should be, it should be investigated by CCRB, and
11 there should be accountability for the officer.

12 But by and large, we're talking about officers
13 who are handling situations correctly given the vast
14 numbers of calls we respond to, and the low number of
15 complaints comparatively.

16 COUNCILMEMBER DE LA ROSA: I will say that it's
17 not apples to apples. Just the fact that you have
18 that many complaints points to a problem. And the
19 fact that the CCRB has not always acted independently
20 leads us-- leads me to have concerns over the
21 validity of the of the complaints that have been
22 dismissed.

23 And so that's not apples to apples, in my
24 opinion, and to have those complaints be at the
25 forefront. Those are still people. Those are not

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 133

3 just numbers of complaints. Those are people that
4 are walking in New York City streets, and as you
5 heard our colleagues say here, there are people with
6 people with families, who are concerned about their
7 well being when an interaction happens, right?, with
8 police officers. They leave their house, they're in
9 a manic state, and there is an interaction. So we
10 need accountability as well as training. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Okay, next we have
12 Councilmember Paladino, followed by Councilmember
13 Abreu.

14 COUNCILMEMBER PALADINO: Good afternoon,
15 everybody and thank you for coming.

16 I'd like to commend you, Chief Holmes. I'd like
17 to thank the Mayor's Office for taking the steps that
18 you are taking. It's a long time coming. We've seen
19 this mental health crisis put be put on hold for
20 decades now. Let's not remember-- let's remember,
21 when state hospitals were considered inhumane and
22 they were closed. We presently have a lot of vacant
23 properties that can actually be used to serve the
24 mentally ill. The mentally-- the mentally ill, and
25 the mentally challenged, cannot be put in a criminal
status. They are mentally ill.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 134

3 Now when I think of these safe spaces, this is a
4 safe space where they could receive the treatment
5 that they need, whether it be long-term or short-
6 term.

7 So I think you guys are doing your jobs right
8 now, but we have to go deeper. We've got \$227
9 billion coming down from the state of New York. What
10 are they doing with that? We had Thrive New York,
11 which was a joke, \$1.2 billion, and yet we're sitting
12 here talking about this as if it's a new problem.
13 It's misappropriation of funds.

14 Now let's keep an eye on our governor, and let's
15 see what she plans to do when it filters down here to
16 the city so that we can get a grip on this problem.

17 Another thing I went on a ride along. I went on
18 a ride along to Friday nights ago with the one on
19 Ninth precinct. And I watched your officers handle
20 two very severely mentally challenged people, one
21 knife wielding, and I watched the EMS come in
22 everything you spoke about here, your training, I saw
23 put to good use. And another person who went crazy
24 in Rite Aid, totally ballistic, throwing things
25 around threatening people. Once again, the offices I
was-- I were with, one was a-- on the force for 16

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 135

2 years, the other fresh out of the academy. I
3 couldn't be more proud the way you guys handled this
4 situation. I know there's a crisis once your
5 inputted, and there's no long term solutions. So
6 long term solutions rests in the \$227 billion that
7 the state is supposed to be giving this city.

8 So let's make sure the money is used properly.
9 And the Mayor could go forward in purchasing perhaps
10 Creekmore, which is 300 acres of state-owned land.
11 There are places and-- and things we could do. I
12 work with these people all the time, and I look
13 forward to furthering this and not just talking about
14 it. It's time for action. Thank you very much.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And next we will go
16 with Councilmember Abreu followed by Councilmember
17 Gutiérrez.

18 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Thank you Chair.
19 Considering there is a shortage of mental health
20 staff across all H&H hospitals, how many more mental
21 health professionals need to be hired to meet the
22 demands of AOTs?

23 DR. FATTAL: Yep, thank you. I'm going to defer
24 to Jamie from DOHMH, who oversee the AOT program.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 136

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Sure. Yeah.

3 The Department of Health implements assisted
4 outpatient treatment in New York City.

5 We have-- I don't-- about 100 staff on my team,
6 clinicians and non-clinicians, you know, lawyers.

7 It's interdisciplinary. I don't have the exact
8 headcount, but certainly, you know, there-- there are
9 vacancies in the program and across our agency, and
10 AOT is no-- no exception to that.

11 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Is it fair to say that you
12 don't have the-- enough staff to meet the demand?

13 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So AOT is a
14 court monitoring program, civil courts, a civil
15 matter. We're not providing care. So everybody on
16 an AOT court order is receiving community-based
17 treatment and care coordination provided by CBOs,
18 hospital-based clinics. And so those, that larger
19 behavioral health workforce is not DOHMH staff or
20 city staff necessarily, there are also shortages
21 within the sort of larger behavioral health workforce
22 that I think we're all aware of.

23 But everybody on an AOT court order in New York
24 City is in treatment, that is the requirement of the
25 program. So nobody on AOT is without treatment.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 137

2 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Thank you for your
3 question. And because Intro 706 is being heard
4 today, I would like to have perspective by OCMH on
5 that. Is this something that's feasible? Would it
6 be possible to create a virtual interactive map that
7 shows where services are located?

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So thank you,
9 Councilmember. So we support the goal of providing
10 access to mental health services, which is why we,
11 with our partners at DOHMH launched NYC-WELL. This
12 commitment to access includes ensuring that there are
13 places for New Yorkers to find the resources that
14 they need. And so NYC-WELL, which is New York City's
15 single point of entry for behavioral health services,
16 provides a robust online portal that the public can
17 access now, and it's organized by population, type of
18 service. They can also call and have counselors and
19 peers to help navigate the system and provide crisis
20 counseling via phone, text, and chat.

21 OCMH also published a how-to help guide to help
22 walk folks through how to get services in the city
23 and direct folks to that comprehensive resource that
24 is NYC-WELL.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 138

3 So we look forward to talking to you about the
4 bill and how to make it-- and how to get these
5 resources out to folks.

6 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: So we-- there's-- there's a
7 path for us to work together on this.

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Absolutely.

9 COUNCILMEMBER ABREU: Thank you so much.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So actually, we're going
11 next to Councilmember Brewer followed by
12 Councilmember Rivera.

13 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. Just
14 a few questions. In my discussions with all of the
15 mental health groups, at least in Manhattan, it's all
16 about the staffing. So I always hope that agencies
17 don't work in silos. So my question to you is, are
18 you -- sometimes it's hard to fight OMB, I know that
19 -- but are you willing? Are you able are you doing
20 advocating for more funding for the mental health
21 agencies, you'll hear about the clubhouses, there are
22 many other models. That's question number one,
23 because without that support, you can't be
24 successful.

25 Number two, I wonder if you have any statistics,
whatever the overall number of voluntary or

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 139

3 involuntary, of people who are going back to the
4 shelters, are they going back to families? Where are
5 they where are they going after three days, et
6 cetera, because there is very little opportunity for
7 a stable environment in our city. And it's not your
8 fault, but that's the housing problem.

9 Third, I believe there are 50 -- at least in the
10 Manhattan court, and I know DA Bragg is upset about
11 it -- only 50 People can be handled by the mental
12 health court. Are you-- is it worth it? Do you need
13 more slots there? What are you doing about that?

14 And then finally, leaving Rikers has been a
15 problem for I don't know, 40 years that I've been
16 doing this. Me and Madam Holmes, or we've been doing
17 this for a long time. 40 years I've been doing this.
18 So is there any change in leaving Rikers? I know
19 there's a lot of talk. Rikers has a lot of people
20 with mental illness. What are we doing as a city --
21 even though there's a lot of talk -- to make sure
22 that people coming out from Rikers have support.
23 When you leave the state system? I know I had a son
24 who came from the state criminal justice system,
25 mentally ill, they do pay attention, but does--
Rikers talks about it, but those could be recidivism

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 140

2 unless you're paying attention to mental health. So
3 those are my four questions.

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So I'll take it from
5 the top. If I miss anything, let me know. Just on
6 the funding and staffing, what I'll say about the--
7 the staffing is staffing is a national issue, right?
8 So we're facing--

9 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I don't live in Iowa. I'm
10 interested just in New York City.

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I understand. I think
12 we're facing staffing issues across many of our--
13 many of our programs, and we are I think actively
14 working on many, many strategies to-- to kind of, you
15 know, get out of this staffing crisis that we're in.

16 So whether that's, you know, collective job
17 fairs, whether that's, you know, enhanced recruiting
18 efforts, we're trying to find the staffing that we
19 need to really fill our vacancies across our teams,
20 and within the Administration.

21 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Definitely for the
22 Administration, but also for the nonprofit community-
23 based organizations that really are an extension of
24 city government. Are you fighting for them to get
25 money too against OMB?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 141

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I mean, I think we're
3 always looking at ways that we can some work support
4 community providers, to make sure that they can find
5 the staff that they need to hire and have the
6 appropriate level of support.

7 Just on the statistics, for discharges back to
8 shelter, I'll hand it over to Dr. Fattal to talk
9 about what happens after that three day period.

10 DR. FATTAL: Yeah, and I just wanted to go back
11 to-- I know I mentioned three days, but I want to
12 clarify the context I used it. It's the-- if someone
13 comes to our emergency room, we can do an evaluation,
14 and we could keep them up to three days in the
15 emergency room for observation, but that's not the
16 overall duration. If they ended up being admitted,
17 then, you know, the admission is definitely a longer
18 stay.

19 So just want to clarify that because I don't want
20 the impression to be that we only keep people to up
21 to three days.

22 And as far as what happens to them afterwards, I
23 think that's the data that was asked for before and
24 we can get back to you on that, but we do keep track.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 142

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: But it is the most
3 important data of this whole conversation. Just so
4 you know.

5 DR. FATTAL: Yes.

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Um, the other one
7 around Rikers. So when I might say, you know,
8 there's Correctional Health Services that provides
9 health services at Rikers that does--

10 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I know.

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, an amazing job
12 to-- to help folks--

13 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Comme ci, comme ça.

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Understood. And you
15 know, they're helping folks as they get discharged to
16 get connected into-- into treatment. And I think
17 we're trying to find ways to make that a easier,
18 better process.

19 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: But what are you doing to
20 make that easier and better, because people leave? I
21 know, I've been there. They leave, and they just
22 don't necessarily follow appointments, and so on and
23 so forth. So what is the connection there between
24 leaving Rikers and support?
25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 143

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: So my-- I'm going to
4 have to defer that to Correctional Health Services,
5 and I'll get back to you with what they're-- they're
6 working on.

7 Similarly with mental health courts, that's
8 within the purview of MOCJ. I'll get back to you on
9 the-- the mental health courts as well.

10 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you very much. I
11 guess what I'm trying to say after 40 years, we still
12 silo, and we cannot-- we've got to stop siloing
13 agencies. That's a huge issue. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Next, we
15 will go to Councilmember Rivera, followed by
16 Councilmember-- Oh, we actually did that. Go ahead.

17 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Good afternoon. Thank you
18 for being here. Nice to see you, Chief Holmes.

19 I want to go over some of the numbers that you
20 mentioned today. It was mentioned that 42 removals
21 were made in December 2022. Is that correct?

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Um, so that was just
23 for our mobile crisis teams.

24 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Do you know where those
25 removals were made? I'll defer to Jamie.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 144

2 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: Yeah, so mobile
3 crisis teams operate citywide. We would know the
4 location--

5 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: You wouldn't?

6 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: We would. We
7 would. I don't-- I couldn't tell you the location of
8 all of them off the top of my head. But yes, we have
9 the location.

10 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Could you get those--
11 those neighborhoods for us? I only ask because the
12 highest-poverty neighborhoods have over twice as many
13 psychiatric evaluations per capita as the lowest
14 poverty neighborhoods in New York City. So how the
15 city responds to the these individual areas, I think,
16 is important. So I would love to know that.

17 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: When I-- can I
18 just respond to that, because I totally agree. And
19 the training that we do for 958 designation includes
20 a module on anti racism and bias in mental health
21 services. So we completely understand the role.

22 [crosstalk]

23 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Let me just say-- I
24 appreciate that. I just want to ask about were those

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 145

3 removals through calls that were made regarding a
4 mental health crisis that was in progress?

5 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So the removals
6 I'm talking about were calls to NYC-WELL, where the--
7 there was a report either, you know, by the person,
8 or by a loved one, or by a provider, anybody who
9 might know them, explaining that there was a mental
10 health situation that was assessed to be a crisis by
11 the NYC-WELL counselor, and then dispatched to a
12 local CBO operated team, who then went out into their
13 home, did an assessment, and then assessed the-- if
14 the threshold was met for removal.

15 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: So 16,000 referrals were
16 made to NYC-WELL in a year, you mentioned, and all of
17 these go to nonprofit organizations?

18 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: No. So there's
19 about 400,000 contacts to NYC-WELL, about 16,000
20 referrals to mobile crisis teams through NYC-WELL--

21 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: And those go to
22 nonprofits?

23 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: They go to a
24 variety of-- it includes nonprofits, as well as
25 hospital based mobile crisis teams. So there's 24
mobile crisis teams. Some of them are operated by

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 146

3 hospitals, including but not limited to Health and
4 Hospitals. Some of them are operated by voluntary
5 hospitals. And then some are operated by community-
6 based organizations in contract with DOHMH.

7 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: And is NYPD ever involved
8 in those?

9 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER NECKLES: So, no, the
10 mobile crisis teams are staffed by clinicians and
11 peers. If those-- the clinician on scene assesses
12 the person to meet the criteria for hospital-- or
13 potentially meet the criteria for hospitalization,
14 they would attempt to get the person to the hospital
15 voluntarily. If that's not an option, then they
16 would engage the police and EMS to transport the
17 person involuntarily.

18 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: I just have one more
19 question. Is that okay.

20 I only ask because you have organizations, and
21 we'll hear from them later today. But VNS was
22 formerly visiting nurse, you know, they've been doing
23 this for decades. And they really must be leveraged
24 and fully funded if you rely on them for that many
25 thousands of calls every single year. And that goes
for our community based organizations that approaches

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 147

3 this work in a very, very culturally humble way. So

4 I just want to put that on the record.

5 And my last question was, it was said that 2.5%
6 of 911 calls are mental health related, with 1% of
7 crisis calls resulting in arrests. And Chief Holmes,
8 you mentioned that some of those arrests eventually
9 are voided. Is that-- is that crossover in the same
10 percentage?

11 And secondly, why again, is NYPD the best to
12 handle these calls?

13 CHIEF HOLMES: So I'm not-- when I speak about
14 some of them being voided, I'm speaking from personal
15 experience, my tenure as a commanding officer. I
16 don't know the stats now. I will look into it, now
17 that it has come to my attention.

18 As far as police being the best to respond. No,
19 I am not going to say I agree to that. What I'm
20 going to say is: Is it necessary for our response
21 sometime? Most of the time we're responding, it's
22 either someone's flagging us down, or someone's
23 calling 911, and it warrants a response based on the
24 circumstances being given: They have a weapon,
25 they're screaming, some sort of circumstances that
leads communications to notify us, as well as our--

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 148

3 one of our primary agencies there, EMS to respond to
4 that particular scene. And when we get there, that
5 that deter-- that assessment is made. There's
6 several times that EMS may get there before we get
7 there. And they can give us you know, give further
8 feedback.

9 But as far as us being the best to respond. If
10 it's something emergency in nature, we took an oath
11 to protect and serve, that's what we do. As far as
12 the Mayor's directive, my interpretation of that is,
13 we don't leave someone in the street. It's inhumane
14 to leave someone in the street that requires some
15 sort of assistance, whether it's reeking of urine and
16 incoherent, or open wounds and not capable of self
17 care. That's my interpretation. Those are some
18 examples used in our training, something to that
19 magnitude.

20 CHIEF TOBIN: I'd just like to piggyback on that
21 and say that the NYPD's default with responding to
22 mental health calls is always as an aided case, not
23 as a criminal justice matter.

24 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Always as an aided case?

25 CHIEF TOBIN: Like it's someone that requires
medical or behavioral health attention.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 149

2 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: Right. I just asked
3 because the, you know, if there are resulting
4 arrests, that's what's so concerning, I think, for
5 this body, but I know we're trying to...

6 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: So I just want to point
7 out, I think it was earlier, that there are
8 situations where it's a must arrest. So if we go to
9 a scene, and it's called in as a mental health call,
10 and when we get there it's actually a domestic
11 dispute, and the person has an order of protection,
12 we have to arrest for criminal contempt.

13 COUNCILMEMBER RIVERA: All right, well I look
14 forward to a breakdown of those arrests and related
15 to the mental health crisis calls.

16 Thank you, Madam Chairs for the graciousness and
17 the time.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And I will
19 actually hand it off to our fellow Chair Camilla
20 Hanks for just a couple more second-round questions
21 really briefly. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you, Chair Lee. And I
23 thank my colleagues. I mean, this has been very
24 informative. The questions were leading, they were
25 engaging, and I think we learned a lot here.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 150

3 Second, I would like to thank everyone on this
4 panel, because you know, your expertise, and it's not
5 easy what we're discussing here. So I do want to
6 thank all of you for coming here today and talking
7 about that. To that end, we discussed, you know,
8 training, we discussed that 1% that goes into police
9 custody, that lead to arrest, they may be on Rikers,
10 they are released. Councilmember Holden explained,
11 you know, what is the pipeline to making sure that
12 those individuals if they are rereleased? How do we
13 interact with that?

14 So all of that is coming under the umbrella of
15 training. And I appreciate, Chief Holmes, your
16 candor is like, "No, this isn't the proper, this is
17 what we have to do as law enforcement that when we're
18 called we have to answer."

19 So I think I want to end this by saying to a
20 person, regardless of funding, because everybody
21 always wants more funding: What do you think we need
22 to be doing or looking at to make this work better,
23 in your, in your opinion, to a person?

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, I think some of
25 the ways that that we-- some of the things that we
need to do to make this work better. We've-- we've

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 151

3 heard it today, some of the coordination. That's
4 partially what this plan was meant to address is a
5 coordination between agencies.

6 But you know, it is-- it's difficult when we have
7 a bunch of we have we have a lot of agencies that are
8 working with individuals and across individuals. So
9 coordination is I think one of the things. I think
10 staffing is another one. We do have that-- that
11 nationwide staffing shortage and that citywide
12 staffing shortage that affects really from-- from the
13 top to the bottom, right? Every-- every part of this
14 response does have a staffing component that does
15 need to-- you know, does need more support. And a
16 lot of a lot of that is outside of the control of the
17 city sometimes, right?, just because of how staffing
18 is done.

19 So interagency-- more interagency coordination.
20 And I think it's a testament to our interagency
21 coordination that we have, you know, health agencies
22 up here along with our public safety agencies, really
23 trying to do what we can for the support and care of
24 New Yorkers. And staffing, I think across-- across
25 services.

CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Anyone else? Please?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 152

2 CHIEF HOLMES: So I have to agree. First of all
3 this is-- I think it's a collaborative effort. I
4 know we have a call every Wednesday with the Deputy
5 Mayor Isom Williams, who is very passionate about
6 this subject as well, and the coordination that I see
7 as far as tracking an individual from the beginning
8 to the end, and what services they're receiving. I
9 think it's phenomenal.

10 But we all know, this is a whole entire ecosystem
11 that-- that requires some adjustment-- adjusting and
12 staffing in order to make it work.

13 As far as a temporary, quick fix, for lack of a
14 better term. I think that each agency here is
15 focused on doing the best that they can with our
16 client-customer, with that particular community in
17 mind, and best interests in mind. The humanity in
18 this, I think, is amazing. And that's just from the
19 phone calls that I participate in as well as how you
20 feel about this particular subject as well. I know
21 Councilmember Brewer -- , I think she's gone already
22 -- you know, when I think about Rikers, I just think
23 about-- it's something I talk about. Maybe something
24 like I say a Welcome Wagon at the foot of Rikers
25 Island when you're being discharged, that's not

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 153

3 Rikers personnel, but have agencies, different
4 agencies represented. Even something as simple as
5 getting a CDL license? Do you have children? And if
6 so, plugging them in to ACS. You'd be surprised. A
7 lot of people don't even know ACS gives cribs and
8 things of that nature.

9 People want to eat, you're going to have
10 recidivism, right? Because they have no other
11 option. So I think just trying to plug them into
12 different things, you know, different services and
13 educating about that. And, I think it'd be helpful.

14 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. Is that
15 it? Does anybody else have a--

16 DR. FATTAL: Just very quick, just to-- I agree
17 with Jason, and add that, you know, I've heard, "Is
18 this the best approach? Or is this the best
19 approach?" I think different people need different
20 approaches. I think the key is coordination. Also,
21 because we need all the different approaches. We need
22 all these different agencies to work together,
23 because not everyone is going to be the same. So--
24 and every situation needs a different response.

25 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. And
thanks for-- actually, I have one comment about the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 154

2 mobile unit. I had a situation where there was a
3 person, a good friend of mine, in a mental health
4 crisis, and we called the mobile crisis unit, and
5 they did not respond, and then NYPD had to come in.

6 And what the CBOs were able to do was highlight
7 the history of this person, so they would not be
8 attacked or treated with, you know, with their civil
9 liberties intact.

10 So my last thing is, what do you need from CBOs?
11 What kind of capacity building measures do you think
12 you would like to propose to make sure our CBOs and
13 folks are-- are supporting and making sure that maybe
14 that coordination is happening, or there's training
15 on a local level, so the civics the CBOs, are also--
16 who are really on the ground, understanding who these
17 folks are in individual communities can be helpful.
18 Anything that you would want to...?

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah. I think we
20 always want to hear from CBOs, and how-- how
21 individual cases play out. So I think for-- in this
22 case, Chair, where you didn't get the mobile crisis
23 team, I think we would want to look into kind of
24 where-- where that broke down, so that we can improve
25 for the next time, or explain why it broke down,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 155

2 right? And I think same with the CBOs. I think we
3 would, we would want to hear from them on the ground
4 about what they're seeing, so that we can develop, I
5 think, the best process that that we can.

6 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. That's
7 the end of my questioning. Thank you, Chair Lee.

8 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Thank you. I just wanted
9 to continue with some of my commentary and follow up
10 on some of the answers that were given earlier, in
11 addition to some of the additional testimony that I
12 have heard.

13 You know, I will say that, respectfully, I'm
14 hearing that the-- the threshold for removal is the
15 same in in the field as it is in the hospital. And
16 there's been you've protected a lot of confidence
17 about the approach that's being taken. But I do want
18 to note that there are doctors across the city that
19 are vehemently opposed to this plan. And I'm just
20 just to name a few, for example, like CIR of the
21 SEIU, doctors and residents-- the interns and
22 residents union that say that this is not medical
23 best practice, and think that it is very harmful and
24 dangerous. And so I just want to point out that
25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 156

3 there is a very differing opinion across the medical
4 community on this response.

5 I did also hear about the point is not
6 criminalization. Maybe somebody gets brought into
7 the precinct, and then they're like go, I just want
8 to accurately and clearly define what criminalization
9 is. Criminalization is not the act of an arrest.
10 Criminalization is responding to a social ill with
11 policing, and that very interaction at every single
12 point is a traumatic event, and most often, with
13 somebody experiencing mental health struggles, it is
14 one that escalates rather than de escalates. It is
15 one that further-- furthers decompensate
16 decompensation, rather than making a situation
17 better.

18 I also want to talk about metrics. It was also
19 mentioned earlier that the goal is to look at how
20 often we are connecting people to care. And that is
21 an important metric, but I think what we need to
22 understand about that is that the infrastructure
23 doesn't exist. That models in other cities, what
24 they have that's different than us is more
25 investment, so there's more places to take people.
That the only two options are not a shelter, or a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 157

3 hospital, or third, Rikers Island, and that actually
4 a real measure of success would be to be responding
5 less.

6 And so that idea about a Welcome Wagon coming off
7 the island. We need welcome wagons in our
8 neighborhoods, before people get onto Rikers Island.
9 And so my question for you all is, do you agree that
10 the DHS budget, the DOHMH budget, the B-HEARD budget,
11 do you agree that those should not be cut, that they
12 should not be subjected to PEG, and that those
13 budgets should actually increase?

14 And then my-- my next and last question are, and
15 then I have an additional comment, if you'll bear
16 with me Chairs is-- you know, I have had the
17 opportunity to talk with police chiefs and fire
18 department chiefs in different cities, particularly
19 the Portland Street Response Team, the Denver Stars
20 team, and the things that they have told me
21 unequivocally, is that their police department is not
22 the right workforce to be doing this work, and there
23 is no amount of additional training that can do that.
24 We've heard a lot about additional training.

25 So my question for-- for the NYPD representative
is: Do you agree with that, that the NYPD cannot and

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 158

3 will never be fully equipped to address this crisis,
4 and that what is really needed is an alternative-- a
5 deeper investment and an alternative models so that
6 we have more capacity to respond to more than 2% of
7 eligible calls, for example. Because I believe,
8 based on the last B-HEARD data in that catchment area
9 of all the calls coming in that are eligible, there's
10 only capacity to respond with that team to 2% to 3%
11 of those.

12 And the last thing, I will add, I promise, thank
13 you, is that, you know, this question about when a
14 mobile crisis team is sent or an alternative is sent.
15 This is not a unique issue and problem. Like yes,
16 the biggest issue has a lot to do with whether
17 there's personnel to get that done. But it's also in
18 dispatch.

19 I've had the opportunity to stand in the middle
20 of 911 Dispatch, and hear how these calls are, are
21 coming in how they're routed and what gets done. And
22 a big part of the problem that they are experiencing
23 is-- it's not so much as the dispatchers inaccurately
24 coding or putting a call in. They have to by law,
25 they have to rely on the information given to them.
And so it really relies on how an officer or how a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 159

3 community member is describing the person. And if
4 they use certain buzzwords than they are handcuffed.
5 They can't send an alternative team when they want
6 to.

7 And so is there a plan to make, for example,
8 everyday community members better reporters, so they
9 aren't using stigmatizing language, so that they
10 aren't categorizing behavior that maybe-- might seem
11 like they are dangerous, but mental health
12 clinicians, for example, know that it is not, and
13 that they would be more than happy and more than
14 comfortable to be the people who respond.

15 So the three questions were: Do you agree that
16 instead of cuts in PEGs, those different social
17 services should be getting more funding in the
18 preliminary budget? Does the NYPD agree that they
19 are not the agency that should be doing a lot of this
20 work, and that somebody else should be doing it, and
21 that we need to invest in that? And third, are there
22 any plans or thoughts around that dispatch problem,
23 which really, really necessitates, I believe, a
24 education for community members who are looking to
25 help their neighbors?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 160

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: I'm going to touch on--
3 on all three questions, and then I'll hand it to PD
4 to talk about the second one.

5 I'll say that, you know, I don't have enough
6 information at my fingertips right now to make a
7 determination about whether-- like what the budget
8 should look like. What I will say is we-- we are in
9 from what I understand a budget crisis, and there--
10 there are going to be adjustments.

11 And I will note around B-HEARD specifically,
12 because I can talk about the B-HEARD budget, which is
13 one of the budgets that was-- that was cut, and the
14 B-HEARD budget was readjusted based on our expansion,
15 right? So it wasn't-- it was numerically cut in the
16 budget, but it was based on--

17 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: My understanding is that
18 there were like 50 positions that weren't filled.
19 And so that is being touted as a basis for reducing
20 that budget when, again, my argument is that actually
21 we need to be expanding an alternative workforce.

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Yeah, and we need to we
23 need to fill these lines, and we will fill these
24 lines as we expand to additional areas. So we'll be-

25 -

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 161

2 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: But we can't tell them
3 because of the PEGs.

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: We still have-- there
5 is still money in the B-HEARD budget to continue to
6 hire, again, both at H&H and at EMS--

7 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: But it's \$13 million less
8 than it was last year.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Correct. And it's
10 based on the rate of expansion that we see as
11 reasonable and feasible within this fiscal year. So
12 we are going to be expanding into parts of Queens by
13 the end of this fiscal year, and the budget is
14 reflective of that expansion.

15 So that's what I-- that's what I'll say about the
16 budget. I will also say around-- around B-HEARD,
17 right? B-HEARD is meant to be this alternative
18 response where it is located now. So in Northern
19 Manhattan, South Bronx and parts of Brooklyn, and we
20 are responding to upwards of 20% of the calls-- of
21 the Mental Health calls within our pilot areas within
22 the operational hours, which is higher than many of
23 the other municipalities that are really handling
24 about single digit numbers of their mental health
25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 162

3 calls, to include Denver, to include CAHOOTS out in
4 Eugene, Oregon.

5 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Can I ask a question? You
6 know, when those-- when those cities put out their
7 their evaluation reports every six months or so, and
8 I've read them, they're about 40-45 pages long, I had
9 the opportunity to take a look at B-HEARD's, and it
10 was seven, eight pages long. And so I think there's
11 like a lack of information for us to be able to
12 really, like, reflect on and think about, you know,
13 where are the pain points? What is working, what is
14 not? Where we're getting more input, and can be
15 better partners in the work and strengthening the
16 program. We know we need peers, we know we need-- we
17 know that there are other pain points that aren't
18 being talked about.

19 And so like, again, I think that there's--
20 there's so much promise, and I am a big champion of
21 this. But there's a lot of work that could and needs
22 to be done. And it continues to feel like the
23 prioritization is giving the police more and more and
24 more training to respond to a thing, instead of
25 really looking at these-- these other health-first
directives.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 163

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Understood, and I'll
3 pass it to NYPD on the dispatch and the NYPD
4 question.

5 CHIEF HOLMES: The dispatch, as far as the
6 community, that's a-- so currently right now, and I
7 am working with Communications-- Chief of
8 communications, where we're going to be doing a group
9 training, kind of overhauled communications.

10 What that plays on the community is completely
11 different. It can address the community with the
12 questions that the 911 operators are trained to ask
13 or inquire of, when someone is placing a call for
14 service.

15 But with that being said, I think you mentioned
16 about the NYPD responding to these-- look, as a-- as
17 a responsibility, as taking an oath to protect and
18 serve, we respond to incidents where I said, where
19 we're responding because there's a weapon mentioned,
20 or there's some sort of danger associated with it,
21 someone hears someone screaming, things of that
22 nature.

23 Do I think arbitrarily that's our that's our
24 assignment, and we should be responding? Only if the
25 circumstances present itself where there may be life-

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 164

3 threatening circumstances. Then we have to respond
4 to rule that out. It's what we do as a-- as a police
5 department.

6 CHIEF TOBIN: And to answer that, I want to say
7 that the NYPD supports alternative responses to
8 people in mental health crisis, to go-- to be handled
9 by the appropriate agency.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay, thank you.

11 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: And I mean, does that
12 support extend to being an advocate to say that we
13 shouldn't be doing this and other people should get
14 more resources to do it, and, you know, and I--
15 again, to give an example of like, what you answer
16 to: Some things are seen as a dangerous situation by
17 others or by police officers that are not by mental
18 health clinicians. And it could be-- it could be--
19 you might say, it's a weapon.

20 To give an example, I spoke to somebody who
21 responded to a call, where the person was
22 experiencing a mental health episode, and they had a
23 bunch of rocks in their pocket. And that might seem
24 like that's dangerous that you can't send somebody
25 in. The mental health responder said, "No, we want
to go in first. We're going to convince them to take

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 165

2 all the rocks and drop the rocks out of their
3 pockets. It's what we know how to do. We know how
4 to we know how to approach folks. We're going to sit
5 with them. We're going to do these things." It's a
6 much different approach than a police officer would
7 take, because of the way that you all are-- are
8 trained, right?

9 Like you are preparing for a different kind of
10 situation. You're preparing for the worst. Whereas
11 these folks are saying, "No, we recognize these
12 behaviors. We're not threatened by them. We're not
13 scared by them. We're the best people to de-escalate
14 here."

15 CHIEF HOLMES: I would say that was the case
16 years ago. We are trained for pretty much--
17 hopefully for any situation. De-escalation is a key,
18 key component to our training, where we go and we
19 don't over respond, right? Take time. Necessary
20 time, active listening, take a step back and see
21 what's going on and assess the situation.

22 We've been trained that since the Academy this
23 didn't this training didn't begin just with this
24 directive. From day one and police academy you have
25 over 40 hours of training throughout every

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 166

2 curriculum, scenario-based training, preparing you
3 hopefully for the best-case scenario or outcome to
4 the worst case scenario. But it's not where we're
5 just trained in one particular way.

6 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: I'm going to pass it over
7 to the Chair, but I will finish by saying, with all
8 due respect with all of the training, this has been
9 the deadliest year for people experiencing mental
10 health issues who have died at the hands of police,
11 and so that is why-- I mean like this is-- that is
12 why I-- I keep going so hard on this because the
13 training is not showing in the results.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Councilmember.

15 And I know Councilmember Holden, you also had
16 another question you want to ask?

17 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, just one question.
18 You know, this is for the doctor, possibly. But
19 upon-- when a patient is discharged, whether they
20 were involved in, you know, criminal justice arrest
21 or, but they were brought to the hospital for
22 treatment, is there a report that's required by the
23 state or the city to be generated by a physician or
24 the hospital?

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 167

2 And it's called the-- it was called-- I remember
3 talking to somebody, there's a, there's a report that
4 has to be generated. So these, so individuals don't
5 get, you know, like, kind of just put aside, that we
6 are following up.

7 DR. FATTAL: The only two reports I'm aware of
8 the NICS database and the safety. So the NICS
9 database that we have to-- if someone is admitted
10 involuntarily, we have to submit that data to the
11 state, and the other one that's related to the weapon
12 registry that we have to check. But other than that,
13 I'm not aware of one.

14 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Well, I understand that by
15 law -- this is what I was told -- that hospitals have
16 to generate a report that has to be filed. And H&H
17 is doing it. It's required. It's required from all
18 the hospitals, but that the private hospitals aren't
19 doing it, and that's why people are falling through
20 the cracks in the system. So if we could -- and
21 again, it's really, it's a state-- I was told that
22 it's a state law, that they have to generate a
23 report.

24

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 168

2 DR. FATTAL: I can't answer for other providers
3 outside of H&H. But, I can look more into this and
4 then get back to you.

5 COUNCILMEMBER HOLDEN: Yeah, if you can get back
6 to me, because that's important aspect. Because we
7 were told that that's-- you know, that's the problem.
8 That's why a lot of people are under the radar who
9 should be actually treated further in the mental
10 health area. Again, they're not-- there's no report.
11 Thank you. Thank you, Chair. I'm sorry.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And then I just had
13 one-- Oh, we've been joined also by Councilmember
14 Gennaro, so I just wanted to recognize him.

15 And then just one last question for myself also,
16 as well as a comment is: If you could clarify what--
17 what are the police officers and NYPD being-- NYPD
18 being trained to look for under "cannot meet basic
19 living needs?"

20 Because I just wanted to be clear, my
21 understanding was that the "cannot meet basic needs"
22 standard is not in the state law. It comes from the
23 state administration's interpretation of case law.
24 So if you could just clarify that, that'd be great.
25 And like, is it-- is it that they're barefoot? Is it

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 169

3 that they're-- you know, what are the what are the
4 more specific details, if you could go into that a
5 little bit?

6 CHIEF HOLMES: So it's something extreme, right?
7 Someone has open wounds and-- and obviously not
8 capable of seeking medical treatment, based on their
9 behavior, their thoughts, or their speech utterance,
10 ideation.

11 Or it's 10, below zero, and you have a T shirt on
12 and you're under cardboard box, and you're uttering
13 to yourself. And upon questioning, you're exhibiting
14 some sort of mental health crisis, compounded with
15 the fact that it's 10 below zero outside. Extreme
16 conditions is usually what they're trained for.

17 I mentioned earlier reeking of urine, that
18 ammonia smell, your clothes and your skin's not-- not
19 clean or rotting flesh, something extreme is what
20 they are-- those examples that they're trained to.

21 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. Councilmember
22 Gennaro, did you have any questions? No? Okay.

23 Thank you. And I just wanted to thank you for
24 being here and for taking the time to answer our
25 questions. I mean, clearly, this is an issue that
many, many of us care about. And on a personal

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 170

3 level, myself as well, I have very close family and
4 friends that suffer from severe mental illness, which
5 is why I got into nonprofit and social work to begin
6 with. And, you know, we know that the system is
7 broken, and it goes beyond just the agency sitting
8 here. There's a lot of advocacy we need to do at the
9 state level, insurance coverage of services, which is
10 very key to make sure that our nonprofits are staying
11 afloat is essential as well.

12 But the silo issue, I think, is something that
13 you've heard over and over again. And if you could
14 just, you know, something I want to make sure that we
15 do is to follow up. Because I do think that there is
16 a lot more data that we need. And this is sort of
17 just an initial hearing where we want to hopefully
18 start ongoing dialogue, conversation, because we need
19 to make sure that the data is being disseminated to
20 the public and that we have information and access to
21 information.

22 So thank you so much for being here today. And
23 with that, we're going to move on to our public
24 testimony.

25 DEPUTY DIRECTOR HANSMAN: Thanks so much.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 171

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: So I think we're going to just
4 take a quick few-minute break. And in the meantime,
5 if we could get the first panel ready to go. If you
6 want head-- So we're going to call up the first
7 panel. If you guys could get ready first.

8 I also strongly urge members of the
9 administration to remain for public testimony. I
10 feel like it would be extremely beneficial to hear
11 from the public.

12 COUNSEL SUCHER: While we're taking the break, I
13 will call up the first panel. It'll be Eric Vassal,
14 Ellen Trawick, Christine Henson, Karim Walker, and
15 Evelyn Graham Nyaasi. This will be a mixed panel so
16 we'll have in-person as well as Zoom.

17 All right, we will, we will begin. We're now
18 moving to public testimony.

19 I like to remind everyone that I will call up
20 individuals and panels and all testimony will be
21 limited to three minutes. Due to the large number of
22 people registered to testify, we will be strictly
23 enforcing the three-minute limit. And as a reminder,
24 written testimony may be submitted to the record up
25 to 72 hours after the close of this hearing by
emailing it to testimony@council.nyc.gov. The first

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 172

3 three panels will be mixed, meaning they will have
4 in-person as well as Zoom participants.

5 For our first panel, just to reiterate, we have
6 Karim Walker, Evelyn Graham Nyaasi in person, Eric
7 Vassell on Zoom, Ellen Trawick, on Zoom and Christine
8 Henson on Zoom.

9 Kareem Walker, you may begin one when ready.

10 MR. WALKER: Good afternoon, ladies and
11 gentlemen, the council My name is Karim Walker and
12 I'm an Outreach and an Organizing Specialist with the
13 Safety Net Project at the Urban Justice Center.

14 I want to talk about compassion and dignity.
15 Because these are central to why we are here today.
16 City Hall's call to hospitalize homeless people in
17 voluntarily and allow police officers to use their
18 discretion should give this body and the city writ
19 large pause in how we treat the most vulnerable and
20 dispossessed in our city in our city today. While
21 Mayor Adams has built this as a mental health
22 directive, we all know who the intended targets are:
23 the city's homeless. Over the past year the Mayor
24 has shown a willingness to use as aggressive as a
25 tactic as he possibly can to criminalize homelessness
in New York City. And he's shown a willingness to be

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 173

3 a bully when it comes to homeless people, as the
4 street sweeps have indicated, as evidenced with last
5 week's sweep of the Washington Hotel.

6 These forced hospitalizations would be no
7 different from the streets, and another part of his
8 plan is to police our homeless neighbors, out of
9 sight without properly addressing their material
10 needs.

11 My city has worked with homeless individuals who
12 have been threatened with hospitalizations such as a
13 military veteran, sleeping in Washington Square Park,
14 who was forcibly removed and hospitalized by
15 outreach, who refuse to believe that he was an
16 accomplished musician and only-- only after they
17 Googled his name did they realize who he was--
18 recognize who he was. We work with many in Manhattan
19 and Brooklyn who have been threatened with
20 hospitalizations during-- during sweeps as a-- as a
21 means of harassment, and the forced hospitalization
22 of homeless people who may not necessarily have a
23 mental illness, and by police officers who do not
24 have the medical or psychiatric training to handle
25 these, to recognize a messy healthy person from
someone who is that could have disastrous

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 174

3 consequences for the city and the individuals in
4 question. We have misgivings regarding the
5 demographics of those who this directive will impact
6 the most. As we know black and Latino New Yorkers
7 make up the overwhelming majority of homeless New
8 Yorkers. And the two groups that throughout this
9 city's history make up the disproportionate majority
10 of interactions with the police, interactions that
11 repeatedly have ended in violence or worse.

12 This measure fails to guarantee that the homeless
13 will have the dignity and the respect that they
14 deserve and the encounters with the police will be
15 safe and uneventful.

16 This directive is also a costly direct assault on
17 the New York City Human Rights Law among other
18 statutes, such as the 4th and 14th amendments of the
19 US Constitution, and possibly the Americans with
20 Disabilities Act, as had been argued in ongoing
21 litigation. Our municipal budget is a moral document
22 reflecting what we-- what we prioritize as a city.
23 And by increasing the budget of the NYPD while
24 simultaneously slashing funding to support public and
25 social services, Mayor Adams has shown his cards and
where his loyalties lie.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 175

3 There is no dignity in a man's plan, nor is there
4 a modicum of compassion. The only way a homeless
5 person can get can get those is through stable
6 housing.

7 Thank you for your time and I'll gladly answer
8 any questions.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much for your
10 testimony. And I love those words, compassion and
11 dignity, so I second that. Thank you.

12 MS. GRAHAM NYASSI: Thank you Chairperson Lee,
13 Hanks, Narcisse, and Brewer, and New York City
14 Councilmembers for allowing me to speak at this
15 hearing. My name is Evelyn Graham Nyaasi. I am an
16 Advocacy Specialist at Community Access, a Howard and
17 Harvard graduate with peer specialist training, and a
18 Steering Committee Member of Correct Crisis,
19 Intervention Today NYC.

20 I'm here because I would like you to reject Mayor
21 Adams's directives to expand the use of involuntary
22 hospitalization. I know firsthand what it is like.
23 One time I had eight to nine police officers come to
24 my home because someone said I had a knife. I didn't
25 have a knife, and I didn't argue a fight with them

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 176

3 because I didn't want to be harmed or killed. So I
4 followed their instructions.

5 As a result, I ended up involuntarily
6 hospitalized at Bellevue, I was placed in a room that
7 had people screaming and yelling, and we were locked
8 up like animals. It was traumatizing, and it still
9 affects me today.

10 Because I didn't know my rights, I wasn't
11 released until two weeks later. It is because of my
12 personal story that I have learned that power of
13 peers, and I firmly believe that all Mental Health
14 Crisis Response Teams must be led by peers. Peers
15 can make an individual feel safe, because they
16 understand what they're going through, and
17 furthermore, the police presence can be traumatizing.
18 Even uniforms can be traumatizing. Police do not
19 know how to de escalate the situation. And only
20 about 36% of all new police officers have CIT
21 training, and four hours or four days is definitely
22 not enough to change them.

23 Peers are being used to initiate conversation
24 with individuals experiencing a mental health crisis
25 all over the US. Trust must be developed, and that
can only happen with peers who have lived experience.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 177

3 I know this firsthand. Because this past fall, I
4 went to Portland, Oregon, and visited the Portland
5 Street Response Program, which is supposed to be like
6 B-HEARD, but it incorporates peers.

7 I'm asking that you please reject the Mayor's
8 proposal, and instead advocate for expansion of peer
9 specialist. Peers are the best people equipped to
10 support these crises, make them feel safe, and ask
11 them if they'd like to go to the hospital, a crisis
12 stabilization center, or crisis respite, which is a
13 much less traumatizing experience than being forced
14 to go to the hospital.

15 Thank you all for your time. And I'm available
16 for questions.

17 Before I leave, I like to ask that you not allow
18 Mayor Adams plan to be forcefully hospitalized people
19 with mental challenges. Instead, New York City
20 should use taxpayer dollars to provide more
21 supportive housing and better health care for those
22 who are unsafely housed. Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And you had a
24 question?

25 COUNCILMEMBER CABÁN: Yes. Thank you for your
testimony. And I just, I just want everybody here to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 178

3 know who Evelyn is and what she does. She is an
4 incredible peer advocate and a leader who is teaching
5 all of us a lot. I had the privilege of also joining
6 Evelyn in Portland on that field trip. I was there
7 with a number of other Councilmembers from across the
8 country who deeply care about mental health crises,
9 were they are representing, and they brought
10 different staff members.

11 And can I tell you that that those folks and
12 myself learned just as much from the Portland Street
13 Response Team as we did from Evelyn, because she's a
14 directly impacted person who has been doing this work
15 for a very long time. And so I would just urge the
16 Administration, and other folks who have any ability
17 to strengthen these programs, and change these
18 responses, to talk to people like Evelyn, to talk to
19 people and organizations like CCIT, who are experts
20 in the space. So I want to thank you for the work
21 that that you do. It is deeply, deeply appreciated.

22 MS. GRAHAM NYASSI: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Evelyn, for sharing
24 your story and also the importance of showing us the
25 importance of peer work, as well as lived experience
in this work. So thank you.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 179

2 And next week, we'll have Eric on Zoom.

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

4 MR. KIM: Hi, Mr. Eric Vassell had an emergency
5 here to attend to. So my name is Danny Kim. I'm an
6 organizer with the Justice Committee, which is a
7 member organization of Communities United for Police
8 Reforms, and Mr. Vassal asked me to read his
9 testimony on his behalf.

10 "My name is Eric Vassell. I'm the father of
11 Saheed Vassell who was killed by the NYPD on
12 April 4 2018. I'm here to oppose Mayor Adams's
13 directive to force hospitalization on people with
14 mental illnesses. This is not a plan. It is
15 giving the NYPD more power to sweep people off
16 the street just because officers think they don't
17 have a place to stay, or have a mental illness.

18 This is the opposite of what communities
19 need. We need affordable housing and quality
20 mental health care. I know this firsthand
21 because I watched the city's health care system
22 fail my son long before the NYPD killed him.

23 Saheed first started to struggle with mental
24 illness after his close friend was killed by the
25 police. We could not find programs in our

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 180

3 community that would help him and treat him like
4 a human. Without anywhere else to turn we would
5 call 911. The police and EMS would take him to
6 the hospital but instead of helping, they just
7 gave him a whole lot of pills and locked him
8 down. For Saheed being in the hospital was like
9 being in prison.

10 NYPD anti crime and SRT officers murdered my
11 son without warning at a busy intersection in
12 broad daylight. My son was unarmed and not a
13 threat to anyone. None of the officers were ever
14 disciplined.

15 My son's story is not unique. Muhammad Bah's
16 mother was not able to find services for her son,
17 so she called 911. The NYPD showed up and killed
18 him. Kawaski Trawick, Deborah Danner, Imam
19 Morales. There are too many names. Too many
20 community members do not have homes. Too many
21 struggle with mental illness. And with the
22 pandemic it has only gotten worse.

23 Instead of making a plan to address this
24 mayor Adams is cutting budgets for housing and
25 healthcare and throwing more police at this
problem. Police officers don't have the skills

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 181

2 to diagnose or care for people. They only have
3 the skills to criminalize and arrest people.

4 I'm calling on the New York City Council to
5 stop the Mayor's dangerous forced hospitalization
6 directive, and to invest in housing, community
7 based mental health care and other services for
8 our communities. Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. We'll now
10 move to Ellen Trawick. After that we'll have
11 Christine Hanson, and then Oren Barzilay.

12 Ellen, you may begin when ready.

13 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

14 MS. TRAWICK: get to know my name is Ellen
15 Trawick, and I am the mother of Kawaski Trawick who
16 was killed by NYPD officer Brandon Thompson and
17 Herbert Davis on April 14, 2019.

18 I was appalled to learn that Matt Adams has
19 directed the NYPD to sweep people off the street and
20 force them into hospitals just because officers
21 decide that they were mentally ill or homeless.

22 Sending the NYPD to respond to people who are
23 struggling with mental illness issues has already
24 caused New Yorkers too many lives, including my son.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 182

2 Mayor Adams directive will only lead to more
3 brutality.

4 In 2016, Kawaski came to New York to follow his
5 dream. In 2019, the NYPD destroyed those dreams and
6 stole him away from me.

7 Kawaski lived in a supportive housing facility in
8 the Bronx. He was living there to receive care for
9 his health. Instead the facility called 911 on him.

10 Officer Brandon Thompson and Herbert Davis showed
11 up, illegally entered his home, barking orders and
12 refused to answer any questions.

13 Officer Thompson tased him and shot him within
14 112 seconds. Neither Thompson nor Davis tried to
15 administer any aid. They just closed the door and
16 left him to die.

17 From Kawaski's story, it's clear New York City
18 Health Care System and the NYPD does not see black
19 people as humans. Both of the officers who killed
20 Kowalski had-- had been to CIT training. One of them
21 within three days of murdering my son.

22 That shows you police have no business being
23 involved in mental health response. Yet Mayor Adam
24 is giving them more power in this area.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 183

3 I'm calling on the City Council to stand with me
4 and my family and other family members who have lost
5 their loved ones to the NYPD in opposing Mayor Adam's
6 forced hospitalization. Instead, New York City must
7 focus on making sure that people like my son get the
8 care they need by investing in community-based
9 service and treat them with dignity. I am also
10 asking city councilors to call on Mayor Adams and
11 Commissioner Sewell to ensure Officer Davis and
12 Officer Thompson are fired, and to stand with me at
13 the NYPD trial officer of Officer Davis and Officer
14 Thompson, which will start on April the 24th. I'm
15 sorry. I just want to say thank you you for having
16 me here today. Thank you.

17 Thank you so much, Ellen, for sharing your story.

18 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to Christine
19 Hanson. You may begin when you're ready.

20 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

21 MS. HENSON: Hi. Hello. Thanks for having me,
22 and allowing me this opportunity to speak. My name
23 is Christine Henson and I'm the mother of Andrew
24 Henson, who is affected by autism and limited speech
25 abilities. When he was 16, he was assaulted by
several police officers. Since then, I have been

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 184

3 afraid for Andrew's life. A lot of what I've heard
4 today is making that feeling worse. I'm here to
5 oppose the Mayor's involuntary hospitalization
6 directive and Intro 273. The NYPD should be
7 completely removed from responding to people with
8 mental illness and people affected by autism. In
9 2018, I had a meeting with the principal. I
10 requested a speech evaluation at Bronx Care. She
11 arranged for it to happen that day, and she had a
12 staff member, the assistant principal corps for EMS
13 to transport us to that location, Bronx Care. Over
14 two and a half dozen officers from two different
15 precincts were present.

16 When we got out of the ambulance, Andrew told me
17 he wanted to get something to eat. So he took one
18 step, as we had to go get food. Within seconds, the
19 EMT worker put his hand on him and told him you're
20 not going anywhere. And I said we're here
21 voluntarily. And then police officers rushed over
22 and they piled on top of my son. Five officers
23 helped my son's arms behind his back while his neck
24 was choked and twisted. And again my son is affected
25 by limited speech abilities. I saw my son's body go
limp while his hands were held behind his back. They

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 185

3 were twisting him as if he wasn't human. He was
4 taken inside into the waiting area, where his face
5 was placed down on a seat and his knees were pressed
6 down on the ground. He was forced in a position. My
7 voice was ignored when I say he has special needs.
8 My son needed care, voluntary care. Instead, my son
9 was forced and criminalized and mistreated and
10 violated. When we should have received something to
11 receive assistance for him, he was traumatized.

12 So he's re-traumatized now, because he's been
13 recently affected by police officers again. Since
14 2018, he regressed. I now have to buy my son
15 diapers. That excessive force that he experienced
16 has altered his life. I live my life moreso now than
17 ever fearing for his safety, because he's a young
18 male of color, and he's someone that was affected by
19 a violent type of assault by police officers. He
20 didn't deserve that.

21 There is no amount of training that will prepare
22 NYPD officers to respond to people like my son with
23 autism or people with other disabilities and mental
24 illness. The purpose of NYPD is to arrest and
25 criminalize people, not to care for them. Intro 273
may be good intention, but it will only teach--

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 186

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time Expired.

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Oh. Go ahead and finish.

4 Sorry.

5 MS. HENSON: Please. If we keep sending armed
6 officers to help people in distress or people with
7 limited speech over disabilities, we will keep
8 getting violence and deaths, and Intro 273 must be
9 opposed. We need to completely remove NYPD from
10 responding to those who are struggling with mental
11 illness or disabilities. We need to keep them safe.
12 We need to get police out of schools. We need to
13 have them respected. They are human too. They just
14 need a different type of love and care.

15 Please, I thank you for this opportunity. I just
16 would like to see my son live a very long time
17 without being mistreated ever again. He cries when
18 he sees police officers, and he shakes. I've never
19 seen that in anyone.

20 Please, I'm asking with respect to save his life
21 and his safety. We shouldn't have to live in fear.
22 Every day of his life, I live in fear. And he
23 doesn't deserve that. He just deserves to live.
24 Thank you so much. Thank you for this opportunity.
25 Thank you so much. Thank you.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 187

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Christine.

3 COUNCEL SUCHER: Next, we'll hear from Oren

4 Barzilay. You may begin when ready.

5 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

6 MR. BARZILAY: Good morning, Committee

7 Chairperson and honorable Councilmembers. My name is

8 Oren Barzilay. I'm a 25-year veteran of the FDNY

9 EMS, and I'm president of Local 2507. I am here

10 today to spotlight a very considerable issue for our

11 city EMTs and paramedics, who despite their pivotal

12 role in serving and protecting New Yorkers, fear

13 Mayor Adams policy to forcibly take people believed

14 to have mental illness to hospitals against their

15 will has increased in already significant number of

16 assaults on our members.

17 Over the past two years there have been over 200

18 reported assaults on active EMS workers. From where

19 I am, I can tell you that it is more than that. EMT

20 assaults are at an all time high, doubling in the

21 last year, and many hundreds of members are not even

22 reporting them. Why bother due to the lack of any

23 action at all by both the department and the City?

24 When we arrive at the scene of an emergency, we

25 don't carry guns like NYPD has. We don't have access

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 188

3 like our counterparts, firefighters brethren. We
4 roll up to the scene of an emergency with a doctor's
5 back to provide medical care. The Mayor's policy
6 doesn't change things. We need significantly more
7 funding and getting trained people into the system.
8 The policy does not consider the severe staffing
9 shortages among our workforce and the lack of
10 training handling these matters.

11 FDNY EMS call volume have doubled in recent years
12 yet headcount has remained the same or dropped. It's
13 placing an additional burden on the EMS system.

14 My members are unarmed and get routinely
15 assaulted as it stands now. We know that forcing
16 people with mental health issues to unwillingly
17 comply with the policy can place EMTs in harm's way.
18 My worry is that this policy is exacerbating the
19 danger our members are faced with on a daily basis.
20 The City is not doing much about the assaults on our
21 members as is. If you're faced with such high chance
22 of getting assaulted in your workplace, it's an
23 employer's responsibility to keep the workforce safe.
24 That protection of our members is absolutely not
25 happening right now. EMS is being totally and
completely starved of necessary resources to allow us

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 189

2 to work safe and protect the city's citizens at the
3 same time. Where are we going to put all these
4 patients that need mental health? The state closed
5 down state psychiatric centers like Creekmore in
6 Queens, which can has thousands. EMS is so beyond
7 short staffed that you would think that our call
8 volume reaching 5000 calls a day, that the department
9 would take steps to increase resources.

10 Instead, we are tasked with more responsibility
11 that only put EMTs in more dangerous.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired. You're asking
13 people who are making \$17 to \$18 an hour to put their
14 life on the line. We must not forget the lives of
15 EMTs and paramedics lost while on duty by the people
16 we work to serve and assist. The policy may be well
17 intentioned, but our city's leaders have to recognize
18 that these new responsibilities add more strain on
19 our severely understaffed, overworked, and underpaid
20 workers.

21 The dedicated women and men of EMS and the
22 citizens we are sworn to protect deserve better than
23 we have been subjected to. Thank you all for your
24 time and consideration.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 190

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. We'll move
4 on to the next panel. And for those family members
5 that are still on and listening, thank you so much
6 for waiting, and for sharing stories of your family
7 members. I know it must be painful, so I just wanted
8 to say thank you.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move on to our second
10 panel which will also be mixed between in-person and
11 Zoom. For in-person we'll have Beth Haroules from
12 NYCLU, Elena Landriscina from Legal Aid Society, and
13 Siya Hegde from Bronx Defenders. On Zoom, we'll have
14 Selena Trowell from Communities For Police Reform,
15 and then Anthony Feliciano. Selena, you will be the
16 first to testify on this panel, so you may begin when
17 ready.

18 MS. TROWELL: Good afternoon. My name is Selena
19 Trowel, and I'm testifying on behalf of Vocal New
20 York Homeless Union who was a member of Communities
21 United For Police Reform. My role at Vocal New York
22 is that of the Homelessness Union organizer, where I
23 do street outreach and engage and build collective
24 power among those who are actively and formerly
25 homeless through membership. In addition to my role
as an organizer, I'm also a licensed social worker

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 191

3 and a lifelong resident of District 41 Brownsville
4 Brooklyn, where the rate of adult psychiatric
5 hospitalization is nearly triple the citywide rate.

6 The Administration has yet to provide the public
7 with a plan of transparency and accountability, and
8 also provide proof that we are not wasting our time
9 reinventing the broken wheel of the 80s. For decades
10 to treatment-first approach has failed hundreds of
11 New Yorkers, and today will continue to perpetuate
12 the cycle of involuntary confinements, short-term
13 treatments, and discarding of human beings right back
14 to the streets because the city has refused to
15 prioritize utilization of available housing stock as
16 a public health approaches housing and mental health
17 crisis. A study done in 2019 showed that housing,
18 when connected with supportive services, specifically
19 for those with severe mental health complexities was
20 extremely cost effective.

21 Once you question if we have an administration
22 that has identified 2000 empty supportive housing
23 units with thousands of people on the streets, why
24 did the city opt to only cherry pick at individuals
25 for a copycat pilot program. In 2020, 26 studies in
the United States and Canada compared treatment-first

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 192

3 versus housing-first models. It found that housing-
4 first programs decreased homelessness by 88%, and
5 improve housing stability by 41%. And for those who
6 are immunocompromised health, it reduce homelessness
7 by 37%, viral loads of 22%, depression of 13%,
8 emergency department used by 41%, hospitalizations by
9 36%, with the mortality rate by 37%.

10 Coercive mental health treatment is a form of
11 carceral institutionalization that further
12 exacerbates the health and trauma of those on the
13 street. The answer, according to decades of research
14 has and will always be housing. Why do we continue
15 to ignore decades of evidence-based empirical data
16 that tells us housing is in fact mental, physical,
17 and emotional health care? The Mayor's directive is
18 antithetical to providing a solid infrastructure of
19 trust, housing, services, and community support. New
20 Yorkers need a public-health-based approach that is
21 addressing mental health and homelessness that puts
22 public health workers and peers at the forefront of
23 engagement and expands voluntary mental health care
24 services and supports.

25 The trauma of police guns, garbage trucks, and
involuntary removals, are being toted under the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 193

3 pretense of care and compassion and housing. It is
4 deeply concerning to see police be used to fill the
5 gaps in the public health sector where there while
6 there are simultaneous cuts of expert critical
7 infrastructure.

8 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time expired.

9 MS. TROWELL: One more minute please, for the
10 Department of Mental health and Hygiene, the
11 Department of Social Services, the Department of DHS,
12 and Department of Housing and Community Development.
13 We are calling on the Mayor and this administration
14 to end all considerations and implementation of this
15 harmful and socially irresponsible directive, and to
16 invest in housing and care that is decarcerated,
17 trauma-informed, and evidence-based.

18 Also in acknowledging Black History Month, I am
19 also testifying in honor of the life and legacy of
20 Joyce Billie Boggs Brown, with a history of street
21 homelessness, drug use, and mental health
22 complexities, Ms. Brown, a black woman who in 1987,
23 would single handedly seek out legal teams and
24 successfully petition that then Mayor Ed Koch in the
25 city for her release from a psychiatric facility
after being swept off the street and involuntarily

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 194

3 admitted under the failed program of Project Health.

4 After becoming stable and housed, she would travel to
5 the likes of Harvard and Yale University to lecture
6 about how to fight for self agency and housing in New
7 York City. Thank you for your time.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to our three in-
10 person panelists, and then Anthony Feliciano, you
11 will go after these three individuals testify. So
12 first, we'll hear from Beth Haroules. You may begin
13 when ready.

14 MS. HAROULES: Thank you for holding these
15 oversight hearings. They are well delayed. This
16 process has been rolled out in November, and we
17 didn't hear anything today that provided us with any
18 information about what exactly is going on, when
19 Mayor Adams has directed the mental hygiene arrests
20 of potentially hundreds of thousands of New Yorkers
21 who are unhoused and dealing with mental health
22 issues.

23 Our written comments address the variety of
24 resources that are being diverted here into a failed
25 strategy of involuntary psychiatric hospitalizations
and forced treatment. We do an analysis of how this

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 195

3 policy in fact allows removals that are not justified
4 under the state or federal constitution, or the rest
5 of the complex web of laws and guidance that govern
6 in this field. We just heard about Joyce Brown
7 Billie Boggs. Miss Brown was a client of the New
8 York Civil Liberties Union in connection with her
9 struggle for self-determination. And today to see
10 OMH and the city perverting that case law that looked
11 to a very extreme set of circumstances that justified
12 involuntary retention. She was never swept off the
13 streets in the way that this policy contemplates.

14 Certainly the policy reflects and exacerbates
15 bias. Everything that we have heard from the Mayor,
16 the Administration, and from the partnership of the
17 Governor perpetuates bias and stigma and draws a
18 direct line between a person who is unhoused and
19 suffering with suffering, experiencing mental health
20 challenges and violence that is just about to be
21 triggered against the public. People with mental
22 illness, people who are unhoused, are more likely
23 than anyone else to be themselves the subject of
24 violence and trauma.

25 We didn't hear and we know the council is very
interested in making sure there's appropriate

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 196

3 collection of data, transparency, and accountability.

4 Here our testimony provides you with a number of
5 categories.

6 We did not hear an answer to the question of how
7 many New Yorkers have in fact been brought in for
8 evaluation under a mental hygiene arrest by law
9 enforcement under this policy. We also didn't hear
10 how many people who had been brought in on a mental
11 hygiene arrest basis were in fact admitted. A person
12 who was brought in for observation has no right to
13 counsel, Mental Hygiene Legal Services does not
14 represent those folks when they are in a psych
15 setting until they have been admitted, until status
16 has been conferred. There are no discharge planning
17 provisions that will attach to a person who's brought
18 in for observation and released in that 72-hour
19 period. We didn't hear any of that today. We didn't
20 hear any plans. We didn't hear any details. We
21 heard absolutely nothing other than the information
22 that has been released by press release and very
23 selectively by discharge of particular information to
24 the New York Post.

25 To hear that the telehealth backup support went
live last week is just astonishing. We don't know

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 197

3 who, what clinical lines are staffing that supportive
4 backup. What we heard today, though, is very
5 concerning. It's NYPD all the time out on the street
6 under failed crisis intervention training, and a
7 video that they watched at the start of their shifts.

8 That is unacceptable. It is immoral. It is
9 unconstitutional.

10 Thank you for having this hearing today. We look
11 forward to working with the Council. We did submit
12 comments on the two incidents before you. I share
13 the concerns of the family member who testified with
14 respect to attempting to train the NYPD to respond to
15 people with autism. It leaves them completely
16 unprotected. I'm Willowbrook class counsel at the
17 NYCLU. There are numbers of people with
18 developmental disabilities who are not protected by
19 that particular end. And there are numbers of people
20 with disabilities who are not protected by that and
21 you can talk to your NYPD and mandate them to behave
22 towards people with dignity and humanity. They
23 should never be interacting with anyone's
24 disabilities. Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And we
definitely have shared interest in receiving a lot of

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 198

3 that data and pressing them on that. So that's
4 something that we're going to follow up with as well.
5 So thank you.

6 Hello. The Bronx Defenders thanks the council's
7 joint leadership for holding this very important
8 oversight hearing.

9 My name is Siya Hegde, and while I testify today
10 in my capacity as Housing Policy Counsel to the Bronx
11 Defenders civil action practice, my testimony really
12 does encompass a holistic defender perspective to
13 highlight our collective concerns around this
14 directive and its far-reaching consequences on the
15 communities that we serve in the Bronx.

16 So as holistic defenders we are positioned to
17 defend against structural systemic failures of
18 directives like this that trigger our clients family
19 separation, threats of eviction and displacement from
20 homes, lack of access to essential support services,
21 and violation of their civil liberties. Black and
22 Latino identifying people of color in the Bronx have
23 suffered decades of over-policing, surveillance, and
24 other racially discriminatory violent practices by
25 law enforcement agents that are completely
inexcusable.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 199

3 Rather than committing to addressing the unmet
4 needs of New Yorkers who are unhoused or at risk of
5 being unhoused. This directive sets a dangerous
6 precedent for public safety, while reinforcing such
7 historic discriminatory measures.

8 So since it took effect, there are two anecdotes,
9 two stories that I'd like to uplift our client Mr. A,
10 a queer identifying black man with serious mental
11 health conditions was sent to a psychiatric emergency
12 room against his will. This all took place during a
13 verbal dispute with a family member who alleged that
14 Mr. A was refusing his medications without any
15 display of violent behavior exhibited on his part,
16 and a licensed social worker from our office who
17 advocated on his behalf to law enforcement agents and
18 EMS staff. He was eventually deemed ineligible for
19 admittance by hospital personnel, with the treating
20 psychologist describing his situation as unjust.

21 As additional context here, Mr. A is fighting an
22 eviction case And of grave concern the Mayor's
23 directive, as we see, was abused as a means of
24 circumventing court process to displace him from his
25 home.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 200

3 Similarly, another client Miss P, a black woman
4 with underlying mental health conditions, who was a
5 victim in an alleged domestic incident was forcibly
6 grabbed and pinned to her bed by police officers who
7 handcuffed her violently, and she was injected with
8 what appeared to be a sedative by EMT personnel. As
9 she allegedly resisted arrest and verbally expressed
10 her desire for treatment and therapy, she eventually
11 charged with assaulting an officer and an EMT
12 personnel and taken against her will to a hospital.

13 Though she is no longer admitted to that hospital
14 at present police intervention led to her criminal
15 prosecution and her children being removed from her
16 care and custody by ACS.

17 As these stories demonstrate the critical dangers
18 of forced institutionalization do not make
19 communities safer. Instead, as we've heard, they
20 mimic the deleterious harms of carceral punishment
21 when law enforcement agents are given untethered
22 deference to make clinical diagnoses and presume an
23 individual's threats to public safety in the absence
24 of medical recommendations.

25 Therefore, the Bronx defenders urges the Council
to rollback this initiative and instead invest in

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 201

3 community mental health services and housing
4 investments that directly to the needs of this
5 vulnerable group and offer voluntary support without
6 entangling people in more harmful systems.

7 We expressly asked the council to permanently
8 fund programs like the MOCJ emergency reentry hotels,
9 emergency housing that provides barrier free holistic
10 support and social services, including humane
11 compassionate medical care, and offer residents
12 access to vocational and educational opportunities
13 and pathways to permanent housing.

14 Thank you so much again, for the opportunity to
15 testify. We do intend to submit written comments and
16 we very much appreciate your thoughts and
17 considerations. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Siya.

19 MS. LANDRISCINA: Thank you. We applaud the
20 Committees for their oversight over this important
21 issue. Mayor Adams would have us believe that
22 individual bad choices have caused people with mental
23 illness to be unable to care for their basic needs.
24 He has said for example, that people who urgently
25 need treatment quote, "refuse it when offered." This
type of rhetoric obscures how the government is

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 202

3 furthering discrimination and racial injustice. The
4 city is responsible for providing a comprehensive
5 system of community-based care for people with
6 disabilities. Under federal disability rights law,
7 the city is required to administer this system in a
8 manner that enables people with disabilities to be
9 accommodated in the most integrated setting
10 appropriate to their needs. This law recognizes that
11 unnecessary institutionalization is discrimination.

12 Most people with mental illness can be served in
13 the community. What that looks like is people living
14 in safe integrated housing where they can be decision
15 makers and maintain their relationships. It looks
16 like people having individualized support to help
17 them navigate systems and obtain care. In the words
18 of a legal aid client, housing keeps the body and
19 soul together. Our client lived in a shelter for 14
20 months. He was also involuntarily committed for an
21 entire summer which he described as traumatizing. By
22 contrast, housing offers stability.

23 Our practices represent many people who are not
24 in housing. The Mayor's Office estimates that
25 approximately 40% of the shelter population has
26 mental illness. The state estimates that 4000

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 203

3 individuals with mental illness live on the streets.

4 The city is effectively doubling down on this crisis.

5 Rather than provide services in integrated settings,

6 the city's directive shunts people into hospitals.

7 Our clients experienced the consequences of the

8 city's failure to develop an effective system every

9 day. They rotate through a revolving door of

10 institutions, jails, shelters, hospitals, rarely

11 receiving the treatment and services and housing that

12 they need. The city lacks adequate outpatient

13 services, residential treatment programs, housing and

14 supportive services, and these deficiencies have a

15 devastating impact. First, people with mental

16 illness spend longer periods in jail, because DAs and

17 judges refuse or reject proposed release plans until

18 housing is secured. Our attorneys move mountains to

19 find scarce housing to free our clients from abysmal

20 jail conditions.

21 In other cases our clients are discharged to

22 shelters that are unsafe, and there they languish as

23 their applications for housing and services are

24 slowly processed in an overly bureaucratic system.

25 The mayor's proposal to further cut social

services will exacerbate these problems. The city

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 204

3 must ensure that voluntary services are available and
4 accessible. It should maximize the state's proposed
5 investments in mental health to provide adequate
6 care. Without such efforts the city effectively
7 condemns our clients to a vicious cycle of
8 institutionalization and the involuntary removals
9 policy does nothing to break the cycle. It keeps it
10 spinning instead. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

12 COUNSEL We'll now turn to Anthony Feliciano on
13 Zoom, you may begin when ready.

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

15 MR. FELICIANO: Thank you for the opportunity to
16 testify. My name is Anthony Feliciano. I am the
17 Vice President for Community Mobilization at Housing
18 Works. Housing Works urges the Council to exercise
19 its oversight authority to reject the Mayor's Adams
20 proposal to scale up involuntary law enforcement
21 driven responses to New Yorkers with unmet mental
22 health needs, who struggle to survive on our streets
23 and subways.

24 This directive erodes the confidentiality of the
25 medical information. While coercive mental health
treatment has not proven to have better outcomes than

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 205

3 voluntary. It is disproportionately applied to
4 black, Latinx, immigrants, LGBTQI people and other
5 communities of color while often over-diagnosed and
6 underserved. It skips over the issue that was
7 seriously underfunded public health mental health
8 system, an almost completely lack of safe and
9 appropriate housing placements for people with
10 Serious Mental Illness. The NYPD has a track record,
11 as we all know, of being violent and deadly when
12 responding to people experiencing, or perceiving to
13 be experiencing a mental health crisis, and abusing
14 New Yorkers experiencing homelessness. At Housing
15 Works, we know from regular experience how difficult
16 or impossible it is to access for Serious Mental
17 Illness. We are unable to access desperately needed
18 mental health even for residents of our supported
19 housing programs. Indeed, a significant challenge
20 facing Housing Works and other supporting housing
21 providers are in the unmet needs of residents who
22 experience significant mental health crisis, often
23 combined with substance abuse disorder.

24 We offer 700 units of supportive housing for the
25 most vulnerable New Yorkers, including many
residents, people dealing with co-occurring mental

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 206

3 health and substance abuse issues. While the overall
4 majority of residents manage these and other issues
5 to behavioral health care provided by Housing Works
6 and other community based providers, not infrequently
7 will a resident experience a crisis that will
8 necessitate transfer by an EMS to the hospital, and
9 invariably these residents are released within a few
10 hours with no outpatient treatment plan.

11 In one extreme case last week, Housing Works
12 called emergency services four times over the course
13 of three days up for a resident experiencing
14 psychotic episodes. Each time he was released back
15 to us without any intervention, to the frustration to
16 all. Supportive housing is a compassionate and
17 effective intervention, but while access to inpatient
18 and outpatient mental health and substance abuse use
19 disorder treatment, untreated residents pose great
20 issues and concerns for all of us.

21 One of our asks here is the Mayor must make a
22 major aim of transparency about how a voluntary
23 removal directive be implemented, and the impact on
24 communities and neighborhoods. The Mayor's office
25 should make public the details of how many more New
Yorkers are being involuntary detained, on what

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 207

3 grounds, how long they're being kept in the hospital,
4 and what kind of care support they receive during and
5 at discharge. We also call on the Council to demand
6 decisive action to promote the housing and services
7 required to meet the need of many shelter and
8 unsheltered people.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: Time has has expired.

10 MR. FELICIANO: And finally, I think we need a
11 lot in terms of stabilization also. We heard about
12 the MOCJs, but also want for us to understand the
13 State and the City's connection here when they asked
14 for more psychiatric beds.

15 We need to know where those beds are going. We
16 need to have community input and community-driven
17 initiatives that are around mental health. And right
18 now, what this directive does is it again harms the
19 most vulnerable communities in New York. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Anthony. Good to
21 see you. And Councilmember Brewer had a couple
22 questions, I think?

23 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you. Just for any
24 of the panelists here, and thank you all for your
25 service. The-- I mean, when I talk to the community
26 mental health providers, they just don't have the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 208

2 staff, they can't retain staff, et cetera. So I'm
3 just wondering if that is what you are experiencing
4 in terms of trying to find locations for endless
5 support and ongoing support for your-- for the people
6 you're representing.

7 MS. HAROULES: I mean, certainly, we are
8 experiencing a massive staffing shortage. But staff
9 who work in these particular community-based
10 programs, including programs for people with limited
11 English proficiency, are not recognized in terms of
12 worth and value, which goes to why there is a
13 workforce retention issue.

14 This is a very difficult job, for a person to
15 provide hands on compassionate services to people
16 with disabilities, and they're not recognized. And
17 you know, we see you know, the funders, government
18 sheltering behind the pandemic. This was an issue
19 that existed before the pandemic. The pandemic
20 obviously has made it worse. What we're seeing here
21 is a diversion of resources into a policing model as
22 opposed into service supports, including housing
23 supports. We really urge the council during the
24 budget hearings to focus on that. We do not need
25 more policing resources.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 209

2 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: I understand that. I'm--
3 I'm very specific oriented after--

4 MS. HAROULES: Yeah. Workforce.

5 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Okay. Anything from the
6 Bronx?

7 MS. HEGDE: I'll echo the sentiment that yes, we
8 are in a severe staffing shortage. And I'm not
9 saying that just from the angle of support services
10 on the ground that are operating in connection to
11 courts. But you know, in our office, we do have a
12 fairly large staff, one of the largest one largest
13 public defender offices in the country, really. And
14 to think that our staffing operation of social
15 workers who are so critical, so-- so-- I mean, the
16 example that I gave. It's like if that social worker
17 was not on the line with NYPD, even despite her
18 incredible skill set and holistic assessment of what
19 the situation was, you know, I really fear for what
20 folks on the ground who are-- were the most
21 vulnerable, have to risk here in terms of advocates
22 who are looking out for them.

23 And I think that's something that we've seen from
24 a funding angle from the angle of, you know, legal
25 service, holistic providers and care, and to think

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 210

3 that there are ways that this directive could harm
4 court process and you know, to use to circumvent
5 court process that we see in housing eviction
6 proceedings, where the numbers in the Bronx are
7 absolutely so voluminous as is, is a real, real
8 concern. So something that we need to keep mindful
9 of with staffing.

10 MS. LANDRISCINA: And I'll just say I agree. I
11 mean, we hear about staffing, and that really goes to
12 how the entire system is not adequately funded, so
13 that people in the workforce are being recognized and
14 valued.

15 COUNCILMEMBER BREWER: Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. And as
17 someone who came from a language-culturally-specific
18 nonprofit organization, I can tell you that it is
19 extremely difficult to find social workers and
20 workforce as is. But then especially on top of that,
21 if you add the language component, it's even much
22 more difficult. And it took-- and on the other side
23 of the spectrum, you know, it took four years for me
24 to start up our outpatient mental health clinic
25 because it-- we saw so many rates of suicide going up
in our community, which is why we felt the need to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 211

3 create a clinic from the community itself that they
4 trust and that they know, which I think is very
5 important, but the licensing piece is extremely
6 difficult. So that's a separate issue that we could
7 spend a whole day on.

8 But I'm-- just to emphasize that I think that's
9 something that we need to advocate for on this-- on
10 the state level as well.

11 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you so much. This panel
12 will now be moving to our next one, which will also
13 be a mix of in person and Zoom. For in person,
14 Joshua Stanton. And then on Zoom, please be prepared
15 to testify following Mr. Stanton, it'll be Greg
16 Hughes from Mobilization For Justice. Antonine
17 Pierre from Brooklyn Movement Center, Toni Smith from
18 Drug Policy Alliance, and Danielle Regis from
19 Brooklyn Defender Services. Mr. Stanton, when you're
20 ready, you may begin.

21 RABBI STANTON: Good afternoon and thank you so
22 much to the Committee Chairs and Councilmembers. I'm
23 Rabbi Joshua Stanton speaking on behalf of Tirdof:
24 New York Jewish Clergy for Justice, which is a joint
25 program of T'ruah: The Rabbinic Call for Human
Rights, and Jews for Racial and Economic Justice, the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 212

3 latter of which is a member of Communities United for
4 Police Reform.

5 I'm testifying today to express my deep concern
6 about Mayor Adams's involuntary removal directive.

7 Throughout the centuries and indeed the millennia.

8 Jewish tradition has both acknowledged mental health

9 as a human need, and has urged us to assist those

10 struggling to find treatment and solace not in

11 isolation, but in a communal context.

12 Removing individuals in psychiatric distress, who

13 are not a danger to themselves or others from their

14 neighborhoods or public spaces further isolates and

15 stigmatizes these New Yorkers, and denies them the

16 community contact that they need in order to thrive.

17 Well, I agree with Mayor Adams that we must find

18 solutions to the crisis facing unhoused New Yorkers

19 suffering from mental illness, but instead of

20 investing in genuine care and compassion, the Mayor's

21 directive proposes additional police encounters,

22 which hold the potential to become violent. Giving

23 the NYPD significantly more scope and authority to

24 detain people is playing fast and loose with the

25 legal rights of New Yorkers, especially given the

NYPDs troubling track record with individuals

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 213

3 experiencing or perceived to be experiencing a mental
4 health crisis.

5 Just to give you a sense of how far back this
6 goes, Jewish tradition urges us to care for our
7 neighbors, especially when they are in trouble, and
8 in fact, irrespective of cost for at least half a
9 millennia. We learned from the 16th century text
10 known as the Shahanarol[ph], that if you see your
11 neighbor is in trouble, you are obligated to save
12 them or hire others to save them. You are obligated
13 to trouble yourself and to hire others to save them.
14 You may not shirk of your duty because of this, and
15 you must save them at your own expense, even if they
16 are not able to pay. If you refuse to do so you're
17 guilty of transgressing the negative command, "do not
18 stand idly by while your neighbor's blood is shed."

19 I know the members of this committee-- these
20 committees rather, and that the entire City Council
21 does not want to be associated with those who stand
22 idly by while-- while our neighbor's blood is shed,
23 and indeed, while our neighbors are in deep distress.

24 So I urge the council to reject the Mayor's
25 directive, and instead invest in genuine care and
compassion, which means housing, mental health

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 214

3 services, and social supports. Unless the city of
4 New York adequately invests in the long-term health
5 and well being of New Yorkers and affordable housing,
6 and mental health crisis will continue. May add a
7 personal word in under 30 seconds? Thank you so
8 much.

9 So as a matter of Jewish law and tradition, in
10 fact, homelessness is against Jewish law, but not for
11 the person who is facing homelessness. It's actually
12 against the law for society. It is against the law
13 for all of us. And it goes against all kinds of
14 social mores In Jewish tradition that have been
15 around for at least two millennia that we allow
16 homelessness to exist, and the fact that we are
17 further blaming people who perhaps as a result of
18 homelessness, or perhaps not are facing mental
19 illness, the fact that we are penalizing them, and
20 might be putting them in dangerous situations is
21 unconscionable. Thank you so much.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Rabbi.

23 COUNSEL SUCHER: Next, we'll go to Craig Hughes.
24 After Craig will have Antonine Pierre, Tony Smith,
25 and Danielle Regis. Craig, you may begin when ready.
Time has begun.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 215

3 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

4 MR. HUGHES: Hi. Thank you Chairs for holding
5 this hearing today. My name is Craig Hughes and I'm
6 a Social Worker at the Bronx office of Mobilization
7 For Justice. I've worked with homeless individuals
8 with Serious Mental Illness in New York City for more
9 than 15 years, and I can't urge the Council any more
10 strongly to push back on the involuntary removal
11 initiative.

12 We can't accept the Administration's framing
13 here. It needs to be placed in context of more than
14 a year's worth of efforts to remove homeless people
15 from sight, often using absurd spins on words like
16 dignity and compassion. To be clear, nothing about
17 the Mayor's multiple sweep initiative is dignified or
18 compassionate. Rather, they're being deployed to
19 legitimize the broken windows policing approach of
20 this administration, which guides the
21 Administration's engagements with homeless people.

22 Homeless people have long been the target of
23 broken-windows policies and practices, which take at
24 their core the baseless argument that of homeless
25 people were conceived, of as signs of disorder, a
word which the Mayor often uses are removed from

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 216

3 site, somehow crime will magically disappear. What
4 this has meant for decades is the criminalization of
5 homelessness and poverty and the sustained harassment
6 of homeless people, which has overwhelmingly harmed
7 black and brown people in New York City. A basic
8 timeline of those broken-windows efforts targeting
9 homeless people under the Adams administration would
10 include the January 6th announcement of an
11 omnipresence of police in the subways, the January 24
12 blueprints on gun violence that announced plans to
13 lean heavily on coercive practices towards homeless
14 people with mental illness, the February 28 subway
15 safety plan which was a mass sweep initiative, the
16 March 25th above ground encampments initiative, which
17 was another mass sweep initiative, and the November
18 29th announcement of involuntary removal.

19 For many individuals with Serious Mental Illness
20 this has meant being pushed out of sight and being
21 criminalized while cycling in and out of hospital and
22 jails, often for quality of life crimes, rather than
23 getting support that actually helps.

24 In our testimony would go into this in detail and
25 give a series of recommendations. I'll highlight one
major area that isn't being discussed much today,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 217

3 though it was briefly discussed in the Committee's
4 report for this hearing, which is that of supportive
5 housing.

6 The supportive housing system is marketed as the
7 panacea for unsheltered homelessness and housing for
8 those with Serious Mental Illness. The reality is
9 far different. As a result of organizing by SHOUT
10 (Supportive Housing Organized United Tenants) in
11 2021, the council passed what became Local Law 3 of
12 2022, mandating a report on who does or doesn't get
13 into supportive housing. The data show that
14 supportive housing providers reject people from
15 housing for any reason they want, and those reasons
16 are facilitated by the Department of Social Services.
17 Often the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene is
18 also aware, as is the state OMH office.

19 This is called creaming, which is actually which
20 is actually often what amounts to disability
21 discrimination, and it makes it almost impossible for
22 people on the street with Serious Mental Illness to
23 exit homelessness and enter housing. In other words,
24 those who will be targeted by the Mayor's involuntary
25 removal initiative, also find themselves unable to
access supportive housing.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 218

2 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

3 MR. HUGHES: If I can just take one more minute.

4 In other words, those who will be targeted by the
5 Mayor's removal initiative also find themselves
6 unable to access supportive housing. The main
7 resource market is to support them.

8 Instead of reforming the front door of supportive
9 housing, the Administration has opted to police
10 homeless people out of sight. As of last fall, there
11 were some 2600 empty supportive housing units. We
12 strongly urge the City Council to press the
13 Administration on this. For tenants in supportive
14 housing, there is an eviction crisis. Sometimes this
15 looks like an informal evictions. Often it looks
16 like formal eviction evictions instead of providing
17 the support to help people stay housed.

18 Of note neither the city nor the state track
19 evictions from supportive housing. Officials do,
20 however, often meet with industry lobbyists who have
21 opposed reform efforts. Our other recommendations
22 include pushing back at every turn on the broken-
23 windows theory that added that Mayor Adams is pushing
24 forward, ending sweeps, providing outreach teams and
25 clinicians with actual support and resources.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 219

3 And just one final note for the Committee. You
4 know, there's been a pattern under this
5 administration when asked for data that might be
6 sensitive to come to the Council and say, well, we
7 don't have a lot to get back to you. And it's a
8 pattern across committees and across officials.

9 And I will say that there's a difference between
10 not having something, and deliberately being
11 unprepared with something. And the Administration
12 has decided, as what appears as to be policy that
13 they will try to avoid this with the Council, giving
14 the Council data that the public desperately needs to
15 know and is needed to hold them accountable. Just a
16 reminder that the council does have subpoena power,
17 and the council's can subpoena the Administration for
18 the data they are being-- they're refusing to give
19 that is desperately needed to inform the public's
20 knowledge and assessment of policies like the violent
21 involuntary removal policy that we need to be able to
22 really comment on with the information that they as
23 they said themselves they are tracking. So thank
24 you. I apologize for going a little bit over.

25 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Craig and
for the work that you do. And next we will go to...?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 220

2 COUNSEL SUCHER: Antonine Pierre, you may be you
3 being begin when ready.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

5 Hi. Just thank you to the Chairs and thank you
6 for your coordinated effort to hold this joint
7 hearing on a really important topic.

8 MS. PIERRE: My name is Antonine Pierre and I
9 work with the Brooklyn Movement Center, which is a
10 black-led group that organizes in Bed-Stuy and Crown
11 Heights. The BMC builds power so that black central
12 Brooklynites are able to play an active role in
13 shaping the decisions and institutions that impact
14 our daily lives.

15 Nearly three years into a global pandemic, we
16 have to face the truth of our city's mental health
17 crisis, not punish people for not being able to meet
18 their quote/unquote "basic living needs." We're all
19 suffering from long-term untreated trauma, and
20 managing conditions like anxiety, depression and PTSD
21 on a daily basis. The changes that were made to all
22 of our lives in lockdown, mass unemployment, and the
23 harsh economic conditions black, indigenous and other
24 people of color have experienced during the COVID-19
25 crisis have harmed all of our mental health.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 221

3 While the Mayor would like us to believe that the
4 people being removed from the street are served by
5 being ushered through the revolving door of the
6 city's broken mental health system by NYPD officers,
7 we should remember there are actual people with
8 actual family members like us who care for them when
9 they're not well.

10 If you've ever cared for family and friends with
11 mental health conditions are in crisis, you know that
12 a police officers presence can turn an already
13 stressed out person into an agitated and panicked
14 one. Responding to crisis often looks like pleading
15 with someone to go back in the house, to please take
16 their medication, or to go to sleep after days of
17 being awake.

18 We are not going to train cops out of being cops.
19 The tragic murder of Saheed Vassell in Crown Heights
20 by the NYPD on April 4, 2018, tells a story of a
21 broken system that is more likely to inflict harm
22 than care for black, indigenous, and other people of
23 color suffering from chronic mental health issues.
24 While we support the development of Community Mental
25 Health Guide and Portal, this community support is

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 222

3 undermined by retraining police officers who are just
4 in the wrong agency to do this work.

5 This resource would be better allocated to more
6 widespread community training that can help create a
7 culture of care around mental health. This plan from
8 the Mayor is an attack on black mental health at a
9 time when we need to be rebuilding community health
10 infrastructure. We deserve a new vision for
11 supporting New Yorkers through crisis that honors our
12 dignity and moves people in need from the streets
13 into stability. Mayor Adams Giuliani-era policies
14 will only give the same results we've already gotten:
15 Long-term psychiatric incarceration with no pathway
16 to wellness. A generation of black families in
17 central Brooklyn has already been torn apart by the
18 City's involuntary hospitalization policies in the
19 80s and 90s that locked up our loved ones under the
20 guise of quote/unquote "treatment". An appropriate
21 mental health response should take into account more
22 than the acute symptoms of the city's mental health
23 crisis. It should help secure housing employment,
24 use development program and comprehensive mental
25 health care for New Yorkers.

SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 223

3 MS. PIERRE: Getting this right looks like safety
4 and care, not thinly veiled incarceration and fear.
5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

7 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to Toni Smith.
8 And after Tony Smith will have Daniel Regis. Toni
9 Smith, you may begin when ready.

10 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

11 MS. SMITH: Thank you. Good afternoon. My name
12 is Toni Smith. I'm the New York State Director for
13 the Drug Policy Alliance, also a member of
14 Communities United for Police Reform. Thank you to
15 the joint committees of the Council for holding this
16 very important hearing. The Drug Policy Alliance is
17 the leading organization in the United States
18 promoting alternatives to the war on drugs and we
19 oppose the Mayor's directive. It will be harmful to
20 people struggling with substance use who are likely
21 to get swept up in the enforcement of this directive
22 by continuing policies that punish people for
23 substance use, perpetuate stigma, and ignore
24 evidence-based care. This directive goes far beyond
25 anything related to mental health, mobilizes the NYPD
to sweep up essentially anyone who is experiencing

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 224

3 homelessness. As we know that NYPD has a terrible
4 record of responding to people experiencing or
5 perceived to be experiencing a mental health crisis,
6 Routinely abuses homeless New Yorkers primarily
7 inflicting harm on our black and brown New Yorkers
8 our folks. The mayor's directive attempts to
9 simplify the problem as people not being able to
10 identify that they need support.

11 In fact, our voluntary care systems are
12 significantly limited on the basis of cost, cultural
13 competency, capacity, insurance, causing many people
14 who are voluntarily seeking care to be shut out.
15 This is particularly true for people with co-
16 occurring health needs, including substance use
17 disorder. We need more low barrier, person-centered,
18 voluntary care options, and more supportive housing.
19 Forced treatment is criminalization by another name,
20 and like criminalization, it is not effective to
21 address root causes of instability and unwellness.

22 Inadequate funding for education, housing, health
23 and other social services create the conditions that
24 destabilize people's lives and contribute to health
25 issues, intensifying the services people then require
to achieve health and stability.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 225

3 For the many people who will be swept up through
4 this directive who have a substance use disorder,
5 being forcibly hospitalized can lead to painful and
6 sometimes life-threatening withdrawal symptoms and
7 place them at an increased risk of overdose death.

8 This directive tries to mask the function of
9 police. Police are the frontline of criminalization,
10 not public health, and the disruption and trauma
11 people experience at the hands of the NYPD only
12 creates more of the instability and health challenges
13 that the Mayor claims to be addressing.

14 So thank you. We're calling on the City Council
15 to prioritize funding for actual public health
16 solutions and oppose this directive. And we'll
17 provide more in our written comments.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Toni.

19 COUNSEL SUCHER: Daniel Regis, you may begin when
20 ready.

21 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

22 MS. REGISTRATION: Good afternoon. My name is
23 Danielle Regis and I am a Supervising Attorney in the
24 Mental Health Representation Team of the Criminal
25 Defense Practice at Brooklyn Defender Services. I've
represented people in the Brooklyn mental health

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 226

3 court for the past five years. Thank you for this
4 opportunity to testify.

5 BDS is gravely concerned about the Mayor's plan
6 to expand the use of forced hospitalizations of
7 people who are experiencing housing instability and
8 may be living with mental illness. The dragnet plan
9 will most likely result in numerous unnecessary
10 police encounters that have the potential to risk the
11 safety of those individuals. Even for those who may
12 need treatment, involuntary removals are inherently
13 traumatic. People are torn from their homes,
14 communities and support systems. For the people
15 experiencing homelessness, their belongings are often
16 thrown away. This forcible often violent removal
17 creates a traumatic association with the hospital, a
18 place that should be associated with access to
19 treatment and care, not as a punishment. Instances
20 of armed police instead of EMTs or Mental health
21 professionals responding to someone experiencing a
22 mental health crisis too often end in arrest, abuse,
23 or even death. Often, people who we represent are
24 charged with resisting arrest and assaulting a police
25 officer when they decline transportation to a
hospital. They are then arrested and charged with a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 227

3 violent felony offense, a bail-eligible offense,
4 often resulting in sending more people with mental
5 illness to jails, where they have limited, if any,
6 access to mental health treatment.

7 Instead of relying on failed practices that
8 channel people in crisis into course of treatment or
9 the criminal legal system, the city must invest in
10 services and housing. New Yorkers with Serious
11 Mental Illness are disproportionately homeless or
12 housing insecure, which creates additional barriers
13 to accessing treatment. The city shelter system is
14 overcrowded and unsafe. I have clients sitting on
15 Rikers Island right now decompensating in horrific
16 conditions with inconsistent access to mental health
17 support, because they are unhoused and the judge is
18 unwilling to discharge them into the shelter system.
19 I worry every single day that I will need to call the
20 family of a person that I represent to inform them
21 that Rikers Island has claimed their loved one's
22 life.

23 The city must invest in housing that allows
24 people to come home with dignity, both to decarcerate
25 Rikers Island and to prevent more people from cycling

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 228

3 into criminal legal systems simply for displaying
4 symptoms of a mental illness in public.

5 This must include fully funding and maintaining
6 the MOCJ reentry hotel program. This transitional
7 housing model has been life changing for the people
8 we serve.

9 The City also needs to invest in proven programs
10 like supportive housing, scattered site housing, safe
11 havens, and crisis respite centers.

12 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

13 MS. REGISTRATION: As a public defender, I have
14 seen how critical housing is for my clients. When
15 they have a safe and stable home, they can engage in
16 treatment more effectively. When their basic needs
17 are met, they can choose to access medication, health
18 care, counseling, and services. The city cannot
19 arrest and involuntarily hospitalized its way to
20 mental wellness and public safety. People
21 experiencing mental illness deserve access to housing
22 and treatment and in a non-coercive manner.
23 involuntary commitment and expansion of Kendra's law
24 are not the answer.

25 Thank you for your time and I welcome any
questions.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 229

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Danielle.

3 COUNSEL SUCHER: We will now move to our next
4 panel which will also be mixed. We'll hear from
5 three Zoom participants and then two in person. So
6 while I call up the Zoom can actually-- no scratch
7 that. Alright, so we'll hear from Dr. Samuel Jackson
8 on zoom, Dr. Michael Zingman on Zoom, Dr. Ashley
9 Brittain on Zoom, and then in person we'll hear from
10 Luke Sikinyi, and then Dr. V from the Mental Health
11 Project Urban Justice Center as well.

12 Dr. Samuel Jackson, you may begin when ready.

13 DR. JACKSON: Great, thank you. Good afternoon,
14 everyone. My name is Dr. Jackson. I'm a
15 psychiatrist at a large safety net hospital, a chief
16 resident and provider of psychiatric services for
17 people experiencing homelessness in transitional
18 housing and in outreach. Today I've been a part of
19 the hearing listening in, but going and seeing
20 patients out on the streets, in the shelters, and in
21 our CPEPs, the exact thing that we're talking about
22 all day.

23 I'm also representing today an advocacy group
24 called New York Doctors Coalition.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 230

3 My uncle who has schizophrenia experienced
4 homelessness for many years and was shot by police
5 while experiencing a mental health crisis. So I know
6 the pain, the family's fear, and that they feel when
7 someone in behavioral health crisis interacts with
8 police, and that at times it can be lethal and
9 deadly. I talk to families weekly who are afraid to
10 call the police in times of crisis knowing that this
11 call for help can be deadly. We need to emphasize
12 non-police response first, and that police only are
13 involved if there's a crime or a weapon in play. I
14 want to ask the group, rhetorically, a question.
15 This directive is to bring those experiencing
16 homelessness with mental illness to emergency
17 departments. It's a public health intervention. Has
18 there been a study done that shows if these this
19 population this specific group who are homeless with
20 Serious Mental Illness has gone to an ED or a
21 psychiatric emergency room in the last year? As a
22 provider of someone, of people who are have Serious
23 Mental Illness, both who are housed and who are
24 unhoused, I can tell you that they frequently go to
25 emergency departments and inpatient units. So these
people who we're proposing to help by bring them to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 231

3 emergency rooms are already coming in. But they
4 don't get the treatment that they need once they come
5 in. Respectfully, Dr. Fattal outlined what the
6 disposition planning would be for people who come in.
7 It was very generic. And I would think, as a rule --
8 but I'm curious to see data -- as a rule, all of
9 these people who would get it have already had it
10 done in the last year. They've had a psychiatric
11 evaluation, they've had coordination of care, they've
12 had an appointment with a PHP or a clubhouse or
13 something that they didn't engage with.

14 If there are interventions being done that don't
15 have housing linked to them, more harm can be done to
16 the individuals and to the system. 25% of police-
17 involved killings involve someone with a mental
18 health crisis. Black Americans are two times more
19 likely to be killed. Black Americans with mental
20 illness are 10 times more likely to be killed.

21 I'm just going to add in the last 30 seconds that
22 there are solutions in New York City that need to be
23 scaled up. Rehabilitation centers out of Bellevue
24 are cost effective and bring people to housing. But
25 we're short so short staffed in our hospitals, we
haven't been able to scale this up yet. We don't

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 232

3 transition people to safe havens, which are tailored
4 transitional housing centers for people who are
5 chronically homeless with Serious Mental Illness.

6 The capacity of the system has to be brought up
7 before people are brought to emergency rooms, because
8 we're understaffed and stressed and already cannot
9 provide these people, who are already coming to the
10 emergency rooms the care that they deserve. Thank
11 you very much.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Dr. Jackson.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Dr. Michael Zingman, you can
14 begin when ready.

15 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has begun.

16 DR. ZINGMAN: Hi, my name is Dr. Michael Zingman.
17 I'm a resident physician in psychiatry at Bellevue
18 Hospital, and Secretary Treasurer of my Union, the
19 Committee of Interns and Residents, or CIR, which
20 represents more than 6500 physicians in New York
21 City.

22 When Mayor Adams first announced the mental
23 health involuntary removals directive my fellow CIR
24 members and I were outraged. We found it appalling
25 that as patients face long wait times in our
overcrowded hospitals, as people are evicted because

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 233

3 they can't make ever-increasing rent, as our
4 neighbors face the constant threat of incarceration
5 and deportation. Our mayor would focus his attention
6 on increasing police power to further criminalize and
7 involuntarily hospitalize houseless individuals.

8 We understand that this directive may result in
9 critical danger for the people it impacts,
10 particularly if they are people of color,
11 undocumented, people with developmental disabilities
12 or LGBTQ+ individuals. As a psychiatrist who took an
13 oath to do no harm, I cannot stand by as houseless
14 New Yorkers are further criminalized and endangered
15 by police and then forced into hospital stays that by
16 their very nature cannot address the needs of these
17 individuals.

18 Let me be clear: When somebody is brought into
19 the hospital by the police, no matter how hard we as
20 staff work to provide quality care, we cannot change
21 the violent way that the patient arrived, and we
22 cannot provide true care. True care requires patient
23 trust and safety which this directive casts aside
24 with abandon. Rather, the Adams directive will make
25 physicians and other health care workers an extension
of the carceral system. It will force us to compound

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 234

3 the trauma of folks already experiencing the daily
4 trauma of homelessness by keeping them in the
5 hospital against their will. This will also erode
6 patient's trust in their physicians and the
7 healthcare system, which is key to providing quality
8 care and improving mental health outcomes.

9 As so many great people have stated today there
10 are real needs in our community that Mayor Adams and
11 this Council must address. We need access to
12 permanent and affordable housing, clean air, healthy
13 food, jobs that pay fairly, and long-term community
14 based mental health care.

15 These are the things that I know as a physician
16 would most positively impact my patient's health.
17 And that's the directive that I wish we were here to
18 talk about today.

19 In my time left, I just would comment on a few
20 things that were either discussed or not as potential
21 solutions. You know, I think mobile crisis units
22 like B-HEARD, where police are not the first
23 responders, are really important. At Bellevue and
24 soon at Kings County we will have an extended care
25 unit, which is a longer-term inpatient psychiatric

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 235

2 hospital unit in which we connect people to ongoing
3 either respite or supportive housing.

4 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Time has expired.

5 DR. ZINGMAN: Early interventions, also
6 transitional housing units, and supportive permanent
7 housing. Thanks.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Dr. Zingman.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: Dr. Ashley Brittain, you might
10 begin when ready.

11 MS. BRITTAIN: Hi, thank you so much for allowing
12 me this opportunity. My name is Ashley Brittain.
13 I'm a resident physician in emergency medicine in the
14 Bronx and also Regional Delegate for the Committee of
15 Interns and Residents. I'm here on behalf of myself,
16 and my union Express, as many others have done before
17 me a deep opposition to this violent directive.

18 I'm also here to explain uniquely what happens on
19 the other end of the process in the emergency
20 department. I believe we've heard from psychiatric
21 residents. But the emergency department is also
22 involved in this as well. I have to warn you that
23 what I'm about to share with you for those that have
24 not been through it can be intense.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 236

3 When someone is involuntarily brought into the
4 hospital by the police, which is not something that
5 is rare in our line of work, after suffering that
6 immense trauma, they will be placed into a yellow
7 gown to indicate that they are a elopement risk.
8 This is for their safety, as well as the safety of
9 others, and they're there because we're concerned
10 that they're going to leave. And so the yellow gown
11 marks them as that risk so that everyone involved in
12 their care knows that that person does not have the
13 civil liberties to leave on their own. They'll be
14 told that we need their blood and their urine to test
15 before they can then see the psychiatric team. And
16 if they don't cooperate, they'll be restrained,
17 either chemically, or in rare and more extreme
18 occasions, physically. They may wait in a crowded
19 emergency department for hours or days for a
20 psychiatric bed to open up.

21 We've had some people anecdotally that have been
22 in the emergency department for a week, two weeks
23 while waiting for a psychiatric bed to open. I just
24 want to give that a moment to sink in.

25 It is beyond evident that this is not the
healthcare we have dedicated our lives as physicians

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 237

3 to provide. There is no other way to describe this
4 process than as an extension of the carceral system,
5 one that will contribute to this ongoing process and
6 problem of patients cycling in and out of our
7 hospitals without ever receiving proper long-term
8 mental care in the community. I also believe that
9 one of the most important responsibilities I have as
10 a physician is to uplift and safeguard my patients
11 autonomy. I'm very passionate about this.

12 Their ability to make decisions about their own
13 life and their own rights is a human right. And this
14 directive for Mayor Adams seems to operate under the
15 principle that if someone is homeless, they forfeit
16 that basic right. I refuse to accept this, and our
17 City Council should refuse to accept it. Instead,
18 our elected officials here today should join me in
19 demanding may or revoke this directive immediately as
20 an urgent matter of racial, economic, and disability
21 justice and of public health. Thank you.

22 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

23 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to our in-person
24 panelists, Dr. Victoria Phillips from the Mental
25 Health Project at the Urban Justice Center as well as
Luke Sukini from the New York Association of

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 238

3 Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services. Dr. V may begin
4 when ready.

5 MR. SIKINYI: Hi, and thank you for having us
6 today. My name is Luke Sikinyi, and I am the
7 Director of Public Policy at the New York Association
8 of Psychiatric Rehabilitation Services. More
9 importantly, I'm someone who both uses services--
10 mental health services in the city and state and also
11 someone who has extensive experience providing those
12 services to individuals directly.

13 So I have my written statements here. There's a
14 lot of voluntary alternatives that we have put
15 forward to you all for your reference, but I'm not
16 going to belabor that right now. I think the
17 important thing is to really look at this plan and
18 look at what it truly means.

19 So the first thing to think about here is this
20 mental health emergency is a public health crisis.
21 And I really want to stress that because it doesn't
22 make sense to me as a provider of services and
23 someone who has used services, that we have a public
24 health crisis. And we decide the first thing we
25 throw at it is police officers.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 239

3 There are no other public health emergencies
4 where police officers are the first responders are
5 the best people to respond. We know that many of you
6 have worked in the services or hospitals, and we know
7 that that is not the way to go.

8 Second, this expansion of "danger to self" to
9 include things that are not of imminent danger,
10 suggest that police are not the people to be here.
11 This isn't a public safety issue if there is no
12 imminent danger. So I'm not really sure once again,
13 why we're using police officers.

14 Third, you heard it yourself. The police
15 commissioner said they're not the best people to
16 respond to these issues. And if they know that, and
17 we know that, why are we continuing to send them?
18 And more importantly, why do we continue to think
19 that we're going to get a different outcome if we're
20 not changing the process.

21 The directive is the expansion of an old practice
22 which has not worked. Many of these people who have
23 been scooped off the street go into hospitals, they
24 come right back out, and they get sent right back in.
25 And we start all over again. I've been there I've
provided those services, and I've struggled to wonder

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 240

3 what we're doing wrong. And the truth is, we're not
4 investing in our community-based services. We know a
5 lot of services that do work that have been effective
6 and getting people into the sort of help that they
7 are asking for, and keeping them out of hospitals,
8 keeping them out of the carceral system.

9 We can't keep putting people back into the system
10 and expect a different outcome without intentionally
11 providing improvements. This starts with discharge
12 planning. But any good discharge plan falls apart if
13 the services to continue that plan in the community
14 are not there, if the workforce is not there to
15 actually carry out those plans.

16 So I sit here to ask you all: One, reject these,
17 the Mayor's plans because it is not a real solution.
18 It's a quick fix, but, two, we need to invest in this
19 workforce, because this is what-- these are the
20 people who are actually carrying out this good work.
21 These are the people who are creating those
22 relationships with individuals that are providing
23 compassionate care, because they know them, they take
24 the time to do so. And it is difficult work, and we
25 should be paying them accordingly, so that people

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 241

3 come into this field, stay in the field, and continue
4 to help people recover. Thank you.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

6 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Peace and blessings,
7 everyone. Okay, I'm Chaplain Dr. Victoria Phillips.
8 Everyone calls me Dr. V. And today I'm here
9 representing the Mental Health Project at the Urban
10 Justice Center. You might know me for many other
11 things. I also want to highlight that for the last
12 six and a half years, I was part of the advisory
13 board for the Department of Corrections, and
14 currently, I'm the co Chair of to deal with these
15 young adult Taskforce.

16 So let me just start off by saying, I'm a
17 Brooklynite, and Shirley Chisolm once said you don't
18 make progress by standing on the sidelines, you make
19 progress by implementing ideas. And I'm here to tell
20 you that Mayor Adams's idea is faulty and asinine.

21 I just want to start off by saying, I'm very
22 disappointed in my own Councilmember, I won't say her
23 name on a record right now, but she knows who she is,
24 because earlier today when NYPD said they have not
25 trained all their officers and CIT in the last eight
years of having the training available, my

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 242

3 Councilmember responded with, "Okay, thank you." And
4 I want you to understand, why not? You have an \$11
5 billion budget, and for someone to sit up here in
6 front of Council and say, "Well, we have 30 persons a
7 class to make it more intimate." Again, you have an
8 \$11 billion budget, get the training done.

9 Heartbeats mean something to me. As an Army brat on
10 domestic soil with a mother buried in a military
11 cemetery, every heartbeat on domestic soil means
12 something to me.

13 I also want to say I have CPEP individuals from
14 SROs over the last 20-plus years in my line of work,
15 I've even been held hostage myself in a microshelter.
16 And I say these things because I no time did I
17 utilize any brutality, any weapons. I utilized my
18 training my de-escalation and not once that I have to
19 call NYPD. I also want to say B-HEARD needs to B-
20 HEARD and step up. It needs to be a 24/7 access.
21 Just like all ERs are, because mental health is a
22 physical matter. It is something that occurs 24/7,
23 and the city is not doing good enough. I also want
24 to highlight that the NYPD said a video will go out
25 to the officers. They did not discuss if the
officers actually watched the video, if they're

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 243

3 quizzed on the video, if the video even documents if
4 they stopped the video. And I want to know with an
5 \$11 billion budget, what is going on with that?

6 And I would like the Council to actually flush
7 out -- because the video does not flush out -- would
8 be scenarios and anything like that. So again, \$11
9 billion is falling short for the people of New York.

10 And I would like to address -- I usually try to
11 keep petty stuff off the record, but I had to stop
12 Councilmember Holden in the hallway. I usually do
13 that with people who express white supremacy ways and
14 bigotry in the council. So I stopped him in the
15 hallway, and I'm bringing it up for a reason because
16 I said, you know, "You said certain things that do
17 not line up. We're having a hearing"-- Let me
18 finish. Let me just finish. "We're having a hearing
19 today on individuals who have not been charged with a
20 crime, and you've said several times arrest records
21 being mixed with medical records, and do you not
22 understand HIPAA." And he said, "Well, why do they
23 have to have HIPAA, if they're brought in by the
24 police?" And I said, "Again, the hearing is on
25 people who have not been charged with the crime.
HIPAA is very real. And HIPAA is for you, and I,"

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 244

3 and he responded, talking to me with his hand like
4 this. And I said, Please don't talk to me with your
5 hand up. And he turned to walk away. And I want to
6 highlight that on the record, because if I am a
7 professional trying to talk to a lawmaker about a
8 very real issue with their constituents, and that is
9 his response, what is the response for the police?

10 And lastly, I will finish with this, and I want
11 my Councilmember to pay attention. Two Sundays ago,
12 I was called to the First Baptist Greater Church on
13 Eastern Parkway to give-- to give a teaching on
14 policing and mental health in the community and how
15 the community should respond, and I'm very nervous to
16 have NYPD interact with my community for many more
17 reasons than I will stay today. But I know for a
18 fact police lie. And so on my way home from church,
19 I told my son to come downstairs with the dog, and I
20 will take him and drop him off. I say that because I
21 got one block from my apartment with my son in the
22 car and had officers make a U turn, whoop-whoop, and
23 stop me-- 30 more seconds. They stopped me. And
24 then he won't I was recording. I'll give you the
25 video if you want. And I was recording. And he
walked-- one of the officers walked up to me-- eight

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 245

2 officers, one sergeant and seven uniformed officers
3 in regular uniform. And the officer who walked into
4 my driver said, "I'm stopping you because you have a
5 light out." Regular stop, right? I said, "Oh, I was
6 not aware, I'll go get it fixed in the morning."
7 They was obviously doing some type of training thing.
8 So I started talking to the sergeant because I want
9 all the attention on me and none of it directly to my
10 son. And I say this because they could not find
11 nothing on me. I am a citizen, a productive citizen.
12 And I do what is right.

13 And because that-- that aggravated them that I
14 knew my rights, the sergeant even said, "Oh, you
15 sound like someone who knows your rights," because I
16 was asking about the COs, the Cos at the present.
17 And I say that because they could not find nothing.

18 And you know they did, they gave me a criminal
19 court ticket for a suspended registration, which is
20 not true. I had the registration, I have the copy
21 from the DMV, the very next day I went to get another
22 one. And I want to say that because a regular civil
23 stop turned criminal. And if I do not go to court,
24 there will be a warrant for my arrest.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 246

3 So easy to get swept up in the criminal legal
4 system. So easy for an officer to lie on myself and
5 any of my community members and for your to allow
6 this to be implemented, for you to sit and thank
7 police officers you do with police officers, and the
8 DOC and not highlight the needs of your constituents
9 is wrong. And it has to stop today. And you all
10 need to start holding Councilmember Holden and
11 Councilmember Vicki with all the bigotry, responsible
12 and accountable. Peace and blessings.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

14 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Any questions?

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No. That's what I'm asking.

16 Do you guys have any questions?

17 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Well, thank you for the
18 work you've been doing. You seem very passionate
19 about it. And-- and I like that because the passion
20 brings what's been going on. I understand we cannot
21 continue doing the same thing over and over and
22 expect different results.

23 So what would your recommendation be right now,
24 for us as a city council. I hear all the things you
25 said. But now take it a step-- [breathes in]. Yeah.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 247

2 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: I don't need no breath.

3 I can answer you.

4 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: Okay.

5 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Right now city council
6 needs to expand the respite. There's not enough in
7 every borough. Period. There is no reason someone
8 in crisis has to go to an ER when they are respites
9 in the community. That's one thing you could do
10 right now.

11 Also, you can hold NYPD accountable for these
12 frequent trainings that has been available for the
13 last eight years. There is no reason constituents
14 have died on your watches. And NYPD is allowed to
15 float in and float out with, "We're sorry, but we'll
16 do better." So that is something that can be done
17 right now.

18 Right now you can also ask the doctors what needs
19 to be done. You could put social work-- you know
20 what when I worked in hospital, I worked in Bellevue
21 and I worked in Kirby, and when we didn't have enough
22 staff, we had to float, whether we want to go to that
23 unit or not. So why aren't your floating people?
24 Why aren't you moving staff in HAC to put them in
25 Rikers where they need to be. Mr. Carter died last

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 248

3 year. Every city agency failed him. The hospital,
4 DHS shelter, intake at Rikers failed him. And so we
5 can't even take care of people in custody, why are we
6 taking people off the street to hospitalized them,
7 when we're going to fail them again.

8 Right now, you need to have your people-- you're
9 hospital right? Hospital Committee. Make sure HAC
10 is doing their job. I see all these other
11 Councilmembers who are asking about discharge. This-
12 - wardens call me because discharge doesn't even
13 work. It doesn't even work when people have mental
14 health diagnosis, a Brad H. diagnosis, and they're
15 getting ready to get released. And DOC staff hasn't
16 even followed up with them. And what is-- I've even
17 testified right here in this council, wardens will
18 reach out to me because of that. Those are things
19 that you can make sure right now. Why isn't there a
20 triage unit that actually trains officers, and a
21 triage unit to actually go to housing units in jail?
22 Because they all work together. So there is-- I
23 could talk to you offline. You're my Councilmember,
24 so I could talk to you for days about what we could
25 do right now to implement. I have no problem doing
that. Any other questions?

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 249

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, thank you so much.

3 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: That's it. Thank you.

4 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Thank you for the
5 questions.

6 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: And by the way, I have a
7 lot of mental health in my own family that I have to
8 deal with. And so I appreciate you.

9 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: It's not easy.

10 COUNCILMEMBER NARCISSE: It's not easy.

11 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: And after my brain
12 surgery, I was diagnosed with depression and anxiety.
13 Do you imagine how I feel after 8 cops pulled me over
14 for a bogus charge? And threw my name in the system?
15 Go ahead.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you very much, you
17 know, you-- you've added much to this conversation.
18 And I appreciate that. So when we're talking about
19 the respite. I'm from Staten Island, so I'm
20 unfamiliar with that. What is that, and why do you
21 say you need more?

22 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Well, I don't have the
23 exact numbers in my head. But I think it was less
24 than 60 right now in the whole city, if I'm not
25 mistaken.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 250
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 [BACKGROUND VOICES FROM CHAMBER]

4 Well, there's less than 60 beds in total.

5 [BACKGROUND VOICES FROM CHAMBER]

6 Yes. That's what I'm saying. And so, so that's
7 kind of like a break, a timeout.

8 [BACKGROUND VOICES FROM CHAMBER]

9 Yes. But that's kind of like a timeout for-- for
10 a basic explanation of it. And so what it is, is
11 that you could pretty much call, family members could
12 call, social workers could call the individual. And
13 you could call to see if they have a space available,
14 a bed available. And what that means is it's
15 literally like a checkout. You're allowed to come in
16 there for like a week, have services, be directly
17 engaged around your mental health concerns. And like
18 someone said in the audience, it is peer run. And so
19 it's just-- it's just a restart. It's a reconnect.
20 And that's why I say we need to expand it because
21 it's truly a help, rather than an hospitalizing
22 someone. Sometimes all you need is a break. You
23 know, it's almost like when you-- I don't know if you
24 have kids or anything--

25 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: I've got four. I need a
respite like right now.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 251

2 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Well then you understand
3 my-- my example. You call a loved one, "Girl just
4 take them for the afternoon. I need a break." So
5 it's a mental health break.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay. So see, these are the
7 things that we're learning from this, you know, and,
8 and I know that, you know, your-- your colleague or
9 Councilmember may not have said, "Thank you," but,
10 you know, we're looking at this holistically, right?
11 And so there are a lot of folks out there and
12 including in law enforcement and in these hospitals
13 that are doing a good job. So it's only proper to
14 say thank you, and thank you for your testimony, as
15 we would say to you. There's a lot of emotion
16 surrounding this, and I think that it's folks like
17 you that make us smarter about it.

18 And one of my last questions to everyone that was
19 testifying was basically what-- what do you need from
20 us? And it's-- and we understand, like the
21 heightened emotion that's involved in this, because
22 we want to protect people who are severely mentally
23 ill that may hurt someone else. We want to protect
24 people who have not gotten the treatment that they
25 need, but they don't need to have to be having their

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 252

3 civil liberties violated. So these hearings, kind
4 of, you know, we break this out.

5 And so the respite something I learned today.
6 How do we understand how to build capacity with our
7 local organizations that you know, the police can't
8 do everything--

9 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: They sure can't.

10 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: --and it doesn't make them
11 you know, villains. But I think after a while, that
12 that kind of is what the result is because so much of
13 it has been put on them. So we have to look at this,
14 you know, holistically, and-- and the things that
15 you're saying add context to that. So I would love
16 to talk to you offline about respites. Because like
17 I said, I'm from Staten Island, and we have those
18 issues as well. And I think that we need to figure
19 out how to build out more of those things and, and
20 mitigate some of these issues. But I really do thank
21 you for your testimony. And I appreciate your
22 passion.

23 DR. VICTORIA PHILLIPS: Thank you for asking the
24 questions.

25 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Yeah. Thank you so much for
your passion, like, Chair Hanks was saying, and, you

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 253

2 know, this is, again, a very-- there's a lot of
3 issues around the systemic problems that we have
4 around mental health. And I just want to thank you,
5 and all the folks that are still here that will
6 testify for your-- for your testimony and for adding
7 to the conversation. And, you know, I know that I
8 want to be respectful of my colleagues. And I know
9 that we may have differing opinions on things, but we
10 do all know and understand that this situation around
11 the mental health crisis needs to improve. So I just
12 wanted to say thank you again, so much.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you. We'll now move to
14 Betty Khalid on Zoom. Dr. Betty Khalid, you may
15 begin when ready.

16 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Starting time.

17 DR. KOLOD: Good afternoon, I hope you can hear
18 me I had to run out. I'm a public health and primary
19 care physician for people who use drugs, and I'm
20 speaking in opposition to the Mayor's involuntary
21 removal directive. And that's on behalf of New York
22 Doctors Coalition, a network of over 800 New York
23 City Health Professionals and health justice
24 advocates who support housing first, as a public
25 health intervention.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 254

3 I'm going to share a few anecdotes that highlight
4 the true gaps in psychiatric care for people
5 experiencing homelessness and the link to overdose,
6 the leading cause, and increasingly so, of death
7 among persons experiencing homelessness. We know
8 this matters because the latest health department
9 overdose data reflects the unrelenting acceleration
10 of overdoses in New York City.

11 My patient Alexander walked into my clinic, like
12 the Deputy Speaker's brother, asking for help staff
13 were frightened by his disorganized behavior. He
14 said that he knew how he would hurt himself and
15 described violent assaults saying that he didn't want
16 to be like that anymore. He was voluntarily escorted
17 to our Psych ER, and on arrival, he was handcuffed
18 and strip-searched after they found heroin in his
19 pocket. He immediately retracted his statements
20 about hurting himself and others, and he was released
21 from our crowded overwhelmed ER within minutes. He
22 now declines all mental health referrals.

23 I just say this to say that coercive carceral
24 mental health does not work, and instead has proven
25 deadly for New Yorkers, especially those with
marginalized identities.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 255

3 My patients cannot access mental health care.
4 Referrals to psychiatry take months, even for those
5 in psychosis. Often people who use drugs are
6 ineligible. My patient Ashley has schizophrenia.
7 She's sleeping and injecting alone in stairwells
8 because she's terrified of going into crowded
9 shelters we referred her to an ACT team months ago,
10 we have not received a response.

11 My other patient, Jeffrey, is staying in a
12 shelter and was turned away from psychiatric care
13 because he has a remote history of opioid use.

14 However, my patients Barry and Sam, who have
15 schizophrenia and bipolar disorder were relieved to
16 move into their apartments recently. Their opioid
17 use has stabilized or completely stopped, and as they
18 wait for their psychiatric referrals to pan out, they
19 are at least safe.

20 So to address mental health gaps that are that
21 are frightening the public and potentially fatal for
22 affected individuals, we need permanent housing,
23 universal health care, financial support, investment
24 in community based health care, and to break down
25 mental health and addiction silos.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 256

3 The involuntary removal directive and cuts to the
4 City Health Department, Department of Social
5 Services, DHS, and the Department of Housing and
6 Community Development will only exacerbate the
7 problem. Thank you.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: We'll now move to in person
10 panels. Our next panel will be Jessica Fear from VNS
11 Health, Fiodhna O'Grady from Samaritans of New York,
12 Casey Starr from Samaritans of New York, Helen "Skip"
13 Skipper from Justice Peer Initiative, and Cal Hedigan
14 from Community Access.

15 Is Fiona or--

16 CHAIRPERSON LEE: She was here. Okay.

17 COUNSEL SUCHER: Is Cal Hedigan here?

18 Jessica, you may begin when ready.

19 MS. FEAR: Is this on? Okay. Great. Thank you
20 so much. I just want to say thank you to The joint
21 Committees for hosting this hearing. I appreciate
22 your stamina today. I believe that stamina is going
23 to be required of all of us to be able to address
24 this problem successfully. I have all these prepared
25 written comments, I'm actually going to go a little
bit off script, based on everything that we've heard

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 257

3 everyone say today. I kind of want to boil it down,
4 you have my written testimony. There's lots that I
5 say in there that speaks to the need. I just kind of
6 want to boil it down to what I feel like I'm hearing
7 from everyone, and where I feel like we come from.

8 I am with VNS Health. I'm the Senior Vice
9 President for Behavioral Health. VNS Health,
10 formerly the Visiting Nurse Service of New York, our
11 behavioral health teams have been in the community
12 serving individuals with Serious Mental Illness for
13 over 35 years. We do it on the street. We do it in
14 the homes. We do it in the shelters. We go and find
15 folks wherever they need us. This past year, we
16 served over 20,000 New Yorkers. We have five ACT
17 teams. We have six mobile crisis teams. We have
18 five IMT teams. We provide 958 training for the
19 city.

20 I say all this to say, when we talk about the
21 investment in community based resources, we could not
22 be more in support of that as a sustainable solution
23 for the problem that everyone has been speaking to
24 very passionately and eloquently today. We do
25 applaud the increased investment in capacity.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 258

3 However, I cannot stress enough how imperative it
4 is for the community-based mental health programs to
5 be funded, to keep those who can be stably sustained
6 in the community at home in the community where they
7 belong. This will absolutely free up the treatment
8 capacity for those who actually need stabilization in
9 hospitalization.

10 What we know is that we have watched -- across
11 our mobile crisis teams -- we have watched referrals
12 to mobile crisis double over the last five years. Of
13 those referrals -- and some of these statistics we
14 didn't get to hear today, so I'll share some with you
15 on our end -- only 5% of the referrals that come to
16 our mobile crisis teams need to go to the hospital,
17 are transported. And of those 3% of adults and 1% of
18 the youth are transported involuntarily. What that
19 means is we are able to intervene, reduce the crises
20 and the need for hospitalization and unnecessary
21 hospitalization and keep people at home in the
22 community where they belong.

23 We cannot do that -- here we go; we're out of
24 time -- we cannot do that without the proper
25 workforce to address this, right? And people have
said this throughout the day. I just want to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 259

3 underscore that the workforce crisis will-- is
4 imperative. It's imperative that we solve this.
5 Increased capacity will not be able to be realized
6 unless we have the people to staff the positions to
7 do the work. And those of us who are the community-
8 based providers, who are the safety net for the
9 individuals that we serve, we don't have the staff to
10 do it today. And without additional investments,
11 we're not going to be able to do it tomorrow. So
12 thank you for your time.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Good to see
14 you, Jessica. And I just wanted to let everyone know
15 that if you have written testimony, I promise you
16 that the staff and the Committee does read every
17 single word, so no worries.

18 MS. FEAR: Thank you

19 COUNSEL SUCHER: Fiona, you want to go next?

20 MS. O'GRADY: Hello, and thank you Chairs Lee,
21 Ariola, Chair Hanks for the opportunity to speak
22 today. I'm Fiodhna O'Grady, and I'm representing the
23 Samaritans of New York. It's a Suicide Prevention
24 Center. Been around for 40 years and we operate New
25 York City's only anonymous and completely

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 260

3 confidential suicide prevention hotline. And we also
4 operate education programs in all five boroughs.

5 Samaritans provides immediate and ongoing support
6 to those in distress, and it's also a safe
7 alternative to existing clinical government-run
8 programs. We are the go-to service for the
9 underserved, the untreated and those most impacted by
10 stigma. And I'd like to echo -- I think it was Chair
11 Lee who was saying, we're part of the "one size does
12 not fit all and therefore we exist." Samaritans
13 hotline acts as a safe point of entry to mental
14 health services, especially for people of color,
15 LGBTQ, young, undocumented people, and people living
16 with mental health conditions or disabilities, and
17 for those experiencing homelessness 24/7. Before the
18 pandemic suicide rates had been increasing for two
19 decades. And while they remained stable during 2020,
20 they're on the rise again, CDC 2022.

21 For prospective New York City DOHMH estimates
22 that someone dies by suicide every 16 hours in New
23 York City. And what we say is violence expressed
24 outwardly is homicide. And think of the care that we
25 apply and the amount of energy we apply to combating

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 261

3 homicide. Suicide is violence expressed inwardly.

4 And we need more care.

5 While mental health is an important aspect of
6 suicide and suicide prevention, our efforts cannot be
7 confined solely to the mental health sector. And
8 that is why we have decided that we're coming here
9 today also, because obviously, housing instability
10 and homelessness are two important social
11 determinants of both physical and mental health. And
12 I think we've heard it again from Councilmember
13 Barron, Councilmember Cabán, the Bronx defenders,
14 this lovely lady who sat here before us, and
15 involuntary removals and forced institutionalization
16 are policies that seek to hide the problem. They do
17 not expand access to housing, nor do they address the
18 structural and individual factors underlying
19 homelessness.

20 As a city we need to examine all the factors
21 contributing to homelessness, and adopt a holistic
22 approach. This means addressing systematic
23 inequalities, providing access to stable housing,
24 health care and education and offering options for
25 mental health support.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 262

3 Samaritans wants to thank the City Council for
4 their support, which allowed us to respond to over
5 60,000 calls in FY 22 in our role as an essential
6 member of the New York City Safety Net. We-- we
7 applaud all your efforts at this hearing today. And
8 in the interest of compassion and dignity, community
9 mental health care is everything. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Fiodhna.

11 COUNSEL SUCHER: Casey Star, you may begin when
12 ready.

13 MS. STARR: Thank you to the Committee Chairs
14 here today and to everyone who is also still here and
15 giving voice to this. I'm Casey Starr, and I am the
16 Co-Executive Director of the Samaritans of New York.

17 Samaritans is the only anonymous and completely
18 confidential crisis service in this city, and we
19 prioritize autonomy and agency of an individual in
20 crisis. A caller's absolute anonymity to our service
21 ensures that no action will be taken without their
22 consent, and this helps to build trust, it reduces
23 feelings of helplessness and isolation, and it's been
24 shown to increase engagement in services and help-
25 seeking behaviors.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 263

3 From the 1.4 million call Samaritans has answered
4 from New Yorkers in crisis, we have learned that
5 trust, autonomy and dignity are at the heart of
6 helping someone. And what we've learned by listening
7 to the voices of people who call is reflected in the
8 extant research.

9 Unfortunately, we've also observed significant
10 resistance to centering these values in social
11 services and governmental policies. So as the only
12 crisis service that does not engage in non-consensual
13 interventions, including 988 and DOHMH, said that
14 that's NYC-WELL, and in this city, that does happen
15 when you call. Not always, but it can. We know that
16 alternatives work. We're proof of that. And we're
17 deeply troubled by the Mayor's plan to address
18 homelessness and the move towards forced
19 institutionalization and forced carceral care.

20 Nonconsensual interventions and policies, while
21 well-intentioned, have severe unintended
22 consequences. There is a real risk for physical
23 danger and violence as well as exposure to just the
24 fear associated with engagement with law enforcement,
25 who are ill-equipped to evaluate and safely respond
to mental health crises.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 264

3 Psychological trauma and a worsening of mental
4 health status is a actual consequence. Involuntary
5 interventions have been shown to increase feelings of
6 shame, reduce the likelihood that a person will
7 disclose future suicidal ideation or seek help.
8 Institutional settings often isolate people from
9 their communities and support networks. This can
10 further marginalize a person, especially someone who
11 is already vulnerable and can exacerbate their
12 challenges. Additionally, we know that suicide rates
13 increase dramatically post hospitalization,
14 especially for those who were involuntarily treated.
15 And that doesn't even touch on the financial
16 instability that this can cause, especially for a
17 population him who are experiencing homelessness.

18 This poses a costly model for the city and for
19 the individuals. Rather than preventing harm, these
20 practices actively are harming and traumatizing the
21 people they seek to help. So I yield the rest of my
22 time.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: You can finish off. Yeah.

24 MS. STARR: Okay. People who experience
25 homelessness have a higher rate of suicide attempts,
and it's estimated they die by suicide at nine times

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 265

3 the rate of the general population. All New Yorkers
4 deserve the same opportunity to make decisions about
5 their health, wellbeing, and treatment, regardless of
6 their housing status. People access help when they
7 have choices they are comfortable with and services
8 that make them feel safe. Mayor Adams said that we
9 need to rebuild trust in our city. And we agree: If
10 people don't trust you, you're not going to get very
11 far. But to do that New Yorkers need compassion and
12 not coercion. Coercion is not the basis for trust.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

14 COUNSEL SUCHER: Helen, you may begin when ready.

15 MS. SKIPPER: Oh, excuse me, I'm sorry. I don't
16 go by the name Helen most of the time, so I didn't
17 know you were talking to me.

18 COUNSEL SUCHER: I apologize.

19 MS. SKIPPER: No problems. Good afternoon
20 Council. I need to take my time, and I need to be
21 intentional in my thoughts. I came with prepared
22 testimony, but I'm not going to speak my prepared
23 testimony. You have my written testimony. I'm not
24 going to speak my prepared testimony, because I'm
25 just going to talk about what everybody else has said
repeatedly about how we need more community-based

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 266
3 services, about how we need more peer support, about
4 how we need expansion of services, and a better paid
5 workforce. We already know that. Everybody that has
6 sat here before me has said that. What I am going to
7 speak about is the fact that I don't feel represented
8 and I don't feel heard. It is about the fact that I
9 am directly impacted by the criminal justice system,
10 by the mental health system, by the substance abuse
11 system. It is about the fact that we are sitting
12 here talking about policy and procedure.

13 But yet we are not represented here in this room.
14 You want to talk about crafting policy and procedure.
15 But I guarantee you if the Mayor had someone with
16 lived experiences on his team, he would have never
17 come with a plan such as this. I sat here all day,
18 where members of departments sat here and attempted
19 to quantify their actions with numbers. And I can
20 get academic myself. I am a criminologist. I'll be
21 entering into a Master's Ph.D program in the fall.

22 I can speak about numbers, but I prefer to stick
23 with the qualitative. I prefer to stick with the
24 narrative. You cannot build policy about vulnerable
25 peoples without inviting us to sit at the table. We
are the subject matter experts in the room. Yet when

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 267

3 it comes time for us to speak, when it comes time for
4 the community to give testimony, I am looking at an
5 empty chamber. When I sat here this morning with
6 these talking heads, the Council Chambers was full.
7 Yet today, at this moment, I sit here and I see less
8 than a handful of Councilmembers. You are listening
9 to me now. Ten minutes ago, whoever was here was on
10 their phones. Where is the respect for the community
11 members and those of us who were directly impacted?
12 We are closest to the solution. [BELL RINGS]

13 And I'm going to take my time with this. See, I
14 can turn that clock off because I've been watching it
15 and I think is running fast. Anyhow, let me tell
16 you: Those that are closest to the problems are
17 closest to the solution. I have said this time and
18 time again. Are you guys even listening? How can
19 you build a plan to support or what you think you
20 support, but you don't include the voices of those
21 who are directly impacted. And yes, I'm directly
22 impacted for 25 years. I went through the criminal
23 justice system, the substance abuse system, the
24 mental health system for 25 years, yet you still try
25 to involuntarily confine us. You still try to take
away our voice and choice, like we don't matter. Yet

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 268
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 I'm sitting here speaking to you just as
4 comprehensively, just as coherently, just as
5 intelligently as the next person. Use us. We are
6 here. We demand to have a seat at the table. You
7 have my written testimony, Councilmembers.

8 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you for your time.

9 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you.

10 MS. SKIPPER: Oh, and I'll take questions if you
11 have some.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, I just wanted to say thank
13 you for that. Because oftentimes-- I always say this
14 as a community person myself, as someone who's
15 experienced it. But just the importance of having
16 that lived experience and have a seat at the table.
17 The seat at the table, and the voice is important.
18 And that was a lot of what we were trying to advocate
19 for on the nonprofit side as well, because we felt
20 like there was a lack of that. So I just wanted to
21 say, I appreciate you making that point.

22 MS. SKIPPER: Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. So when
24 you speak about, you know, a seat at the table, and I
25 appreciate your-- your testimony. And you know, as
Councilmembers, we try really hard. We are sitting

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 269

3 here, and-- and so it does matter that you have
4 somebody and a face to talk to. So I appreciate
5 that.

6 But when it comes-- because I mentioned before
7 the capacity building. In what way do you think that
8 that seat at the table-- given, you know, this is a
9 big city. We all have the best intentions. But, you
10 know, we sit here and these are why we have the
11 hearings, to break down these policies, to listen to
12 what everybody needs to say and say, "Okay, where's
13 that happy medium? And where are we missing it?"

14 So my last question to all the folks -- you
15 called them talking heads -- was, you know, what do
16 you need from us? And so how do you envision that
17 seat at the table. Logistically, how would that
18 work, if you have any ideas?

19 MS. SKIPPER: Yeah, well, for starters, we meet
20 to fix how we hold these proceedings. Just like you
21 had a chance to ask questions of the talking heads.
22 We would like that opportunity as well. Um, they
23 come. They sit for a couple hours, and then boom,
24 they're gone. I've been here since nine o'clock this
25 morning, and I sit patiently waiting for my chance to
speak. I have a couple of good questions for them as

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 270

3 well. You know, they should be held accountable for
4 what they say. And again, like I said, if the Mayor
5 had people who are directly impacted on his team, I
6 guarantee you the plan that he put forth would be
7 entirely different, because we who are directly
8 impacted who has been through the systems would have
9 pointed him in a different direction, because we
10 would have shown him how wrong he was to think that
11 we can take the voice and choice from people. There
12 are better ways. You know, and that is what I mean
13 by a seat at the table as you build these policies.

14 CHAIRPERSON LEE: So we would like you to submit
15 your questions that you have that-- for-- for the
16 folks who testified, and you could send it to the
17 same place you submitted your testimony, and we'll
18 get back to you.

19 MS. SKIPPER: Thank you. I appreciate your time.

20 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you to this panel will now
21 move to our next in person panel.

22 It will be Sarah Blanco for Center for Justice
23 Innovation, Nadia Swanson from Ali Forney Center,
24 Christina Sparrock, from Centered Intervention
25 Training, Lena Allen from Fountain House and Nadia
Chait from CASES.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 271

3 Sarah Blanco, you may begin when ready.

4 MS. BLANCO: Can you hear me? Okay. Good
5 afternoon Chairs and esteemed Councilmembers. My
6 name is Sarah Blanco. I'm the clinical director --
7 fancy word for social worker -- at Midtown Community
8 Court Midtown, a project of the Center for Justice
9 Innovation, formerly known as the Center for Court
10 Innovation or CCI.

11 Today I'm here to talk about our work serving
12 people with mental illness, substance use issues, and
13 co-occurring disorders, specifically our community
14 first program and our Midtown misdemeanor mental
15 health court.

16 Before I go into this, I want to say have 20
17 years of experience of working on mobile crisis, ACT
18 teams working with folks living with mental illness
19 whose autonomy has been taken away, who have been
20 hospitalized and who have not had a voice at the
21 table as so many people have spoken today.

22 I want to just go jump straight into our
23 misdemeanor mental health court part that we do have
24 at midtown community court.

25 Unfortunately, folks with mental health issues
are still being arrested. They're often being

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 272

3 arrested at a time where their mental health is
4 destabilizing, something that's happened in their
5 life, and they're either compensating or they're
6 very, very traumatized. We are seeing this court
7 part was launched by OCA back in February. It's open
8 every Friday on at midtown community court. And
9 folks are put into this court part, or either the
10 clients or the legal stakeholders have identified the
11 person as having some sort of mental health issue.
12 It's a voluntary part, clients do not have to take
13 part. We are not here to pathologize and further
14 criminalize folks who live with mental illness.

15 What makes us very, very different than other
16 court parts -- and I want to acknowledge I am talking
17 about a court part, I am talking about someone who's
18 been arrested for a misdemeanor, and we understand by
19 the time the person comes to our court, they've been
20 through arraignment, they've also been off also been
21 very traumatized, often by the arrest process. And
22 they've also been cycling in and out of the criminal
23 legal system, where treatment was probably a better
24 option, and usually was.

25 So I just want to highlight that hallmarks of our
misdemeanor mental health court part or specialized

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 273

3 court part, when clients come into our court, it is
4 not like a downtown criminal Court. They are met by
5 social work staff case managers, to say hello to
6 them, to treat them, like people to walk them through
7 the process, to introduce them to their attorneys, to
8 adhere to the pillars of procedural justice. This is
9 what's happening, this is what's going to happen
10 next. The social workers, case managers stay with
11 the client from the beginning of their case to the
12 end. We sit with them in court. We provide
13 programming. We meet with them as real people. They
14 are not defendants to us, they are real people.

15 Since launching the court part, we have
16 identified several common themes among the clients
17 referred to us. As I said, they're arrested at a
18 time when there's something very traumatic happening
19 in their lives, and it's causing a mental health
20 issue or it's exacerbating a current mental illness.
21 Our staff, our social work staff, our case management
22 staff work with the legal stakeholders to develop
23 treatment mandates. So while you might go to court
24 and the legal parties might say, "You have to do five
25 sessions, or five programs or whatever to to get
through your court case," the legal stakeholders have

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 274

3 so much trust in us that they rely on the social work
4 staff to co create with the client, what they would
5 like to see in their case.

6 So our mandates are very short. But we're not
7 saying you have a charge that this is what you're
8 going to do we sit with the client. We listen to the
9 client. We give space, so they can let us know what
10 they need. We do not mandate mental health
11 treatment, we really build a bridge to whatever
12 services they want. And that can be when they come
13 up and meet with us. They're often hungry,
14 disconnected and unhoused, we can provide food
15 clothing and a cell phone just to start that build
16 trust out. From there, we co-create a treatment plan
17 with the client. We have on site services from
18 counseling, mental health services, case management,
19 benefits assistance. We can link them pretty much
20 immediately to all of this stuff, and it's built an
21 enormous level of trust.

22 I will say that because we case conference weekly
23 with our legal stakeholders, the attorneys, and the
24 court attorneys, and we can show-- we can give
25 context to the client. We can talk about their
26 lives. We come to really, really quick dispositions.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 275

3 Our cases-- often the clients' cases are often over
4 in 33 to 44 days. This allows them to move on with
5 hopefully some of the services and needs met through
6 our social work and clinic staff and our amazing
7 stakeholders, but they don't have the burden of a
8 court case over them, which is-- that in itself is so
9 incredibly stressful. And it can be paralyzing. You
10 want to get a new job, but you have an open case.
11 You want to do something else, but you have a new
12 case.

13 I will say some of the highlights other than like
14 the constant engagement with our clients, upon
15 completion of the clients court case, we really tried
16 to break down the hierarchy. The client can get his
17 certificate of graduation. We clap for the client.
18 The judge gets off the bench and we highlight their
19 successes. We acknowledge the challenges, but we
20 highlight their successes.

21 Clients have recorded that this is the first time
22 in the justice system. They've actually felt
23 physically looked at, heard, and felt like there-- I
24 don't know, some state were supportive, but some say
25 they just felt like they were treated like a human
being. A lot of the clients we see in misdemeanor

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 276

3 mental health court continue to talk to us and work
4 with our staff on a voluntary basis posts mandate,
5 because they want to continue to get the help they
6 decide they want.

7 I know I've run out of time. I just want to
8 highlight that misdemeanor mental health court
9 midtown communities court is unfunded. To continue
10 to address these-- these rising case loads, these
11 clients with a lot of needs, we need more money to
12 support staff and programming. We don't want folks
13 to be circling through the system. We want them to
14 walk out with their needs addressed, and for them to
15 to kind of move on with their lives. Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: Thank you so much. I thank
17 you for your testimony. As the Chair of the
18 Committee of Public Safety, I've-- I've seen and
19 witnessed the-- the benefits of the mental health
20 court in Brooklyn and I-- I've experienced firsthand,
21 the applause. And I've also experienced this when
22 judges do use their discretion saying, "Okay, this
23 person is not ready, and they need to be remanded."

24 How do you see the Center for Court Justice
25 Innovation, what their role is, because we heard many
of the public testifying that they need to be at the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 277

3 table, but I also believe that -- I'm from Staten
4 Island, so you see the one little like Justice
5 Center. So we're working in earnest to get a mental
6 health court in Staten Island, as well as a community
7 court and how important those pieces are.

8 So is this-- how do you see an integration with
9 the Mayor's plan? And seeing that, that piece needs
10 to be in there? Because we've been all saying,
11 "Well, what happens when they're let go? And what
12 happens? What is the off ramp? What is the on ramp?
13 What does that look like?" And I think that you
14 know, the Center for Court Justice is just what the
15 doctor ordered, and I've seen the great work that has
16 been done. And it's-- it's-- how do we-- in your
17 perspective, how do you see the integration of--
18 because I think this is an important piece, right?
19 That we just-- you weren't up here testifying with
20 everyone else. But I think that that would have been
21 a really nice bookend to-- we do have all of those--
22 those pieces.

23 So how would you know, notwithstanding funding,
24 because we get it, everybody who comes here and wants
25 funding-- but how do you see that role playing so

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 278

3 that even if we can advocate for funding, we're
4 asking for something very specific. Thank you.

5 MS. BLANCO: Okay, I'm just trying-- Can you
6 repeat the question? I'm just trying to--

7 CHAIRPERSON HANKS: How do you see your
8 connection? If you know, you're-- you're saying that
9 this is the Center for Court Justice and Innovation.
10 How do you see that component in the current plan
11 that the Mayor has-- has released for involuntary
12 remanding?

13 MS. BLANCO: I mean, to be blunt, I don't see it
14 as part of the plan. We don't-- we are not here to
15 take people to the hospital who might appear that
16 they are not doing well. I think those terms have
17 been not defined yet. They're really, really broad.
18 There's not been training. There's-- there's talk of
19 bias. And I think what is going to happen if this
20 plan goes through, we're going to see more people
21 arrested and harmed. And so I think an off ramp is
22 something we have-- or if an intercept model is to be
23 proactive, we have a community-first model that works
24 with folks on the street to try to engage them in
25 services before they're involved in the criminal
legal system. Or if they already are, we can provide

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 279

3 the supports to help them get through it. I think
4 misdemeanor mental health court is a specialized
5 court part that can sensitively, in a trauma-informed
6 way, work with folks who are experiencing mental
7 health issues, rather than cycle them in and out of
8 the hospitals. Right. We'll get there. Thank you.

9 MS. BLANCO: Thanks.

10 COUNSEL SUCHER: Nadia Swanson, you may begin
11 when ready.

12 MS. SWANSON: Hello, thank you to the Committee
13 for hearing our testimony today. My name is Nadia
14 Swanson. I'm a licensed clinical social worker with
15 12 years of experience, and the Director of Technical
16 Assistance and Advocacy at the Ali Forney Center.

17 AFC is the largest and most comprehensive service
18 for LGBTQ youth, ages 16 to 24, experiencing
19 homelessness. Over 2000 youth a year access our 24/7
20 drop in, clinical services and housing programs. And
21 we oppose this initiative not only for the youth we
22 serve every day but also because we know that
23 nationally 44% of unhoused adults experienced
24 homelessness before the age of 25.

25 We are all in agreement that we want all New
Yorkers to be able to get the care they need. But

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 280

3 this is not the way to do it. It is harmful,
4 criminalizing, stigmatizing. Having police be the
5 first response to mental health needs to a complete
6 lack of understanding of the issue. For youth, just
7 the presence of police will enact their fight-flight
8 response, creating the self fulfilling prophecy the
9 cops will need in order to justify their choices.

10 Someone with mental health needs, someone in
11 psychiatric crisis, and someone who is enacting
12 violence are not the same thing. And when you just
13 handle it correctly, it is done with thoughtfulness
14 equitably, honoring their worth and self-
15 determination. This initiative conflicts with our
16 professional values and code of ethics that we're
17 licensed to uphold. We go through years of
18 specialized education, internships, exams,
19 supervision and ongoing work to confront our own
20 biases in order to be able to assess the nuance of
21 imminent risk, and when other services for safety can
22 be provided.

23 NYPD can't do that in a few hours of training,
24 especially with the values of the NYPD. We have seen
25 too many times that people are killed during a mental
health call. This is especially true for LGBTQ youth

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 281

3 who are disproportionately black, brown, and trans
4 and it does not address the specific needs of LGBTQ
5 youth.

6 Because of this AFC does everything we can to
7 avoid police interactions for our youth. Others have
8 shared stories about the violence, dehumanization,
9 and the trauma that our youth face.

10 So I'm going to share a quick story. One day at
11 our drop in center, I responded to a youth that was
12 screaming in the hallway about wanting a gun to shoot
13 themselves. Over the course of the next hour I sat
14 on the floor with her, listened, built rapport, was
15 able to keep them with me instead of her running
16 away, using my clinical skills, give tangible
17 resources, art materials to express themselves
18 allowing them space to be in privacy without the
19 pressure to speak. And by the end she was calm. And
20 I was able to determine that she was not actually
21 thinking of harming herself, and was reacting to how
22 the New York City system had failed her.

23 We were able to end with the safety plan, find
24 them emergency shelter bed and outpatient services.

25 I see my co workers do this every day. If she
had been confronted by the police at that first

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 282

3 moment, it would have ended in a physical violence
4 against her, and you can't learn how to do all of
5 that just described in an hour training video.

6 This initiative is infuriating. It's a waste of
7 time and resources especially when we all know the
8 answer: housing. We need early intervention for
9 degenerative SMI, no-barrier affirming mental health
10 care peer to peer support expanding programs like B-
11 HEARD, which has been very successful at our drop in
12 in Harlem, RHY mental health shelters and housing,
13 housing, housing. Thank you.

14 COUNSEL SUCHER: Christina Speric, you may begin
15 when ready.

16 MS. SPARROCK: Good day Chair and members. Today
17 I'm requesting the Mayor's mental health plan to be
18 re evaluated as it relates to the use of police to
19 involuntary remote people they deem to have mental
20 health conditions into hospitals without the
21 individual even being a danger to themselves or
22 others. I want to also ensure the city does not
23 merely substitute mental health professionals for
24 police, as some, I'm not saying all, as some mental
25 health professionals are harming our neighbors who
need care and place them in dire circumstances.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 283

3 The solution instead should be centered around
4 pair specialists, people with lived experience and a
5 fully-transformed mental health crisis response.

6 Before I continue, I would like to introduce
7 myself my name is Christina Sparrock. I'm a
8 Certified Public Accountant living with a mental
9 health condition. I'm a staunch mental health
10 advocate and a founder of Person Centered
11 Intervention Training, Mental Health Response Pilot,
12 or PCIT, which is a peer-run up agency that
13 destigmatizes mental health conditions and supports
14 communities.

15 The PCIT program is a person-centered, strength-
16 based, trauma-informed, and empowering model that
17 meets people where they're at, removes the emphasis
18 on what's wrong with the person, and focuses on what
19 happened.

20 For instance, if a person needs immediate housing
21 and has an emotional break, connecting them with
22 housing, and offering involuntary support as opposed
23 to police is the way to do it and not incarceration
24 or hospitalization.

25 Not only is PCIT effective for people living with
mental conditions, but it benefits others living with

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 284

3 substance use issues, those who are just as involved,
4 unhoused, and the general population overall.

5 Whether it's a law enforcement officer, a teacher, a
6 surgeon, or a psychiatrist, mental health conditions
7 can affect everyone. It's not a them issue. It's a
8 we issue.

9 In addition, PCIT employs peer specialists who
10 are vital to the success of the program to help
11 divert people from law enforcement to treatment and
12 services. Peer specialists understand and have
13 walked in the shoes of others' needs and know the
14 path to recovery, and mental health condition is not
15 a crime. It's about normalizing the condition,
16 providing people with the services based on their
17 unmet needs, and having empathy and patience.

18 Sadly, at the System for Mental Health Emergency
19 has always been public safety or law enforcement as
20 far as first responders, and things have been hugely
21 exacerbated by the Mayor's new policy. And law
22 enforcement now has the authority to involuntarily
23 remove people they deem to have mental health
24 conditions into hospitals without even knowing-- not
25 without the individual you or even being in danger to
themselves or others. Notably, hospitals can be very

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 285

3 traumatizing, and traumatizing. I know; I've been
4 there.

5 Although the mental health professionals are a
6 better option than police for engaging with people
7 with mental health conditions, there are still red
8 flags within the mental health system that must be
9 addressed and rectified.

10 According to the recent article in [inaudible]
11 Psychiatry, there is a growing body of evidence of
12 mental illness, stigma, and health care. There's
13 biases, there's discriminative practices, a whole lot
14 of things, by people who took an oath to first do no
15 harm, and to fact to continue to do the harm.

16 Without being treated with dignity and respect,
17 without having access to trauma informed person
18 centered care by peers, people with mental health
19 conditions decompensate end up in hospitals, jailed,
20 unhoused, unemployed, and fall victim to crimes and
21 continue to be subjected to a plethora of emotional,
22 physical, psychological tax due to no fault of their
23 own. Right in my backyard, District 35, people
24 living with mental health conditions, substance use
25 misuse, and other you know unhoused, and just have
now fallen victim to community-based organizations

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 286

3 and to mental health organizations which
4 unfortunately led to unwellness. People in the
5 community were neglected, didn't receive mental
6 health treatment, no continuum of care. People of
7 color were getting less services than their white
8 counterparts. A person, continuum of care, she ended
9 up missing. Persons-- people were overdosed. The
10 peer specialists worked in the-- reported a hostile
11 environment. They were bullied. They went on
12 medical leave. They were hospitalized. They would
13 quit. They were reported to HR, but humiliated. It
14 was horrible, right?

15 Funders and the funders were misinformed.

16 I would like to share details more after, if you
17 want to know more about it, because I would love to
18 share it too, and offer it, and ask that you
19 investigate.

20 Many vulnerable people consequences are forced to
21 be silence. Peers are silenced all the time. While
22 city/state funded foundation funding agencies go
23 unpoliced and unpunished leads us to say, and for the
24 reasons set forth, this is why innocent people fall
25 victim to our systems and end up unwell, unhoused,
and under the Mayor's plan are involuntary removed by

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 287

3 the police. I can get removed by police in my own
4 neighborhood because I have a mental health
5 condition.

6 So as a solution -- I have more to say anyway --
7 as a solution, I have three requests for city
8 council. First to support and fund peer-run response
9 pilots like PCIT. Second to mandate culturally
10 responsive trauma-informed, person-centered, training
11 designed by peer specialists, because we know what's
12 best for our you know, health and how we want to be
13 approach, to train all health professionals and
14 police, and also to create an independent peer
15 advisory council that has access to data on quality
16 of services of all health professionals, advise on
17 best practices, assist in introducing and reviewing
18 legislation, and issue public reports so we can all
19 review them. Thank you. Any questions?

20 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No. I was just going to say,
21 You took the words out of my mouth. Because when you
22 were talking about that, I wanted to actually follow
23 up with you afterwards. So I'll definitely make sure
24 to get your contact information.

25 MS. SPARROCK: Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Okay.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 288

2 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you. Next we'll hear from
3 Lena Allen from Fountain House, you may begin when
4 ready.

5 MS. ALLEN: Good afternoon committee chairs and
6 members. My name is Lena Allen. I'm a Policy
7 Analyst at Fountain House and I'm here to testify
8 against the directive to expand the use of
9 involuntary removal to address mental health needs in
10 New York City.

11 Fountain House appreciates this issue is
12 receiving the attention it deserves, because robust
13 and respectful policy to support people living with
14 Serious Mental Illness, especially those who are
15 unhoused, is long overdue. Fountain House, as the
16 originator of the clubhouse model, knows based on our
17 almost 75 years of experience, that real progress can
18 be made with solutions that are rooted in person-
19 centered public health approaches.

20 While respecting the Administration's increased
21 focus. We are concerned about any effort that
22 utilizes short term and voluntary measures as a
23 starting place. We are equally concerned about steps
24 that rely heavily on law enforcement because we know
25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 289

3 public health workers are better positioned to be at
4 the forefront of engaging this community.

5 We cannot and should not ignore people who are
6 living on our streets but must ensure that our care
7 efforts center on dignity and agency. Fountain House
8 has partnered with other or community-based
9 organizations to spearhead efforts that enable people
10 not only to become housed but to recover and thrive.
11 The key element is building trust.

12 40% of our members have been unhoused, a quarter
13 have been involved with the justice system, and some
14 have had experiences with involuntary treatment.
15 Many of our members feel fearful of this new expanded
16 directive, because their behavior could be
17 misinterpreted and put them at needless risk of an
18 encounter with law enforcement. Our members, of
19 which there are 2000 in New York City, are people
20 living with Serious Mental Illness who choose to
21 voluntarily be part be part of our recovery
22 community. Our members, staff, and partners are
23 deeply committed to working together to protect our
24 community, share our stories, and advocate for what
25 we know does work.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 290

3 Without a comprehensive plan that moves people
4 from crisis to recovery, the approaches announced
5 will not address the revolving doors to hospitals and
6 jails and can further stigmatize people living with
7 SMI.

8 And beyond the moment of crisis, the city must
9 resource community based recovery models including
10 respite centers, supportive housing, peer models, and
11 club houses like Fountain House, which will greatly
12 reduce the need for crisis response in the first
13 place.

14 Mayor Adams stated in his speech, people living
15 with severe mental illness deserve care, community
16 and treatment and the least restrictive setting
17 possible. We agree, and believe that now is the
18 moment to develop the continuum of care plan, and to
19 do so in partnership with people with lived
20 experience, as well as organizations and
21 professionals who have effectively served this
22 community.

23 The greatest city in the world can and should be
24 the most humane and visionary and caring for our most
25 vulnerable. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Nadia.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 291

3 MS. CHAIT: Good afternoon. Nice to see you,
4 Chair Lee. I'm Nadia Chait. I'm the Senior Director
5 of Policy and Advocacy at CASES, and we are an
6 organization that's dedicated to serving New Yorkers
7 who have Serious Mental Illness and who have had
8 interactions with the criminal legal system.

9 To be blunt, our clients are those who are most
10 likely to be caught up by this directive in ways that
11 will be very harmful to them, and that will lead to
12 their removal from the community, and from the
13 services that we provide that are actually helping
14 them. So we strongly oppose it.

15 But you've heard a lot today about all the
16 reasons why this is bad. And so I'm going to focus
17 on the things that we should do instead, because
18 there is a clear need to help New Yorkers who are
19 experiencing Serious Mental Illness as particularly
20 those who are living on the streets.

21 We strongly urge the council to work with the
22 Mayor to increase funding for intensive mobile
23 treatment, to eliminate the waitlist for these
24 services. CASES is the largest provider of intensive
25 mobile treatment, which is a team-based model of pure
specialists, behavioral health specialists,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 292

3 psychiatrists, and nurses who provide wraparound
4 support to individuals who have Serious Mental
5 Illness, and are homeless or were recently homeless.
6 These are individuals who have been repeatedly failed
7 by our systems and fallen among the gap the, you
8 know, gaping holes between the different silos of
9 services. But IMT is incredibly successful. And IMT
10 is built on the premise that when individuals receive
11 the services that they need and are offered the
12 services that they need, that they will engage with
13 services in a voluntary fashion, and that we do not
14 need to use involuntary commitment as a first step in
15 serving individuals. Our understanding is that
16 there's currently a 600-to-700 person waitlist for
17 intensive mobile treatment services, which is
18 unacceptable. And while the city does have an RFP
19 out to add five additional teams, that will not
20 eliminate the waitlist that'll serve about 135
21 additional individuals. So we strongly encourage
22 increased funding for intensive mobile treatment.

23 We also would like to see more support for the
24 clinic based services, which -- Councilmember Lee I
25 know, you know, the funding challenges of clinics
very well -- but at CASES, we really struggle with

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 293

3 the need to provide holistic support for our clients
4 under a model that is based on a fee-for-service, you
5 do a thing, you get billed and that doesn't really
6 treat our clients as the complex, wonderful people
7 that they are, who might need criminal justice
8 support, who might need housing support, who might
9 need someone to go and visit them in the community,
10 rather than making them come into the clinic.

11 So we had certified community behavioral health
12 clinic funding, which was a SAMSA grant.

13 Unfortunately, our grant expired and our clinic
14 currently operates at an annual deficit of \$700,000
15 per year. That is not a loss that our agency can
16 continue to maintain. We are the only clinic in
17 Harlem or the South Bronx, and one of the only
18 clinics in Manhattan that is dedicated to serving
19 folks with Serious Mental Illness and criminal legal
20 system involvement. And so we urge the council to
21 explore ways to better fund services like ours.

22 And last, I'll just close with talking about the
23 need to better serve those who are caught up in the
24 courts. We are the pretrial service provider for
25 Individuals who are facing trial in Manhattan in New
York County. So we provide supervised release

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 294

3 services to a range of folks who are arrested and
4 facing trial and Manhattan.

5 We find that unfortunately, those with mental
6 illness are more likely to fall between some of the
7 gaps that make it harder for them to succeed in
8 pretrial services, particularly individuals who are
9 homeless. And so to fill this gap, we would really
10 like to see what we're calling a community care van,
11 which would be a van located right outside of
12 criminal court so that when folks are leaving
13 arraignment, they could immediately go into the van
14 for a clinical psychiatric and substance use
15 intervention. The van would have a shower and a
16 bathroom, we would be able to provide folks with
17 clothes, food, and escort them to the services that
18 they need. So instead of having individuals who were
19 arrested because of their mental illness, left
20 without help, or sent to Rikers, we would be able to
21 provide them the holistic support that they need.

22 Thank you.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And unfortunately,
24 that deficit is all too common with a lot of these
25 outpatient nonprofit clinics. So hopefully, there's
a lot we can change on the reimbursement system in

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 295

3 and of itself, which needs to be fixed. So I totally
4 agree with you on that point. And I just want to
5 thank all of you for the work you're doing in the
6 community. So thank you. Thank you.

7 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you to this panel. Our
8 next in person panel will be Ruth Lowencron, Ramon
9 Leclerc, Simone Gamble, Ari Kadesh, and Alexandra
10 Nyman.

11 Alexandra, you may begin when ready.

12 Good afternoon Chair Lee, members of the
13 Committees. My name is Alexandra Nyman and I serve
14 as the CEO of the Break Free Foundation that provides
15 scholarships for individuals suffering from substance
16 use disorders, so that they can attend a
17 rehabilitation and outpatient program at no cost to
18 them. Thank you for this opportunity to testify.

19 It is my firm belief that involuntary mental
20 health hospitalizations cause obstacles to quality,
21 evidence-based mental health care by creating a fear
22 of forced treatment and fraying a person's trust in
23 the mental health care system.

24 A family member of mine went through this when
25 they were in college due to being in mental health
crisis, and being confronted by an officer instead of

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 296

3 a mental health professional did not remedy this
4 situation but intensified it. This confrontation
5 resulted in them having a severe panic attack as the
6 officer was not equipped to de-escalate the
7 situation, but kept escalating things to the point
8 that my family member did not feel safe.

9 After the officer called an ambulance. My family
10 member was rerouted twice to two different hospitals
11 before they were able to get to the proper
12 facilities, causing my family member to be worried
13 and panicked about how much this ride would cost
14 them, which should be the last thing that you're
15 experiencing when you're going through a bout of
16 mania.

17 Instead of finding relief during their
18 hospitalization, for the first 24 hours, they sat on
19 a stretcher in a hallway waiting for an open room to
20 open up getting little to no sleep. They were not
21 able to contact me so I had no idea where they were
22 for roughly 72 hours.

23 When they got into a room and were admitted into
24 the behavioral health unit, they were lumped in with
25 patients of varying mental illnesses. There was
chaos in the halls screaming throughout the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 297

3 corridors, with medication shoved down their throat
4 forcefully.

5 This shut my family member down from talking
6 about the experience until after years of intensive
7 therapy. While my family member did not have a co
8 occurring disorder, which further exacerbates this
9 dire issue, and is not an unhoused individual, they
10 were not given the qualitative treatment they needed.

11 I'm lucky that they're still here with us and
12 that they are in recovery to this day.

13 People who struggle with behavioral health issues
14 are marginalized and face stigma that can lead to
15 severe consequences. Chair Hanks and members of
16 these esteemed committees, you must realize that this
17 policy perpetuates the belief that many people hold
18 that individuals with mental health issues are
19 dangerous. But in reality, they're more likely to be
20 victims of crime and excessive use of force by the
21 police than to cause harm.

22 I urge this committee to put an end to this
23 policy. In the words of my esteemed colleague, Matt
24 Kudish, the CEO of The New York chapter of NAMI, the
25 city has the power to provide on-site treatment as
well as treatment in homeless shelters or supported

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 298

3 housing, but has chosen not to. The time to make
4 these changes and to address the mental health crisis
5 within our city is now, but causing generational
6 trauma and the process and resistance to behavioral
7 health care is not the way to go about it.

8 Thank you for the opportunity to testify today
9 and your continued leadership and partnership. I can
10 answer any questions you may have.

11 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much and good
12 person to quote Matt Kudish. I know him personally
13 myself, so he's a wonderful human being.

14 COUNSEL SUCHER: Before we move on to the next
15 panelist, Ruth, I apologize. I'm just going to call
16 the remaining in-person registrants to see if they're
17 here, and for them to come up and please get ready to
18 testify. So Stephen Nathaniel Reesie, Kate Whitmore,
19 Jason Bowen, Christine Henson, and Richard William
20 Flores. If you're here, please come to the table and
21 get ready to testify for-- following Ruth. Thank
22 you. ruth, you may begin when ready.

23 Thank you. Ruth Lowenkron. I'm the Director of
24 the Disability Justice Program at New York Lawyers
25 for the Public Interest. My office is a proud member
of CCIT-NYC, Correct Crisis Intervention Today, New

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 299

3 York City. I just want to point out that that is
4 constituted of over 80 organizations that advocate in
5 this space, and I think it's a really good link to
6 one of my profound comments. I have prepared my
7 testimony, and will share it with you.

8 So you're going to get a little melange of
9 summary. Having sat here all day, there has to be an
10 advantage. I have all kinds of other thoughts that
11 occurred to me. And one of them is: So not only are
12 these ad organizations, or as my mother would say,
13 "anyone who's anyone", is a member of CCIT-NYC. But
14 have you ever been at a hearing where everybody has--
15 speaks in the same voice and says no to what the
16 Mayor is doing? I think it's profound. And I think
17 that really has to be underscored. There isn't a
18 single person, other than the city agency, and I want
19 to say to follow with Skip said: I think it's not
20 only an entire disrespect, that they are not here,
21 but in an outrage beyond that. We are the taxpayers.
22 They don't want to hear what we have to say on this?
23 How dare they leave the room without listening to
24 what we have to say, without listening to the fact
25 that nobody supports what the Mayor says.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 300

3 So that's one profundity. And the others are
4 perhaps just summaries. As I said, outside, I think
5 there is no doubt that this is not only immoral, it's
6 illegal as my colleague Beth Haroules spoke about.
7 There is litigation about this. It is not hard to
8 see why it's illegal.

9 And I think I'm going to try and break it down
10 just a little bit, and then put it together with
11 testimony we heard from NYPD.

12 So what this policy allows is for the police to
13 stop individuals whom they think may have a mental
14 health illness -- they don't know, and how would they
15 know, and how could they know? So they think they
16 have mental health illness, and they think they are
17 unable to take care of their basic needs, whatever
18 that might mean, because lord knows it is not defined
19 anywhere.

20 What is so critical is that this is an absolute
21 departure from all law that says that if you want to
22 -- if the city, the police want to detain an
23 individual, they must show that the individual is a
24 danger to themselves or others. There is no pretense
25 to even the idea that we are saying that the person
has a danger to self or others. Perhaps they do, but

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 301

3 very more so what if perhaps they don't? And I think
4 it's very telling, when we got a list of examples.

5 I've been going a whole time talking about the Mayor
6 saying about kickboxing. Kickboxing? You're kidding
7 me. How does that show someone's a danger to

8 themselves? Well, today I heard the ultimate insult,
9 or the ultimate incredulity, when the when the NYPD

10 said oh, you know, if someone reeks of urine -- and

11 then perhaps I didn't hear her right, so she repeated
12 herself. So someone reeking from urine would be

13 thought of to be a danger to themselves. I do

14 imagine there could be certain circumstances when

15 that's true. I have a vivid imagination. But that

16 doesn't mean that we are hearing something that we

17 can rely on in terms of what the NYPD is being

18 trained. It is very, very scary. If that's their

19 idea of who the people are that they can be picking

20 up.

21 I know the bell is ringing. So I'm going to say

22 just a few more things, I think it's really important

23 to know that if you would like to see, in addition to

24 the incredibly compelling experiences, we heard of

25 people and their family members, what my office has

done is obtained the body-worn camera footage of a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 302

3 number of the individuals who are killed at the hands
4 of the police when experiencing a mental health
5 crisis.

6 Under the banner "picture worth 1000 words", it
7 is incredible. As one person said, first they
8 escalate. Well, I don't know if that person said
9 that. First they escalate. And then when all else
10 fails, and they shoot the individual -- here's the
11 part we heard already -- then they don't even try to
12 take care of the individual they've shot.

13 So listen, the other elephant in the room. Let's
14 be real here, and others have talked about this.
15 This is not about helping people with mental health
16 issues. Because if it were, we know how to do it.
17 We absolutely know how to do it. This is about
18 sweeping people with mental health issues away, so
19 the rest of the city does not have to look at them,
20 so the rest of the city does not have to feel like,
21 "Oh my goodness, we're somehow failing and, ooh, look
22 at that person." Let's call it for what it is.
23 That's exactly what it is, and know that if you
24 called it really helping someone, you would have a
25 plan.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 303

3 And that goes to two other quick thoughts. One
4 is, I want to correct the record, when Jason Hansen
5 said that he worked with the community. Again, I am
6 hugely part of that community. I do not know anyone
7 who was consulted on this. I think this was done in
8 secret. The police didn't even know about it, as
9 we've all heard.

10 And the last thing I want to close with is
11 another statistic that picks right up off of my
12 colleagues statistic. And that is not only are
13 people with mental health, more likely to be victims
14 than perpetrators. But we think, because the
15 newspaper inundates us, because the Mayor tells us
16 it's so, because popular culture tells us it's so
17 that those people, quotation marks, with mental
18 health issues are hugely dangerous and violent.

19 Well, that just is not true. They are no more
20 dangerous and violent than anyone else in the
21 population with or without a diagnosis. And I think
22 that's a hugely important statistic to leave with. I
23 will stop shouting at you now.

24 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, thank you for that. Thank
25 you for that. And you're passionate as well, because
I know NILPI has done a lot of work around this, and

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 304

3 so I really appreciate your efforts on this. So
4 thank you.

5 MS. LOWNKRON: Thank you, Councilmember.

6 COUNSEL SUCHER: You may proceed next when you're
7 ready.

8 MR. BOWEN: Hello? All right. Hi, everyone. My
9 name is Jason Bowen, my pronouns are they/them, and I
10 work as a peer advocate at the Community Access
11 Crisis Respite.

12 So for a brief Intro for folks who might not
13 know, again, what Respite is. Respite is meant to be
14 an alternative to hospitalization for folks in
15 crisis. It's meant to be a place where folks can
16 come for short-term residential support. Everyone
17 that works there is a peer, meaning we have our own
18 lived experience. You know, we cook meals together,
19 we do workshops. Sometimes I sit with folks and hold
20 their hand while they cry. Sometimes we go on walks
21 and look at the sun or look at the moon together.
22 You know, it's really just an experience of being
23 with each other. Really that bone deep, loving,
24 caring on another person that is so, so needed.

25 And yet, you know, it's meant to be an
alternative to hospitalization for folks in crisis.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 305

3 And the respite center that I work at has an average
4 waitlist of about five to eight weeks. Weeks. So
5 people are calling, "I need somewhere to go now. I
6 need crisis support." And it's constantly, "Well,
7 you can try calling NYC-WELL. You can try calling
8 988. You can try going to the hospital." Been
9 there. Done that. I've tried it. It's not working.

10 You know, at the Respite that I work at, I just
11 came off a 12 hour shift actually. I worked
12 overnight last night. I worked 8pm to 8am this
13 morning and came straight here. And I'm going back
14 tomorrow. And that's because you know, for a place
15 to function 24/7/365, you need staff. I'm-- I'm
16 grateful to be 22 years old, and then I've got the
17 stamina to work 12/24 hour shifts, but we shouldn't
18 have to do this. We should not have to do this.

19 And the work that we're supposed to be providing
20 as peers is emotional care and support. I chose to
21 become a peer because you know, I-- I come from a
22 family who has a history of intergenerational trauma.
23 I have my own traumas. And I came to be a peer
24 because I was lucky enough to go to school in the
25 city, and when I was having my-- you know, going
through my mental health experience as an undergrad,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 306

3 I was essentially told, you know, that either I
4 should drop out because I wasn't fit enough to be at
5 school there, or that if I did have a crisis that the
6 police or campus security were warranted to come into
7 my room and hospitalize me.

8 So these routes of involuntary coercion, not care
9 are not unique to this legislation, are not unique to
10 this era. This is systemic. It is the basis of the
11 mental health system in this country. I mean, we
12 have to literally look historically.

13 The first diagnoses of psychology in this
14 country, you can go back to 1861 journal reviews,
15 Drake Domani was one of the first diagnoses that
16 existed in modern psychiatry. What was that?
17 Drapetomania was what enslavers could diagnose
18 enslaved people who ran away from plantations with.
19 They could be diagnosed with drapetomania and forced
20 to return to a plantation.

21 This is the same roots of the way that police act
22 now it's involuntarily committing people to
23 hospitals, involuntarily putting people in carceral
24 settings, depriving them of the care that they need.
25 Care does not look like putting someone in a setting
where they can't go home, they can't call their

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 307

3 family, their phone is taken away from them, their
4 clothes are taken away from them. It's horrible.
5 It's horrible.

6 And we can, you know, I talk to people inside
7 our, you know, hospitals. I talk to people inside
8 Rikers every day. And I encourage everyone, you
9 know, if your family if you haven't gone to that, do
10 talk to people. Build those relationships. You
11 know, we need to fund our programs. We need to fund
12 nonprofits. But also, we need to love on each other.

13 You know, I'm so privileged to have built up my
14 you know, crisis response skills, my radical mental
15 health first aid, I want-- you know, I volunteer at a
16 community garden. I share these skills with the
17 folks in my garden. I want everyone to go knock at
18 your local bodega, to go knock at your local
19 restaurants to say, "Do you know what to do if
20 someone's experiencing a mental health crisis? Do
21 you know tools to call besides 911? Do you know who
22 to call in your neighborhood? If you're going
23 through crisis, do you know what family members you
24 can call?"

25 The some of the things we can do, you know, are
so complicated, but there are so many things we can

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 308
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 do individually, and with your support and funding
4 that are so simple, so implementable, so clear. I'm
5 22, and I can see it clear as day and there are
6 people who have been fighting so much longer than I
7 have black, queer, trans, indigenous, ancestors who
8 are fighting every day. And you know, that's all
9 Thank you. Yeah.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you for that. I have a
11 couple of questions, but I'm going to wait until the
12 panel finishes first and then-- go ahead.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: Sure, you may begin when ready.

14 RICHARD: Sorry, I'm currently homeless. And I'm
15 residing at the BRC shelter on 47th Street. I've
16 been a resident there since October 21 of 2021.
17 Before I became a resident there, the volunteers used
18 to come to speak to me on the subway. I didn't know
19 about the BRC. I didn't know about the Manhattan
20 Conservatorium. I didn't know that these agencies
21 existed. I went to the drop-in centers to try to
22 receive help against my will, because I became
23 homeless because a family court judge committed
24 perjury. They literally lied in court. And that lie
25 became me being homeless.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 309

3 I had a lawyer appointed to me for free by the
4 city whom I saw before the court date, and brought
5 him documentation to show what was allegedly being
6 said about myself and my family. And he told me that
7 documentation didn't mean anything to him. He told
8 me that I had to find a job in a month, and if I
9 didn't find a job in a month, I would be homeless.
10 And this is documentation that I had from the
11 hospital, being hospitalized several times,
12 Documentation showing what had happened in the home,
13 documentation showing what had happened with the
14 police. And he literally told me, that didn't
15 matter. He said, "If you don't do this, you're going
16 to become homeless." And so I became homeless.

17 When the volunteers saw me in the street, I
18 became aware of the fact that they weren't just
19 looking at me as being a statistic. They were
20 looking at me as someone who would become a victim to
21 the legislation in this country. And I said to
22 myself, "Wow, what what am I supposed to do now? I
23 went to court, I had a lawyer. Perjury was committed
24 in court. And now I'm, I'm a homeless person." I've
25 worked in the financial industry in the city. I've
worked for Chase Bank. I've worked for Toronto

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 310

3 Dominion. I've worked for many, many banks. I know
4 it's kind of long.

5 And what I'm trying to surmise is, what I think
6 is not being addressed here by-- by the Mayor's
7 policies is that how, how could he dare treat an
8 American citizen like that? How could legislation be
9 passed like that?

10 It's a question that I think about every single
11 day. Now, you talked about services. You talked
12 about people being taken away from the streets.
13 Everyone's talked about the work that they've done
14 here for people. The work that they do every day.
15 What I-- what's amazingly dismaying to me is that the
16 BRC is a phony agency. They abuse people there.
17 They routinely use racist comments, discriminatory
18 practices. I emailed the Mayor. They called me
19 back. I emailed the governor, they sent two
20 detectives to the BRC shelter who gave a false
21 interview with me about my complaints about what had
22 gone on there. And the detectives called me back and
23 said, "Sir, we don't have any evidence of the
24 allegations that you made." And I said to them,
25 "Sir, if he's if what I'm saying didn't happen, why
would I text you?"

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 311

3 Now this is being done under the banner of men of
4 mental illness, schizophrenia, paranoia. And to be
5 perfectly honest with you, it's a trick. And it's
6 somebody that's being done on purpose to incarcerate
7 people, to make people sick and kill people.

8 The mayor and the governor are well aware of this
9 issue.

10 And I guess lastly, what I'd like to say is the
11 Mayor and the governor have to be held accountable
12 for the fact that they too, are committing perjury,
13 and they're spreading lies, they're spreading racism,
14 they're spreading discrimination under the banner of
15 the law.

16 And this legislation has to be changed. It has
17 to be revamped to help the people in the way that
18 they really need to be helped, or else this is going
19 to go on, and 20 years from now. The kids who have
20 been affected the young people have been affected by
21 the policies that are being put forth today, there'll
22 be sitting before the next committee, talking about
23 what's affecting them. And this is just going to go
24 on and on and on, despite the efforts of all the
25 people trying to make things better, despite the
efforts of your committee trying to make things

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 312

3 better. The governor, the Mayor. It's almost as if
4 it's almost absurd, like-- like, it doesn't really
5 matter. They're saying that it matters, but yet it
6 doesn't really matter. They're putting these
7 policies forward without a true conviction, without--
8 without a true plan.

9 I could sit with the Mayor, I love listening to
10 the people here. Every single day, I would love to
11 sit with him. And if he asked me, "Richard, do you
12 have any solutions?" I could provide solutions.
13 I'll say, "Sir, I'm the one that's living at the
14 shelter, not you." Right?

15 He went to the shelter the other day to spend
16 time with the migrants there. And he said the
17 conditions were deplorable. He said the conditions
18 were awful, et cetera.

19 I thought a lot of it was a political show to be
20 to be quite honest with you. Because he's been mayor
21 for quite some time. Governor Hochul has been here
22 for quite some time. And the first thing you will
23 look for, for them, is for them to be perfectly
24 honest and factual about what's going on, and not
25 play a semantical game or a political game about
what's going on. They should just simply tell the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 313

3 truth. And therefore, when the budget proposals are
4 are made, that money is supposed to be used to
5 actually help the people.

6 I testified to the New York Senate in 2020, to
7 the entire Senate, and the budget proposal was being
8 passed back then as well. I told him my personal
9 story, I told them what I thought about what they
10 were doing, I told them about what their policies
11 were doing. When we returned back to New York, with
12 the agency, the group that I was with, guess where I
13 was? Out on the street. And I'd been on the street-
14 - I was on the street for seven years, in bone
15 chilling weather, cold blue weather, denied shelter
16 at Bellevue, denied shelter at the drop-in centers.
17 Seven years. And that's-- that's a very traumatizing
18 thing for them to turn around and say, "Okay, now
19 we're going to provide you services," it's almost
20 adding insult to injury, you know? It's really
21 absurd.

22 So, the reason why I wanted to testify today is
23 because perhaps it might help yourself, and help the
24 Mayor, and help the Governor try to think about what
25 strategies are going to be used, and what would be
useful, hearing it from someone who's actually living

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 314

3 it every single day, you know, and it's-- I have to
4 say, it's one of the hardest things I've ever had to
5 deal with in my entire life.

6 And if these testimonials are taken seriously,
7 then I think everyone here would hope to see some
8 change. And not just talking about it, but doing
9 something about it. I think it's high time that they
10 do something about it, if they want actual change to
11 happen. If he was sitting here, right now, I could
12 sit with him and tell him exactly what's going on
13 there. And they're supposed to say, "Okay, this is
14 what we're going to do. Now, this is what we're
15 going to change because we want these people's lives
16 to be better." It's not just housing, as everyone
17 said. It's a comprehensive strategy that needs to be
18 used and maintained. And so far, so far, that hasn't
19 happened.

20 I would love to be able to speak to the Mayor and
21 speak to the Governor in person, and have the kind of
22 conversation that we're having right now. That's it.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you, Richard. And I'd
24 like to have-- well, on a separate note, I'd like to
25 talk to you separately about your situation. But it
just seems like also, there's an opportunity here as

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 315

3 well, because there are so many great community
4 partners that hopefully we'll be able to connect you
5 with, that are right here in this room, not to put
6 you on the spot. But you know, so to really get down
7 to the to the root of it. And to see-- I mean, I
8 know, it's just one example, but your case, I think,
9 highlights a lot of the-- the issues that we need to
10 work on and dissect. And so I just want to thank you
11 so much for being here and taking the time to just
12 testify, and for waiting until now to share your
13 story. So I really appreciate that. And I just want
14 to say thank you.

15 And then just to the other folks who are on the
16 panel, something that you have brought up Jason was--
17 and this is a question for anyone, actually. But one
18 of the feedbacks that we-- we would hear all the time
19 from THRIVE, the previous version, was the mental
20 health first aid training was one of the things that
21 did seem to work well.

22 And I know that for us also, when I was at my
23 CBO, we actually reached out to our faith-based
24 leaders in a lot of the immigrant communities that
25 were first gen that typically would -- me growing up
in the church, right? -- they would typically say

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 316

3 things like, "Oh, you just have to pray harder," or
4 pray it away, right? And I was actually, to my
5 surprise, pleasantly surprised, because they were
6 almost like craving and hungering for that type of
7 training. Because I think they knew and understood
8 and realized that, you know, there is a difference,
9 for example, between spiritual and mental health
10 issues.

11 And I think, you know, not just the faith based
12 communities, but other communities, like you're
13 saying, in your community garden and other folks that
14 are around, you know, is that-- you know, and we
15 actually offered it and translated it ourselves
16 because there was no one to translate it for us. And
17 so we did this whole train-the-trainer model, and I'm
18 just wondering if-- if that is an effective type of
19 training that you think we should also implement, not
20 just within the city agencies, and amongst the staff
21 for example, but-- but also something that can be
22 offered to any community member that's interested in
23 it. So I just wanted to get your thoughts on that
24 real quick.

25 MS. LOWENKRON: Hi. I have some thoughts on
training. And I think it allows me to talk just a

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 317

2 little bit about the B-HEARD program, which I think
3 has gotten a really good sell job, that it perhaps
4 doesn't really deserve.

5 And one of the concerns -- just one of the many
6 concerns -- is its failure to appropriately train or
7 in any event, to let us know how any of that training
8 has happened. It's very similar to what we're
9 hearing with the Mayor's proposal, or better said
10 policy, since it's in place, that there's training
11 going on. And today we just heard, "Well, yeah,
12 there's this video." There's not a whole lot of
13 information about it.

14 And so having said that, and to respond to your
15 question, I think the answer is that you absolutely
16 have to make sure that you're doing training that is
17 culturally sensitive, and you have to make sure that
18 you are involving people who have lived experience in
19 doing the training. You have to have a review of the
20 training. How's that training going? I was I could
21 barely hold myself back from screaming, when we were
22 told about the CCIT training that someone had seven
23 years ago. Well, who's going to remember that? So
24 another important part is that, you know, repeated.

25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 318

3 Exactly, yeah. So I think those are some of the
4 hallmarks. I hope that's what you were asking.

5 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No. No, it is. And also, just
6 to reframe the question a little bit and feel free
7 like, any of you, if there is an example of one that
8 you would recommend?

9 MR. BOWEN: Yeah, so, um, well, I actually wanted
10 to talk about two things. One is kind of a direct
11 response to your question. One is just on the piece
12 about police training in general, the CIT training.

13 You know, I think it just it gets tiring to hear
14 the conversations about police training over and over
15 again, after a while. I think-- I mean, we can look
16 straight to what has already happened. And we can
17 look to Minneapolis. Minneapolis in 2015, they were
18 granted a \$4.5-- almost \$5 million grant, to invest
19 in police reform, to invest in crisis intervention
20 training. And yet, we still saw a video of eight
21 minutes of kneeling on George Floyd's neck after you
22 know, years of crisis intervention training. And I
23 know this is not to the question you're asking.

24 But continuing to give resources to a system that
25 is broken, the policing system was never meant to
heal us. It was never meant to take care of us. It

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 319

3 was meant to, as you know, Ruth was talking about, it
4 was meant to create public order, it was meant to
5 exclude certain people from that idea of order. You
6 know, giving more money to that system to eventually,
7 you know, train itself to do it something better.

8 You know, as someone who works in mental health,
9 I crave trainings, I desire to learn more, because I
10 actually see, you know, people-- people in healing,
11 people in struggle, people in growth as people, and I
12 desire love to learn more. I love to learn ways to
13 sit with them, and to be human and to be whole with
14 them. And if it's an exhausting thing for someone to
15 sit down for a 30 minute training, then, you know,
16 maybe don't want their help in the first place.

17 And then just in terms of, you know, radical
18 mental health first aid, I can speak for myself a
19 little bit, and then, you know, offer some other
20 thoughts. For me, you know, I mentioned I'm young.
21 I really became more radicalized more politically
22 aware, more aware of my own experiences, too, as
23 someone who lives with, you know, what is called a
24 serious quote/unquote, mental illness throughout the
25 pandemic. And so for me, I turned to a lot of online
spaces.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 320

3 There's a really wonderful group called Project
4 LETS, which is campus based peer-support collective
5 that has now expanded to not only campus based. They
6 also do research and a lot of anti carceral mental
7 health response, but project LETS is a great group.
8 Cat-911 is also an anti-carceral, community-based,
9 radical mental health response based out of
10 California, and they actually have an abolitionist
11 mental health crisis rapid response, four-day
12 training on YouTube for free. I was able to attend
13 it live, but it's available on YouTube completely
14 free. I've shared it with multiple members of my
15 community before.

16 And you know, I do think that, you know, scaling
17 up models of mental health first aid for our
18 communities is super-duper essential. I just get
19 wary when those things get delegated to, you know,
20 positions like this.

21 You know, I think with the power that the City
22 Council has, we live in not only the richest country,
23 but one of the richest cities in the world, and I get
24 tired of solutions that ask for so little. You know,
25 it makes sense for when we're getting together with,
you know, a few of our community members, and we're

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 321

3 trying our best. You know, we can only get-- you
4 know, maybe we can't get the interpreter, we can't
5 have someone to do things in multiple languages. But
6 when the city with all of its resources is like,
7 "Yeah, we're going to have this one training one
8 time. It's only in one language. No ASL. No, you
9 know, Spanish or Mandarin." It's-- it gets tiring.

10 So, yeah, I think those things are needed, but
11 they need to be accessible for folks of all, you
12 know, communities. You know, there needs to be
13 childcare, et cetera. You know, I think if we're
14 going to invest in those things, we should really
15 invest in them. You know, dream for the world that
16 we want to live in, not continue asking to get by
17 with the bare minimum.

18 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you for that. And yes, I
19 was referring more to the, like the peer-led
20 trainings, because I do think that I've seen those
21 become really effective and impactful. So I just--
22 but yes, I hear everything you're saying. So thank
23 you. And I wanted to you wanted to also respond to
24 that.

25 MS. LOWENKRON: I just want to say one quick
thing. And that is that a really good model for the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 322

3 training is what comes out of the CAHOOTS Model that
4 I don't think was mentioned, that has been doing
5 mental health crisis response for over 35 years with
6 incredible success. And it's what the Daniels Law
7 that has just been reintroduced at the state level is
8 based on, and with a tweak that we've have of it,
9 ensuring that it is peer-led, and they have their
10 crisis response teams, about 75% peers.

11 What Daniels Law has is a mandate that there is,
12 on every team up here, but the training from the
13 CAHOOTS program, I think is really important.

14 MS. CHAIT: To piggyback off and that with a
15 CAHOOTS, they responded to 17,700 911 calls in 2021,
16 which was 17% of all of the 911 calls, which dealt
17 with a mental health crisis. Here in New York, we
18 average about 139,100 911 calls that deal with deep
19 emotional distress, just to add to that.

20 MS. LOWENKRON: Yeah. And I hope you're not
21 suggesting by that-- that it's that it's a-- I'm
22 sorry?

23 I mean, yes, it's a smaller city, a smaller
24 model, but it's being adopted in Los Angeles and San
25 Francisco. Denver has a similar model. Albuquerque
is moving towards that. So I mean, yes, we have to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 323

3 scale it up. And CCIT NYC has a proposal. We've
4 talked about it a lot, I'd be happy to talk more
5 about it with you. But we definitely think it can be
6 scaled up, and the sponsors of Daniels Law certainly
7 think it can be scaled up.

8 So I'd love to talk to you more about that. But
9 I just wanted to raise it in this context, as it--
10 for its training, because they do extensive training
11 of all of their workers.

12 MS. NYMAN: So as the peer run training that you
13 also mentioned, I created a 35-hour training on
14 [inaudible] intervention training. And it's all peer
15 run. It is 35 hours, and is able-- I train the
16 community members. I train New York City Parks
17 Department and other people as well, and got
18 certified in it.

19 As for your mental health first aid, I took the
20 mental health first aid training. I really think
21 it's effective. The only issues with it, it's it
22 needs to be-- when you do any training, it has to be
23 geared for a particular audience. So if you're
24 training faith based organization, you have to put in
25 some scripture in there. You know, if you're
training people in the black community, you got to do

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 324

3 this scenario. You're training people from the
4 Jewish community, you got to put a little spice in
5 there too, just to make it relevant to that
6 community, because then they can be able to
7 understand, because it resonates with them. And then
8 it's more applicable. You bring in like real current
9 issues and you know, history or something, current
10 events and a paper, make it relevant. And I think
11 it's effective. Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you all so much. I
13 appreciate you taking extra time.

14 MS. CHAIT: So I just kind of wanted to answer
15 your question on that. One of my thoughts on
16 training with religious leaders. It's something that
17 I get very upset about personally. When-- when I was
18 younger, my mother took my younger brother to talk to
19 our Catholic priest, after he had come out to her as
20 being gay. And he had told my brother that he would
21 burn in hell, and that the only way that he could be
22 saved was if he did not act on his urges. And he
23 told him he could still come to church, but that you
24 know, he might be corrupting the people around us.

25 And that led to his first of many suicide
attempts. And so I think in training, these

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 325

3 religious leaders, we have to be very sensitive, and
4 also make sure that when they're speaking, they're
5 speaking to a wide variety of individuals that may go
6 against their personal beliefs, but not to use those
7 beliefs to pervert religious beliefs and the trust
8 that their congregants have within them.

9 My mother suffers from OCD and depression. And
10 she would seek counsel and advice after she lost my
11 father, from our priest. And so she really thought
12 she was doing the right thing in reaching out and
13 talking, and she never imagined that that would
14 happen.

15 I do also want to talk about a program that I
16 know of that is not faith-based that addresses
17 individuals with substance use disorders and co-
18 occurring disorders. We have around 1.4 million New
19 Yorkers that have a co-occurring disorder, which is
20 around 7% of New Yorkers. Only around 10% of those
21 individuals actually seek out and receive treatment
22 for that. It can be for a multitude of different
23 reasons, some people just don't really click with AA.
24 Some people just want to try to medicate with
25 substances for their mental health issues. And I
26 have found that programs like Smart Recovery For The

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 326
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 Individual is something that is very helpful in
4 giving you task-based things to do, instead of basing
5 it on scripture. Which for some people that can feel
6 more productive, because then you're taking these
7 productive steps, you're learning these tools, you're
8 not always having to go to a meeting and being like,
9 "Yes, I'm an addict. I've been in recovery for X
10 amount of time." You're owning your recovery, and
11 you can come to these meetings, or you could stop
12 going after you feel that you have properly learned
13 in immerse yourself within the toolkit.

14 So yeah, that's my thoughts on that. And there's
15 also the craft method of recovery for families, for
16 friends, for peers to learn so that they could learn
17 how to cope with their loved one who may be suffering
18 from a substance use disorder or co-occurring
19 disorder.

20 And just in general, I think that we should be
21 offering more awareness on Narcan and fentanyl
22 testing strips. These different things that may not
23 seem to directly correlate with mental health. But
24 it really does, because most people who are using
25 substances they're doing so I'd be a place of
26 profound pain. Yes, thank you.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 327

2 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you.

3 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you to this panel. We
4 will now move to remote testimony. For remote
5 panels, I will be calling out groups of names. So
6 maybe about three or four names at a time so you can
7 prepare to testify. As a reminder, once your name is
8 called a member of our staff will unmute you, so
9 please accept the prompt before speaking.

10 Our first remote panel will be Jeremy Kidd,
11 Sandra Gresl, and Deborah Berkman.

12 Jeremy, you may begin when ready. Thank you.

13 DR. KIDD: Good afternoon. My name is Dr. Jeremy
14 Kidd. I'm an Addiction Psychiatrist at Columbia
15 University, public sector outpatient psychiatrist in
16 Washington Heights and Inwood. And I'm speaking to
17 you today as President of the New York County
18 Psychiatric Society, an organization representing
19 over 1600 psychiatrists in New York City.

20 Our members work in a variety of settings,
21 outpatient clinics, inpatient hospitals, emergency
22 departments, jails, prisons, and homeless shelters.

23 I want to echo some of the points that have
24 already been brought up today, but also to highlight
25 what someone said earlier that I am profoundly

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 328
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 impressed at the number of organizations and
4 individuals that have come out today to speak against
5 this policy. And it makes me wonder who that Mayor's
6 Office consulted before implementing this policy,
7 because it certainly hasn't been any of our members
8 that I've spoken with.

9 We at NYCPS wish to voice our concern about the
10 Mayor's directive. While we agree with the Mayor
11 that housing and mental health crises in our city
12 require immediate action. We believe that this
13 directive inappropriately over-relies on the NYPD and
14 does not adequately address the root causes of
15 homelessness or untreated mental illness.

16 We hope that City Council will provide oversight
17 in three areas. First, New York State law already
18 dictates that people can be admitted involuntarily to
19 hospitals if they have a diagnosable mental illness,
20 and are at risk of harming themselves or others due
21 to that illness. However, when poverty and
22 homelessness are the primary contributors to
23 someone's inability to care for themselves,
24 psychiatric hospitalization is not clinically
25 warranted. And City Council can provide oversight to
ensure that due process and civil rights are

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 329
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 protected during the implementation of this
4 initiative.

5 Secondly, inpatient bed capacity as you've
6 already heard in New York City is severely limited.
7 Our members working in emergency departments report
8 that patients who need psychiatric hospitalization
9 frequently wait hours or even days for a bed to
10 become available, and City Council can help us track
11 the impact of the Mayor's directive on emergency
12 departments.

13 I was also pleased to hear some of my psychiatry
14 and emergency medicine colleagues sharing information
15 about what's actually happening on the ground, as
16 opposed to the idealized version of discharge
17 planning and inpatient hospitalization prevented by
18 some of the Administration officials earlier.
19 Unhoused people with mental illness need stable
20 affordable housing and a housing-first model, access
21 to community based mental health care. Involuntary
22 removal, emergency detention, and involuntary
23 hospitalization provide none of these.

24 The pre-pandemic shortage of psychiatrists has
25 only gotten worse. With many outpatient treatment
programs unable to fill vacancies. City Council

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 330

3 oversight can determine whether the Mayor's directive
4 results in people gaining access to housing and
5 outpatient care. We do not believe that it has.

6 Earlier someone mentioned intensive mobile
7 treatment assist programs like the ACT system. And
8 that's a wonderful--

9 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Time expired.

10 CHAIRPERSON LEE: : No, I was just going to say
11 take a couple of minutes to close out. I mean, a
12 couple sentences sorry. Thank you.

13 DR. KIDD: So in summary, the New York County
14 Psychiatric Society asks City Council to ensure that
15 the Mayor's directive does not impede on the civil
16 rights of unhoused individuals with mental illness,
17 and to monitor the impact of this directive on
18 already-crowded emergency rooms, and overtaxed
19 outpatient mental health services.

20 We're happy to be a resource to the council in
21 the Mayor during this process. Thank you for your
22 time and attention to this important matter.

23 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much for joining
24 and staying on remotely.

25 COUNSEL SUCHER: Sandra Gresl, you may begin when
ready.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 331

3 MS. GRESL: Thank you. Good afternoon, and thank
4 you to the joint committees and everyone
5 participating in today's hearing. I appreciate your
6 patience and endurance. My name is Sandra Gresl.
7 I'm testifying today on behalf of the New York City
8 Bar Association, where I currently serve as Co-Chair
9 of the Social Welfare Law Committee. My testimony is
10 also informed by my experiences as a senior staff
11 attorney in the Mental Health Law Project at
12 Mobilization for Justice.

13 The New York City Bar Association has submitted
14 written testimony that outlines in greater detail our
15 primary legal and policy concerns regarding the
16 Mayor's new directive. The testimony reflects the
17 expertise and insights of the Social Welfare Law
18 Committee jointly with the Civil Bars Civil Rights
19 Committee, Disability Law Committee, Mental Health
20 Law Committee, and the New York City Affairs
21 Committee.

22 First and foremost, I'm here today seeking the
23 Council's support to secure a commitment from the
24 Administration to halt its rushed implementation of
25 the involuntary removal directive, and instead to
take the time needed to meaningfully address the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 332

3 serious concerns raised in response to this directive
4 by individuals with lived experience of mental
5 illness and or homelessness, and the larger medical,
6 legal, and service provider communities.

7 I'll just briefly outline the City Bar's three
8 primary areas of concern with this directive.

9 Firstly, as has been mentioned earlier, the
10 directive allows involuntary removals for reasons
11 that fall outside the scope of what is permitted by
12 our state and federal constitution and related state
13 mental health laws, and I'm referencing the expanded
14 basic needs standard here.

15 Earlier, we had one city agency representative
16 who said she was not prepared to comment on the legal
17 reasoning underpinning that standard. And another
18 city agency representative who stated that court
19 counsel reviewed the directive but didn't offer any
20 additional information or context as to their
21 interpretation.

22 The Bar's said second concern is that the
23 directive is at odds with the city's obligations
24 under federal, state and city anti discrimination law
25 and at least two distinct ways. Firstly, involuntary
removals could deny people access to public spaces

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 333

3 such as the subway and the streets based on their
4 mental illness, or the perception of it, and a much
5 broader set of circumstances than is allowable under
6 the Americans with Disabilities Act, and without any
7 provision for a reasonable accommodation.

8 Second, the initiatives focus on hospitalization,
9 and the absence of adequate and appropriate community
10 based services is inconsistent with both federal law
11 and aligned state commitments to ensure the
12 availability of treatment options.

13 Our written testimony details the City Bar's
14 perspective on each of these points. Further, we
15 invite the city to use us as a resource and would
16 welcome the opportunity to meet with the Council and
17 city attorneys to discuss these issues further.

18 Thank you so much.

19 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much, Sandra.

20 COUNSEL SUCHER: Next, Deborah Bergman. You may
21 begin when ready.

22 MS. BERKMAN: Chairs, Councilmembers, and staff.
23 Good afternoon and thank you for the opportunity to
24 speak to you today and thank you for you know,
25 hanging in there for so long and waiting for our
26 testimony. My name is Deborah Berkman, and I'm the

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 334

2 Supervising Attorney of the Shelter Advocacy
3 Initiative at the New York Legal Assistance Group.

4 I've worked with numerous people experiencing
5 street homelessness, who live in fear of being
6 incarcerated because they are impoverished, and I've
7 represented several individuals who have been
8 subjected to involuntary removal. The mayor's
9 current initiative criminalizes poverty and twists
10 the standards of the Mental Hygiene Laws.

11 Additionally, it won't be effective at mitigating
12 street homelessness. Mental Hygiene Law Section 941
13 authorizes removal if a person appears to be mentally
14 ill and is conducting himself in a manner which is
15 likely to result in serious harm to himself or
16 others. But the law specifically states that
17 examples of likelihood to result in serious harm or
18 threats of or attempted suicide, or homicidal or
19 other violent behavior. These examples refer the
20 spoken threats of physical harm.

21 The city's published guidelines. On this
22 section, twist the definition of likely to result in
23 serious harm to himself or others to mean a person
24 who appears to be mentally ill and displays an
25

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 335

3 inability to meet basic living needs, even when no
4 recent dangerous act has been observed.

5 The city's guidance goes on to state that if a
6 person appears to have mental illness and can't
7 support their basic human needs, to an extent that
8 causes them harm, they may be moved for evaluation.

9 That's a gross misreading of the words of the Mental
10 Hygiene Law. Even more egregious in the NYPD's
11 communication to its officers about this directive it
12 uses as an example of someone appropriate for
13 involuntary removal to be someone who appears
14 mentally ill, and is not able to seek out food,
15 shelter, and other things needed for survival.

16 This is nothing short of a declaration that
17 extreme poverty constitutes grounds for involuntary
18 removal, and Mental Hygiene Law Section 941 makes no
19 mention of poverty being a factor to consider when
20 determining whether involuntary removal is
21 appropriate. Sleeping outside is not evidence of
22 mental illness. It's a function of lack of resources
23 and a fear of congregate shelter. In fact, the
24 majority of my clients experiencing street
25 homelessness have tried to stay in DHS congregate
single adult shelters, and haven't been able to

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 336

3 remain there due to assault and trauma they endured
4 while they were there. Quite simply, they are too
5 scared to go back.

6 Ordering the hospitalization of people deemed to
7 mentally ill to care for themselves, even if they do
8 not pose a threat is not only cruel and inhumane, but
9 will also undoubtedly be ineffective at helping
10 people transition to inside.

11 I have two clients who had been removed, and
12 neither left their sleeping spots permanently.

13 My first client Mr. V was escorted by an
14 ambulance purportedly because he needed help. On the
15 ride to the hospital Mr. V conversed with the EMTs
16 and once the ambulance reached the hospital, the
17 impatient EMTs released him before he even made it
18 into assessment, presumably because they believed he
19 was not a danger to himself or others. He then
20 returned to his usual sleeping spot.

21 My other client was admitted to the hospital for
22 two days after involuntary move removal but
23 immediately returned to his old sleeping spot. In
24 order to truly mitigate street homelessness, the City
25 must create low barrier shelters with small rooms
that are more accessible. Most of my clients who are

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 337

3 experiencing street homelessness would and do come
4 inside when offered such placements. Thank you for
5 the opportunity to speak.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much Deborah, and
7 for the work that NYLAG is doing. Appreciate it.

8 COUNSEL SUCHER: Next we'll hear from -- I'll go
9 through the names: Lauren Galloway from the
10 Coalition for Homeless Youth, and then Carolyn
11 Strudwick from Safe Horizon, and then Erick Eiting,
12 and then Sam Cukoscka.

13 Lauren Galloway, you may begin when ready.

14 MS. GALLOWAY: Well, good evening. My name is
15 Lauren Galloway, she/they, and I'm the Advocacy
16 Coordinator at the Coalition for Homeless Youth. CHY
17 has advocated for the needs of runaway and homeless
18 youth, known as RHY, in New York State for almost 45
19 years.

20 Thank you to Chair Lee and the rest of the
21 Committee for holding today's hearing on the mental
22 health involuntary removal, and Mayor Adams' recently
23 announced plan.

24 I'll be submitting longer written testimony to
25 address the mental needs of homeless youth and young
adults, but like many nonprofits and other sectors,

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 338
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 runaway and homeless youth, RHY, providers and the
4 majority of whom are funded by DYCD, echo the
5 concerns raised by many legal service organizations
6 that the city's broad language and the NYC removals
7 directly would allow removals that are unjustified
8 under the US Constitution and state mental health
9 law.

10 The city's language announcing this initiative
11 both reflects and will exacerbate biases against
12 unhoused young people and young people with Serious
13 Mental Illness in violation of the anti
14 discrimination principles, and the NYC removals
15 directives will disproportionately affect people of
16 color.

17 This initiative directs resources into a failed
18 strategy at a time when the city has reduced
19 investments and effective strategies that connect
20 people to long-term treatment and care, and this plan
21 fails to address what the Mayor is proposing
22 regarding youth specifically. CFY has no comments
23 regarding the legislation being discussed. We would
24 like to briefly outline some concerns and
25 recommendations regarding youth and young adults that
will be impacted by the Mayor's plan.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 339

3 First recommendation: There are currently no
4 mental health shelters, and currently DYCD RHY
5 programs are not funded to provide this level of
6 clinical services that many youth need. Therefore
7 funding for mental services at RHY shelters needs to
8 be prioritized.

9 Second, RHY providers encounter barriers when
10 referring youth to supportive housing, or inpatient
11 clinical services. The city must improve its
12 coordination through the CAP system to ensure that
13 youth regarding long-term and permanent housing that
14 supports mental health needs to improve.

15 Third, there needs to be a clear policy regarding
16 what training is responding to the entities that are
17 providing services to RHY. I'm talking about NYPD,
18 FDNY, and EMS.

19 Fourth, there needs to be a coordinated discharge
20 plan between DYCD providers and the hospital. And
21 lastly, there needs to be a plan regarding how minors
22 will be treated under, this plan specifically those
23 that are involuntarily committed and could be
24 negatively impacted if communication and discharge
25 from psychiatric services are linked to returning to
unsafe home environments that they are like

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 340

2 previously led. This plan must account for youth
3 that are not served through ACS. I'm here if you
4 have any questions, and thank you and I look forward
5 to our continued partnership.

6 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much. Just one
7 quick question. You said you guys receive funding
8 from DYCD. Is that correct?

9 MS. GALLOWAY: Well, we're the Coalition for
10 Homeless Youth, so we have over 65 providers, 29
11 right here in the city, and those are all funded
12 through DYCD.

13 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Got it. Thank you.

14 MS. GALLOWAY: Yeah, of course.

15 CHAIRPERSON LEE: And thank you so much for the
16 work you're doing, because the youth piece is
17 something we don't talk enough about. So thank you

18 MS. GALLOWAY: Completely agree, Councilmember
19 Lee. Thank you also for sticking around. I
20 appreciate you.

21 COUNSEL SUCHER: Thank you. Next we'll hear from
22 Carolyn Strudwick from Safe Horizon. You may begin
23 when ready.

24 MS. STRUDWICK: Good afternoon, and thank you for
25 the opportunity to provide this testimony. My name

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 341

3 is Carolyn Strudwick. I'm the Associate Vice
4 President for Street Work Project, the homeless youth
5 program at Safe Horizon. And my colleague Lauren and
6 others touched on many pieces, so I won't be
7 repetitive, thank you.

8 But what I want to highlight is why the
9 Administration's plan directs resources in a failed
10 strategy for youth, is that the Administration is
11 approaching this homeless crisis with the mindset
12 that unhoused youth are refusing support, rather than
13 seeing an understanding that our current systems are
14 vastly inadequate.

15 What we have is structural violence unattended.
16 What we're dealing with is systemic racism. And the
17 majority of homeless youth are obviously,
18 disproportionately youth of color. Our system
19 already to view RHY suspiciously, and that young
20 people of color are actually a proxy for criminality.
21 And what the thing is that what we have been facing
22 as providers is unnecessary obstacles in terms of
23 getting adequate housing, supportive and permanent
24 housing for young people on the streets. And most
25 importantly, what we have a major concern with is the
Administration plan to use police officers to engage

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 342

3 with youth of color. Too many of our clients for
4 NYPD does not represent a safe response. RHY people
5 have been violated, from when they've been young.
6 They have witnessed trauma and abuse in their own
7 neighborhoods at the hands of police. And the bottom
8 line is that we fear that interaction between police
9 officers and young people would only lead to an
10 increased violence and death. We have experienced
11 this firsthand at Street Work Project, where we lost
12 our client, David Felix, an unarmed young man who was
13 running from the police, and was murdered by NYPD.

14 Another incident took place when NYPD entered our
15 premises because we were forced to call 911. They
16 came in riot gears, pinned the young person down.
17 Staff had to deescalate the situation. We lost that
18 young person to our service because they no longer
19 felt safe to come to our program.

20 The police response is counterproductive to the
21 therapeutic services and support we're trying to give
22 marginalized and already traumatized young people.
23 Safe Horizon does not support police response. And
24 what the Administration needs to do is prioritize
25 resources towards safe, permanent housing, create
structures and communities that give proper mental

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 343

3 health, school and educational opportunities, decent
4 paying jobs, and peers in community centers to help
5 build youth, not over-policing of our environment.

6 We need to learn from the history of our country
7 and understand where racism plays a role. I need the
8 Mayor to understand, and he's a man of color, I know
9 he's police, but we need to understand systemic
10 racism is the issue here, not policing our
11 communities. Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you so much.

13 COUNSEL SUCHER: All right. Next, we're going to
14 call Erick Eiting. You may begin once ready, thank
15 you.

16 DR. EITING: Thank you. My name is Erick Eiting,
17 and I'm President of the New York County Medical
18 Society. In addition, I run a training program for
19 LGBTQ medicine. And I'm also a medical director for
20 an emergency department and a frontline emergency
21 physician. But I'm here speaking on behalf of the
22 New York County Medical Society, not on behalf of my-
23 - it is clear that we're seeing an increase in the
24 number of mental health conditions that we're seeing
25 across the city and across the nation, tThat's both

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 344

3 in new diagnoses, and also in people who are having a
4 worsening and deterioration of existing conditions.

5 The emergency department is a great place for us
6 to be able to address your acute life-threatening
7 conditions. But it is the wrong place to address
8 your chronic issues that don't give-- have limited
9 abilities for us to intervene.

10 When I think of a an analogy, right? It's
11 somebody who's having an acute severe asthma
12 exacerbation, who maybe perhaps needs to be on a
13 ventilator or needs multiple doses of medications in
14 a very short period of time, the emergency department
15 is a great place to be. But somebody who's suffering
16 from severe chronic asthma and doesn't have access to
17 medications, is living in a housing environment that
18 is triggering their asthma to go off, and really
19 isn't helping you to deal with the underlying
20 conditions, the emergency department is not the right
21 place to be.

22 We've had several conversations with elected
23 officials across the city and state and one of the
24 comments that was brought up with somebody suggested
25 that patients would come into the front door of the
emergency department and then 20 minutes later go out

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 345

3 the side door. And I had to say, "I don't know that
4 that's a that's an incorrect analysis for what ends
5 up happening," because we don't have the tools and
6 are really not the right setting to be truly
7 addressing some of the issues that are happening
8 here.

9 I just want to paint a picture of what happens.
10 And I know some previous speakers have brought this
11 up. But you know, it's not uncommon for a patient
12 who involuntary is brought into the emergency
13 department for them to be upset, for them to be
14 agitated. In fact, there are times when we've had to
15 provide sedating medications, because they're so
16 upset about what's going on. And we've even seen
17 healthcare workers get injured, because people had
18 been really disappointed.

19 And I think the biggest and hardest part to see
20 is when patients see health care workers then as part
21 of this failed system that really hasn't helped them
22 address their underlying conditions, and then it
23 becomes that much more difficult, if not impossible
24 to engage these patients. So, so it actually becomes
25 a situation in which can be dangerous.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 346

3 It really is all about making sure that we come
4 up with a model where we can meet patients where
5 they're at. And that starts with the three pronged
6 approach.

7 One is enhancing outreach teams. We want to make
8 sure that we're able to engage our patients, meet
9 them while they're at, understand what their issues
10 are, collect information, truly understand the
11 barriers, and be able to provide patients with those
12 linkages to care that are so important to make sure
13 that --

14 SERGEANT AT ARMS: Thank you. Your time has
15 expired.

16 DR. EITING: So the last thing that I want to
17 bring up as part of the model is mental health urgent
18 cares. This was a model that we used when I worked
19 in Los Angeles County and I think that there's
20 tremendous promise in there.

21 So thank you, everyone for-- for putting this
22 hearing together this has been a long day, but really
23 important and great testimony and we appreciate the
24 opportunity to continue to work with you in the
25 future.

Thank you.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH,
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS 347

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: No, thank you so much, and
4 thanks for bringing up the mental health urgent cares
5 because I don't think that has actually been brought
6 up today, and that's an important point to make. So
7 I just want to thank you for that.

8 COUNSEL SUCHER: Great. I'm going to call some
9 names if you're here either please come up to testify
10 or raise your hand on Zoom. Ramon Leclerc. Simone,
11 Gamble, Cal Hedigan, Ari Kaddish, Kate Sugarman, Amy
12 Doron, Eileen Mayer, Lucena Clark, Christine Henson,
13 Steven Nathaniel Reesie, Kate Whitmore, and Sam
14 Kokoschka. If you're in person or on Zoom, please
15 raise your hand indicate that you're here.

16 Okay. Lastly, if there's anyone present in the
17 room or on Zoom that hasn't had the opportunity to
18 testify yet, please raise your hand.

19 Okay, seeing no one else, I would like to note
20 that written testimony which will be reviewed in full
21 by committee staff -- I can't stress that enough; we
22 do read every single piece of written testimony that
23 is submitted -- maybe submitted up to the record up
24 to 72 hours after the close of this hearing by
25 emailing it to testimony@council.nyc.gov. Chair Lee,
we have concluded public testimony for this hearing.

1 COMMITTEES ON PUBLIC SAFETY, MENTAL HEALTH, 348
2 FIRE AND EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT, AND HOSPITALS

3 CHAIRPERSON LEE: Thank you. And I just want to
4 say again, thank you to everyone who has testified
5 and for sharing your personal stories, lived
6 experiences, and it's been really incredibly amazing
7 hearing everyone's feedback. And so I have my notes,
8 lots of notes, and so we will definitely take it
9 back, and this-- this is something that we will
10 continue as an ongoing conversation.

11 So thank you all to those that are here
12 presently, a few folks, and then also online as well.

13 So thank you, and with that-- how many times do I
14 gavel? Okay, I'm going to gavel out and close it.

15 Thank you.

16 [GAVEL]
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

World Wide Dictation certifies that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings. We further certify that there is no relation to any of the parties to this action by blood or marriage, and that there is interest in the outcome of this matter.



Date 02/13/2023